Crucible influences on leadership: reflections on Northland community leaders "surthrival" experiences

Stephen Grant Hinge

Southern Cross University
CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON LEADERSHIP: REFLECTIONS ON NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ “SURTHRIVAL” EXPERIENCES

Stephen Hinge

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

of

Doctor of Business Administration

Southern Cross University 2013

This thesis is for examination purposes only and may not be consulted or referred to by any other person other than the examiners.
Declaration of Original Authorship

I certify that the work presented in this thesis is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, original, except as acknowledged in the text, and that the material has not been submitted, either in whole or in part, for a degree at this or any other university.

I acknowledge that I have read and understood the University's rules, requirements, procedures and policy relating to my higher degree research award and to my thesis. I certify that I have complied with the rules, requirements, procedures and policy of the University (as they may be from time to time).

I confirm that page headers and footers have been added at the specific request of one of the examiners of this thesis.

Stephen Grant Hinge MBA, Dip(M), PMP®
Doctoral Research Candidate 21574395

Signature: __________________________

Date: 15\textsuperscript{th} June, 2013
Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of Clifford Arthur Hieatt (1930 – 2010). Cliff’s tenacity in overcoming his crucibles developed this writer’s conviction that lessons learnt
from life are experiential lessons for life to ‘Surthrive’ overwhelming obstacles.
Acknowledgements

I am humbled by, and wish to recognise the significant contributions made by the following people for their generous and selfless support during my five and a half year journey to complete this doctoral thesis.

Foremost, I warmly thank my supervisor, Dr Wayne Dreyer from the Manukau Institute of Technology for his acuity, scholarship and patient mentoring of my learning journey. Without Wayne’s careful attention to detail, I am sure this thesis would not have been completed.

I thank my wife Carol for her unwavering love, support, and empathy during my learning journey to complete this thesis. Carol’s steadying influence pointed my compass in the right direction whenever I came to a standstill and reconnected me with the things that really mattered.

I am grateful to Peter Bruce, a fellow Lecturer at NorthTec Polytechnic’s Whangarei campus. Peter led me to Bennis & Thomas’ (2002) work on crucibles and Cammock’s (2007) work on soul in 21st century leadership. The intellectual voltage of Peter’s passion for leadership rekindled my own interest in leadership effectiveness, sufficient to write this thesis about it.

I thank Sandra Bogart, a freelance writer for the Northern Advocate newspaper from Waipu. Sandra’s help with creating Press Releases about my research for Northland newspapers and providing me with the contact details of Northland community leaders helped me to launch my primary research.

I acknowledge the Manukau Institute of Technology Library staff, whose professionalism and support throughout my creation of this thesis never wavered during my doctoral candidature. Their service was appreciated because my remote rural lifestyle compelled me to rely heavily on MIT library’s Distance Services support.

I am grateful to fellow Lecturer Karen de Latour at the Eastern Institute of Technology’s Tairāwhiti campus in Gisborne. Her critique of the penultimate thesis draft helped me to see through the fog of authoring blindness in the finishing stages of my authorship.
I am indebted to the 20 Northland community leaders that I interviewed. I wanted to acknowledge each one here by name, but in respect of our signed ethics agreement I must preserve their anonymity. I am humbled by their breathtaking trust and openness in sharing their personal crucible experiences with me.

Finally, I warmly thank the examiners of this thesis for giving so much of their valuable time, efforts and professional judgement.

Thank you one and all!
Abstract

This thesis examines the influence of crucibles on the development of leadership capability. To do this, it analyses and interprets relevant comments relating to how Northland community leaders’ calling, character and competence developed, through surviving and thriving (Surthriving) overwhelming ordeals in their lives. This thesis did not set out to prove or challenge extant leadership and experiential learning theories or leadership praxis. It simply asked “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence?”

With this end in mind, the writer undertook phenomenological research to interview 20 community leaders living in Northland, a low socio-economic region in New Zealand. Interview data was analysed and interpreted using a mixed research methodology to identify themes of how leadership capability develops through experientially learning from crucibles. Interpretation of these themes produced interesting findings.

First, crucibles usually influenced research respondents’ calling to either serve others or become more self-aware of their own leadership calling in life. Second, crucibles usually influenced respondents’ character to either be the best at whatever they did, or influenced how they behaved in their relationships with people. Third, crucibles usually influenced respondents’ leadership competence to either draw from their own aptitudes and skills, or from external resources to strengthen their leadership competence. Fourth, respondents’ self-awareness and communication with people was the attribute most frequently influenced by crucibles on leadership calling, character, and competence. Fifth, crucibles influenced respondents’ leadership calling, character, or competence and the relationships between these elements in an interdependent manner.

The research showed crucibles triggered significant personal insights that encouraged respondents to perceive their problems more as personal development opportunities than as insurmountable obstacles. The sixth and perhaps most significant finding is that crucibles influenced all respondents’ will to survive their ordeals, whilst some even thrived because of them. The most common crucibles involved family relationships, job and, death which were unpredictably forced upon them.
These themes led the writer to develop the Surthrive concept, which is an experiential learning process that shows how crucibles influence leaders to reflectively think about their calling in life, character, and competence by reflecting on their crucibles. The writer hopes the Surthrive concept will provide an effective approach for developing leadership capability in rapidly changing circumstances and positively benefit society throughout the 21st century and beyond.
Table of Contents

DECLARATION OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP ................................................................. II
DEDICATION .................................................................................................................. III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................... IV
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................... VI
TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................... VIII
LIST OF TABLES ............................................................................................................ XII
LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................... XIII
ABBREVIATIONS ......................................................................................................... XIV

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION ............................................................................... 1
  Crucibles Defined ...................................................................................................... 1
  Research Background .............................................................................................. 2
RESEARCH DESIGN ................................................................................................. 3
  Research Design Model .......................................................................................... 4
  Primary Research Purpose ...................................................................................... 5
  Ontological Position ............................................................................................... 6
  Research Methodology ........................................................................................... 6
RESEARCH CONTEXT ............................................................................................... 7
  Council Community Plan ...................................................................................... 7
  Northland Income .................................................................................................. 9
RESEARCH OUTCOMES ......................................................................................... 9
RESEARCH IMPLICATIONS AND BENEFIT ............................................................ 10
THESIS THEMES ...................................................................................................... 10
  Crucibles ................................................................................................................ 10
  Leadership Capability ............................................................................................ 11
THESIS STRUCTURE ............................................................................................... 11
  Summary ............................................................................................................... 12

CHAPTER TWO: LEADERSHIP ............................................................................... 14
  INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................... 14
  LEADERSHIP DEFINED ....................................................................................... 14
  Summary ............................................................................................................... 18
MAIN DEVELOPMENTS IN LEADERSHIP THEORY ............................................. 18
  Great Man Leadership Theory ............................................................................. 19
  Trait Leadership Theory ....................................................................................... 21
  Behavioural Leadership Theory ......................................................................... 23
  Contingency Leadership Theory ....................................................................... 26
  Fiedler’s Contingency Model ............................................................................. 26
  Normative Leadership Theory .......................................................................... 27
  Situational Leadership Theory ........................................................................... 29
  Path-Goal Leadership Theory ........................................................................... 31
  Transactional Leadership Theory ........................................................................ 32
  Transformational Leadership Theory ................................................................. 34
  Summary ............................................................................................................... 36

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Leads to 2008..
CHAPTER FIVE: PRIMARY RESEARCH RESULTS ........................................110

INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................110

RESEARCH OBJECTIVE ONE: HOW CRUCIBLES INFLUENCED NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS CALLING .........................................................111

Introduction ......................................................................................111
Thematic Results ..............................................................................111
Thematic Context .............................................................................111
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to Serve Others .................................................................112
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Self-awareness ..........................................................115
Summary .........................................................................................118

RESEARCH OBJECTIVE TWO: HOW CRUCIBLES INFLUENCED NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ CHARACTER ..................................................120

Introduction ......................................................................................120
Thematic Results ..............................................................................120
Summary .........................................................................................121
Thematic Context .............................................................................121
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to be their best.................................................................121
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Behaviour in Relationships ........................................124
Summary .........................................................................................126

RESEARCH OBJECTIVE THREE: HOW CRUCIBLES INFLUENCED NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ COMPETENCE ..................................................127

Introduction ......................................................................................127
Thematic Results ..............................................................................127
Summary .........................................................................................128
Thematic Context .............................................................................129
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to draw on their own competence......................................129
How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to draw on external knowledge resources ..................130
Summary .........................................................................................131

RESEARCH THEME INTERPRETATION ..............................................131

Most Highly Influenced Leadership Influences Across Categories ............................................................................132
Most Influenced Leadership Concepts ............................................132
Most Influenced Leadership Category ............................................133
Research theme orientation to leadership style ..................................134
Summary .........................................................................................136

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
List of Tables

TABLE 1. PRIMARY RESEARCH OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS .................................................................................. 5
TABLE 2. TRANSFORMATIVE THEORIES ........................................................................................................... 71
TABLE 3. TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING PHASES ............................................................................................... 72
TABLE 4. LEADERSHIP FORMATIVE EXPERIENCE TYPES .................................................................................. 80
TABLE 5. RESEARCH SAMPLE DEMOGRAPHICS ................................................................................................. 95
TABLE 6. ANECDOTE REFERENCING SCHEMA .................................................................................................. 97
TABLE 7. CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ CALLING .................. 111
TABLE 8. CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ CHARACTER .................. 120
TABLE 9 CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON NORTHLAND COMMUNITY LEADERS’ COMPETENCE .......... 127
TABLE 10. HIGHEST LEADERSHIP INFLUENCE ACROSS CATEGORIES .................................................... 132
TABLE 11. MOST INFLUENCED LEADERSHIP CONCEPT ................................................................................. 133
TABLE 12. MOST INFLUENCED LEADERSHIP CATEGORY ................................................................................. 134
TABLE 13. RESEARCH THEME ORIENTATION TO LEADERSHIP STYLE .................................................... 135
TABLE 14. SUMMARY OF CRUCIBLE INFLUENCE ON LEADERSHIP CATEGORIES ............................... 142
TABLE 15. SUMMARY OF RESEARCH SOFTWARE USED BY THIS WRITER ............................................. 175
TABLE 16. SUMMARY OF CODED LEADERSHIP CONCEPTS ........................................................................ 176
TABLE 17. SUMMARY OF CODED CRUCIBLE CATEGORIES ............................................................................. 179
List of Figures

FIGURE 1. RESEARCH THINKING FRAMEWORK........................................................................... 3
FIGURE 2. RESEARCH DESIGN MODEL .................................................................................. 4
FIGURE 3. ORIENTATIONS TO WORK .................................................................................... 41
FIGURE 4. LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT MODEL ................................................................. 57
FIGURE 5. REFLECTIVE LEARNING MODEL .......................................................................... 66
FIGURE 6. SEE – DO - GET EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING MODEL ........................................ 69
FIGURE 7. KOLB’S EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING CYCLE ....................................................... 75
FIGURE 8. LEWIN’S FEEDBACK PROCESS ............................................................................ 76
FIGURE 9. ADULT LEARNING READINESS ........................................................................... 82
FIGURE 10. RESEARCH THINKING FRAMEWORK ................................................................. 104
FIGURE 11. PSYCHOLOGICAL TRANSITION PHASES ........................................................ 105
FIGURE 12. CRUCIBLE STIMULUS AND RESPONSE SCENARIOS ....................................... 141
FIGURE 13. CRUCIBLE INFLUENCE ON LEADERSHIP CATEGORIES AND CODED LEADERSHIP CONCEPTS .......................................................... 143
FIGURE 14. SURTHRIVE PROCESS ....................................................................................... 144
FIGURE 15. CRUCIBLE INFLUENCE ON LEADERSHIP CATEGORIES AND CODED LEADERSHIP CONCEPTS .......................................................... 147
FIGURE 16. SUMMARY OF CONCEPTS CODED FOR LEADERSHIP CALLING .................. 178
FIGURE 17. SUMMARY OF CRUCIBLE INCIDENTS ................................................................ 189
FIGURE 18. SUMMARY OF CRUCIBLE RESPONSES ............................................................ 190
FIGURE 19. SUMMARY OF CONCEPTS CODED FOR LEADERSHIP CHARACTER ............ 191
FIGURE 20. SUMMARY OF CONCEPTS CODED FOR LEADERSHIP COMPETENCE .......... 192
FIGURE 21. SUMMARY OF CONCEPTS CODED FOR LEADERSHIP CAPABILITY ............... 193
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSS</td>
<td>Critical Social Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLE</td>
<td>Formative Leadership Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HREC</td>
<td>Human Research Ethics Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRINZ</td>
<td>Human Resources Institute of New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>Interpretive Social Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPC</td>
<td>Least Preferred Co-worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBTI</td>
<td>Myers-Briggs Type Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIT</td>
<td>Manukau Institute of Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NASA</td>
<td>National Aeronautics and Space Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIWA</td>
<td>National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRC</td>
<td>Northland Regional Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRO</td>
<td>Primary Research Objective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSS</td>
<td>Positivist Social Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QDA</td>
<td>Qualitative Data Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCU</td>
<td>Southern Cross University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDC</td>
<td>Whangarei District Council</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

This thesis is about how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability. It examines how crucibles experienced by 20 community leaders in Northland, influenced the development of their leadership calling, character, and competence. The findings of this thesis have discovered the experiential learning process of reflecting on what one’s crucibles mean is an effective way to develop leadership capability. This is important because it underpins the writer’s interest in determining how crucibles influence leaders to experientially learn from crucibles to develop their leadership capability.

Crucibles Defined

In essence, this thesis is about crucibles, which Thomas (2008, p. 5) define as:

In medieval times it was the vessel in which alchemists tried to turn base metals into gold. In a leadership context then, we can think of a crucible as a transformative experience from which a person extracts his or her “gold”: a new or an altered sense of identity. A crucible is not the same as a life stage or transition, like moving from adolescence to adulthood or from midlife to retirement. Life stages can be stressful, even tumultuous’ but, unlike crucibles, they tend to be gradual, reasonably predictable, and patterned. Crucibles are more like trials or tests that force them to answer questions about who they are and what is important to them.

In context with the primary research purpose of this thesis, the writer interprets Thomas’ (2008) definition to mean crucibles influence leaders to reflect on their experiences and interpret them to learn what is most important to them. Furthermore, the research findings of this thesis will show that through reflecting on what their crucibles mean, leaders can effectively develop their leadership calling, character, and competence.

1Italicised by this writer for emphasis
Chapter One: Introduction

Research Background

The genesis of this thesis stems from the writer’s early fascination with stories about how early explorers survived their crucibles to achieve their vision. This interest was triggered by his earliest personal experience of crucibles while sailing on the Sail Training Vessel ‘Spirit of Adventure’ at the age of 17.

The voyage forced him to experience crucibles in team-building situations that challenged him beyond his meagre leadership capabilities. For instance, his most challenging crucibles were navigating the vessel at night, changing sails high above a heaving deck in inclement weather conditions and living in a confined space with 30 people.

The writer’s reflection of his crucible experiences at sea soon developed a fascination with stories of how crucibles challenged Sir Ernest Shackleton’s leadership during his Imperial Trans-Antarctic Expedition from 1914 to 1917. This story led him to discover similarities with Astronaut James Lovell’s leadership, who survived the crucible of his Command Module’s oxygen cylinders exploding 200,000 miles away from earth during Apollo 13’s mission to the moon in 1970.

Also, this writer recently encountered crucibles stemming from several of his Line Manager’s awkward communication style and lack of leadership vision in several Northland organisations that he worked for. He terms this crucible a ‘leadership vacuum of ineffectiveness’, which forced him to cope with dysfunctional relationships between his peers, subordinates and Line Managers.

The writer believes these experiences stemmed from a combination of his line manager’s low self esteem, low self-awareness about their leadership calling, character, or competence, and difficulty communicating effectively with people. The writer believes these factors were responsible for triggering low levels of trust between line managers and their staff. The accumulation of these factors constrained their organisation’s financial performance, triggered high staff turnover, and hindered this writer’s ability to complete his work projects on time and within budget.

On reflection, this writer believes the ‘leadership vacuum of ineffectiveness’ could perhaps have been avoided if his line managers had been more self-aware about their leadership calling, character and competence, clearly communicated their leadership vision, or
understood the principles of effective leadership. Overall, the accumulation of everything discussed in this section led the writer to develop the research argument that *crucibles trigger the experiential learning process of reflective thinking through emotional transitions which develop leadership capability*\(^2\). The next section describes the research design elements that underpin this thesis.

**Research Design**

Reflecting on the issues described in the previous section led this writer to develop a conceptual Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1) to make sense of the ‘leadership vacuum of ineffectiveness’ phenomena described on the previous page.

**Figure 1. Research Thinking Framework**

![Research Thinking Framework](image)

*Source: Developed for this research by the writer*

The Research Thinking Framework is underpinned by the premise that Leadership Capability (B) develops through an Experiential Learning process (A) that involves crucibles (C) stimulating reflective thinking (D) and triggers Emotional Transition phases (ET) (Figure 10, p. 104). This interplay develops Leadership Capability (B) by stimulating synergy via interdependent relationships that exist between Leadership Calling (E), Leadership Character (F), and Leadership Competence (G). This will be described later in the Research Genesis section (p. 101).

---

\(^2\) Italicised by this writer for emphasis

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
Chapter One: Introduction

Research Design Model

The Research Thinking Framework is important because it led this writer to develop a Research Design Model (Figure 2) to conceptually structure the primary research approach in a top-down manner. Figure 2 shows this starts with the abstract concept that crucibles influence Northland community leaders (A). This scopes the primary research purpose (B), the primary research questions (C), three primary research objectives (D) and six primary research questions (E). The six questions were asked of 20 Northland community leaders who worked for commercial and non-commercial organisations (F). Themes emerged from the writer’s interviews with the leaders which produced data and incontestable facts for analysis and interpretation (G) to answer the primary research question (C). These provided options for future research (H) to extend the findings gained by this thesis.

Figure 2. Research Design Model

Source: Developed for this research by the writer
**Primary Research Purpose**

As shown in the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4), the Primary Research Topic (A) is about crucibles’ influence on Northland community leaders. This scoped the primary research purpose (B) to examine how crucibles influenced a research sample of 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character and competence. To achieve the primary research purpose (B), a primary research question (C) was designed to ask “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence?” To answer this question, three primary research objectives (D) were created to gather data from interviews with the 20 Northland community leaders about how crucibles influenced their leadership calling, character and competence.

Primary Research Objective One asked “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling?” Primary Research Objective Two asked “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ character?” Primary Research Objective Three asked “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ competence?” Table 1 shows each primary research objective was transformed into two open-ended primary research questions to capture the maximum amount of relevant data from interview respondents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>leadership Concepts</th>
<th>Primary Research Objectives</th>
<th>Interview Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Calling             | 1. To examine how crucible experiences influence Northland community leaders’ calling. (Adapted from Cammock, 2009, p. 45) | 1. How would you describe your leadership calling?  
2. How have crucible experiences developed your leadership calling? |
| Character           | 2. To examine how crucible experiences influence Northland community leaders’ character. (Adapted from Cammock, 2007, pp. 131-135) | 3. How would you describe your leadership character?  
4. How have crucible experiences influenced your leadership characteristics? |
| Competence          | 3. To examine how crucible experiences influence Northland community leaders’ competence. (Adapted from Greenleaf, 1996, pp. 170 - 171) | 5. How would you describe your leadership competence?  
6. How have crucible experiences developed your leadership competence? |

**Source:** Developed for this research by the writer
Ontological Position

This writer’s ontological position underpinning the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) is based on an oxymoron that holds the only predictable influence on people’s lives is constant change. This notion stems from the writer’s experience of the unpredictable and random way that crucibles have shaped his personal life without the logical reason or root cause ever becoming known. This aspect of crucibles intrigues this writer and triggered his interest in researching people’s life stories to understand how crucibles influence leadership calling, character, and competence. This curiosity led the writer’s decision to develop a research methodology based on Hermeneutic Phenomenology principles to research Northland leader’s crucible experiences. To give this research methodology context, this writer quotes Van Manen (1990, pp. 180 – 181), who describes Hermeneutic Phenomenology as a:

... descriptive (phenomenological) methodology because it wants to be attentive to how things appear, it wants to let things speak for themselves; it is an interpretive (hermeneutic) methodology because it claims there are no such things as uninterpreted phenomena. The implied contradiction may be resolved if one acknowledges that the (phenomenological) “facts” of lived experience are always already (hermeneutically) experienced. Moreover, even the “facts” of lived experience need to be captured in language (the human science text) and this is inevitably an interpretive process.

This research concept helped the writer to contextualise the primary research for this thesis based on the phenomenological approach described by Manen (1990). This focused on discerning truths about 20 Northland community leaders’ “lived experience” with their crucibles in interviews with them. The interview data has been analysed and interpreted as purposely designed by the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4).

Research Methodology

Overall, the unique nature of interview data gathered for this thesis led the writer to decide that a mixed research methodology (i.e. qualitative and quantitative analysis) was the optimal approach to achieve the Primary Research Purpose (Item ‘B’, Figure 2, p. 4). This approach has been used by the writer to achieve data reliability through using a variety of software applications to effectively process the interview data (Appendix 1). This approach was influenced by Yin (1994, p. 37) who suggested the best way of achieving data reliability is to:
Chapter One: Introduction

Make as many [research] steps as operational as possible and to conduct research as if someone were always looking over your shoulder … to conduct the research so that an auditor could repeat the procedures and arrive at the same results.

The matter of testing for data reliability will be discussed further in Chapter Four (p. 99). The next section will outline the research context surrounding the primary research undertaken for this thesis.

Research Context

The primary research for this thesis was carried out in the Northland region, which is one of the lowest socio-economic regions in the North Island of Aotearoa, New Zealand. Northland is the environmental context for 20 Northland community leaders who were interviewed by this writer as designed by the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4).

Council Community Plan

To understand the research context, it is pertinent to examine elements of Northland Regional Council’s (NRC) Draft Long Term Council Community Plan 2009 - 2019 (p. 2) for the Northland region. To start with, this important document publicly announced NRC’s commitment to “Provide regional leadership, focused on working towards strategies and action which will make a positive difference to Northland’s communities and people”. NRC also states that Northland’s economic prosperity depends on four key performance indicators (p. 15):

- Economic Opportunities
- Integrated Infrastructure
- Regional leadership
- Environmental Management

The ability to converge economic growth, enhanced infrastructure, democratic leadership and environment protection will decide whether Northland has a prosperous future or continues with poor productivity and a low wage economy.

From a regional economic growth perspective, NRC recognises (p. 15) that:

… initially economic growth will be achieved through advancing Northland’s main sectors which include; agriculture, forestry and fishing, tourism and hospitality, manufacturing, building, retail and distribution and the marine industry. The development of improved infrastructure will pave the way for other sectors to consider investing in Northland. Increased productivity is a critical component for economic growth and in exploring ways of adding value to existing businesses. Consideration will be given to the development of leadership skills and the means of making informed decisions, an increased propensity to take calculated risks, striving for excellence, enhanced capacity and capability in the labour force/skilled labour force and investment in research and development.

3 Italicised by this writer for emphasis

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
This writer believes the most significant theme emerging is in the following statement from NRC about its’ regional governance and ability to achieve its’ strategic vision (p. 15):

“There is recognition that whilst there has been a large amount of work done already by stakeholders, there is a pressing need to provide regional leadership to ensure the regional governance and planning frameworks are supportive and aligned to the agreed vision for Northland’s future.”

These statements highlight NRC’s recognition of the importance of, and need for more effective leadership capability to help stimulate more economic prosperity throughout the Northland region. Furthermore, the achievability of NRC’s ambitious mandate for the Northland region is precarious, given recent low ratings for the effectiveness of collaboration between Northland council leaders to find solutions for Northland regional issues. For instance, NRC’s Draft Long Term Council Community Plan 2009 - 2019 (p. 78) reports the result of research that states:

Thirty three percent of Northlanders thought that collaboration between regional leaders to find the best solutions for their districts was very effective or effective, 53.8% considered collaboration to be ineffective. Far North district had the highest percentage of people who rated the collaboration as ineffective (55.3%) with Whangarei rating 54.3% and Kaipara 47.9%.

This writer believes the survey results indicate most Northland ratepayers in the Far North, Whangarei, and Kaipara regions regard regional council leadership as ineffective. This leads the writer to believe that without more effective regional council leadership, NRC’s strategic vision for Northland’s economic prosperity is unlikely to ever be achieved unless the current situation is changed significantly, and more effective regional council, commercial, and community leadership is applied. Without this, Northland’s regional prosperity will probably continue to languish behind the socio-economic performance of most New Zealand regions until its’ regional leadership capability significantly produces better results.

Finally, this writer believes that everything in an environment is usually linked to other entities within it through stimulus and response relationships. This belief leads him to argue that improvements made to the effectiveness of Northland’s regional leadership capability in council, commercial, and community sectors would potentially stimulate an ongoing process to help transform Northland’s poor economic performance into more sustainable economic growth over the medium to long term.

4 Italicised by this writer for emphasis
5 Source: Northland Community Outcomes Survey, APR Consultants, 2008. (First year survey undertaken 2008)
Chapter One: Introduction

Northland Income

The last New Zealand National Census in 2006 revealed that Northland’s population income lagged significantly behind incomes in most other New Zealand regions, which this writer classifies as a low socio-economic region. For instance, Northland’s per capita income in the $10,001 - $15,000 bracket was five percent higher than the national income average.

In the $100,001 and higher income bracket, Northland’s average income lagged behind the national income average by two percent. The median personal income of Northland’s residents ($20,000) was the third lowest in New Zealand after the West Coast ($20,400) and Gisborne regions ($20,600). This equates to only 86% of the national median income.

Also, the Northland region has the second lowest median household income ($40,200), after the West Coast Region ($37,800) which equates to 78% of the national median household income. Finally, Northland has the highest proportion of its population (25%) with low incomes in New Zealand, compared to the rest of New Zealand (20%). Overall, the combination of poor regional council leadership and low population income impose environmental factors beyond Northland community leaders’ current ability to control or influence. This writer therefore believes these elements constrain their ability to survive their crucibles. The next section will outline the research outcomes to be delivered by this thesis.

Research Outcomes

This thesis will examine how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character and competence amid Northland’s socio-economic and macro environmental context. It will also attempt to discover if opportunities exist for future research to examine the influence of crucibles on leadership and experiential learning praxis. The next section will outline the research implications and benefits that will be delivered by this thesis.
Research Implications and Benefit

The writer has developed a Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) to examine how Northland community leaders’ reflectively think about what their crucibles mean to them and how they developed their leadership calling, character, and competence. The writer envisages the model could be reliably used for future research to further examine how crucibles develop leadership capability.

Thesis Themes

Two main themes emerge in this thesis and underpin the primary research question, asking “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence?” Firstly, the influence of crucibles on leadership capability. Secondly, about 20 Northland community leaders’ leadership calling, character, and competence. Both themes are significant in this thesis because they scope the research purpose of Research Objectives One, Two, and Three to answer the primary research question.

Crucibles

The primary theme underpinning the primary research question is to examine the influence of crucibles on Northland leaders. To give this matter context, crucibles are defined by Bennis and Thomas (2002, p. 4) in a leadership context as “A process of “Meaning-making: [that] both galvanises individuals and gives them their distinctive voice”. Moreover, within the context of this thesis’ research purpose, this writer has developed his own definition for crucibles as “Challenging life experiences that influence people to reflectively think about their identity, which stimulates self-awareness about what is really important to them”. This matter will be explored further in Chapter Three. Furthermore, all discussions about crucibles in this thesis have led the writer to believe crucibles do not influence one leadership style more than any other, or the leadership traits or personality of a given leader. In other words, crucibles’ influence on leadership capability development seems to be ubiquitous.
Chapter One: Introduction

Leadership Capability

Another significant theme underpinning the primary research question (Figure 2, p. 4) is the Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3) which was developed by the writer. This illustrates the conceptual relationship that exists between experiential learning and the development of leadership calling, character, and competence. Based on his crucibles, this writer has developed the notion that each of these leadership entities has an interdependent stimulus and response relationship with each another via Emotional Transitions (Bridges, 2003). This matter will be explained further in Chapter Four.

Thesis Structure

This thesis is comprised of six Chapters whose contents are outlined below.

Chapter One describes the genesis for this primary research, defines what crucibles are, explains the research background, describes the research design and methodology, then briefly outlines Northland’s regional socio-economic context which underpins all other Chapters in this thesis.

Chapters Two and Three will review literature pertaining to leadership in the first instance, and adult experiential learning in the second instance. Chapter Three will examine experiential learning literature, focus on the reflective thinking process that stimulates people to reflect on their crucibles, and how they derive meaning from this.

Chapter Four will discuss the research design, research methodology, and research methods used to answer the primary research question of this thesis.

Chapter Five will interpret and discuss results and themes derived from primary research undertaken by this writer to answer the primary research question.

Chapter Six will conclude the thesis with a summarised interpretation of what the research results and themes mean. It will also propose future primary research to maintain momentum in the generic discipline area.

The Concise Oxford Dictionary (1999) lexicon will be used to clarify meaning of written words with dual meanings in leadership and experiential learning contexts. Where
necessary, these words will be explained in footnotes to clarify this writer’s rationale and avoid misunderstanding. The online Māori Dictionary\(^6\) will be used to translate Māori lexicon into its equivalent meaning in English to preserve the true meaning of discussion.

Furthermore, Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) derived from analysis and interpretation of respondents’ interview transcripts will be cross-referenced to relevant elements of conceptual models in footnotes to substantiate the veracity of findings made.

**Summary**

This Chapter has outlined the rationale of this thesis, which is simply to examine how crucibles experienced by 20 community leaders in Northland influenced the development of their leadership calling, character, and competence. It asks “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence?” and aims to discover opportunities for further research. It does not aim to prove or challenge extant leadership and experiential learning theories or leadership praxis.

Because this thesis is primarily about how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability, the next Chapter will examine leadership literature to identify themes in the main leadership theories.

---

\(^6\) [http://www.maoridictionary.co.nz/](http://www.maoridictionary.co.nz/)
CHAPTER TWO: LEADERSHIP

Introduction

The purpose of this Chapter, which is to examine the leadership literature and identify what is generally understood about the main leadership theories. This will start by defining what leadership is from various sources and will then outline the main developments in leadership theory. The focus will then shift towards describing eight important leadership task themes that emerge from the main leadership theories. This will be followed with discussion about the leadership entities of leadership calling, character, and competence to provide an intellectual context for the primary research findings discussed in Chapter Five. Finally, the influence of crucibles on the leadership entities of leadership calling, character, and competence will be discussed. This will draw on three renowned examples that show how crucibles influenced leadership capability in life-threatening situations.

Leadership Defined

Bennis (1959, p. 259) argues.

Always, it seems, the concept of leadership eludes us or turns up in another form to taunt us again with its slipperiness and complexity. So we have invented an endless proliferation of terms to deal with it ... and still the concept is not sufficiently defined.

For this writer, Bennis’ (1959) statement clearly highlights the complexities of leadership, which the writer believes are not comprehensively defined. Furthermore, this writer believes Bennis’ statement highlights the fact this situation is probably due to the multifaceted nature of leadership. This is supported by Hughes, Ginnett, and Curphy (2006, p. 6) who argue:

Leadership is a complex phenomenon involving the leader, the followers, and the situation. Some leadership researchers have focused on the personality, physical traits, or behaviours of the leader; others have studied the relationships between leaders and followers’ still others have studied how aspects of the situation affect the ways leaders act. Some have extended the latter viewpoint so far as to suggest there is no such thing as leadership’ they argue that organizational successes and failures often get falsely attributed to the leader, but the situation may have a much greater impact on how the organization functions than does any individual, including the leader (Meindl & Ehrlich, 1987).

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences“
Chapter Two: Leadership

What the writer believes is important in this statement is leadership has been researched from a diverse array of individual research perspectives. This view is supported by Yukl (2006, p. 2) who argues that leadership is complicated by researchers who “Usually define leadership according to their individual perspectives and the aspects of the phenomenon of most interest to them”.

The writer suggests this might be due in part to the proliferation of literature accumulated about leadership over time, by many researchers analysing leadership phenomena through their own paradigm and publishing their personal perspectives about their research. This view is supported by several scholars. The first definition is for Authentic Leadership by George (2003, p. 12) who opines:

> Authentic leaders genuinely wish to serve others through their leadership. They are more interested in empowering the people they lead to make a difference than they are in power, money, or prestige for themselves. They are as guided by qualities of the heart, by passion and compassion, as they are by qualities of the mind. Authentic leaders show these five qualities: understanding their purpose, practicing solid values, leading with heart, setting up connected relationships, showing self-discipline.

What is most interesting about George’s perspectives on Authentic Leadership is the oxymoron like notion of leaders serving others rather than controlling them. This theme also resonates with a concept defined by Greenleaf (1996, pp. 1 - 2) as Servant leadership:

> The servant-leader is servant first … it begins with the natural feeling that one wants to serve, to serve first. Then conscious choice brings one to aspire to lead … the difference manifests itself in the care taken by the servant – first to make sure that other people’s highest-priority needs are being served. The best test and the most difficult to manage, is: Do those served grow as persons? Do they, while being served, become healthier, wiser, freer, more autonomous, more likely themselves to become servants? And, what is the effect on the least privileged in society? Will they benefit or, at least, not be further deprived?

The main theme in Greenleaf’s definition is the concept of servant leaders nurturing people’s personal development. Greenleaf (1996, p. 73) also states “The ‘lead’ that a leader has – and I mean the true leader, whose strength is in his personal capacity and not in his power.” The writer interprets this statement to mean a leader’s effectiveness in leading people is linked to the essence of their character and how they consciously or unconsciously use this to lead their followers. Greenleaf (1996, p. 287) also suggests the leadership role is ubiquitous:
Chapter Two: Leadership

Taking the simplest definition of the leader as one who goes ahead to guide the way, a leader, as I will use the term, may be a mother in her home, any person who wields influence, or the head of a vast organization.

What is interesting about Greenleaf’s statement is the inference that leadership is not limited to a small group of gifted individuals. Another interesting perspective on leadership arises from Bennis (1989, pp. 44 - 47) who asserts that “Leaders have nothing but themselves to work with. It is one of the paradoxes of life that good leaders rise to the top in spite of their weakness, while bad leaders rise because of their weakness.” What this writer finds perplexing in Bennis’ quote, is the contradiction that leaders can still exert significant influence over others, despite the extent of their leadership effectiveness. Bennis (1989, p. 44-47) also argues:

What is true for leaders is, for better or for worse, true for each of us: we are our own raw material. Only when we know what we’re made of and what we want to make of it can we begin our lives – and we must do it despite an unwitting conspiracy of people and events against us. As Norman Lear put it, “On one hand, we’re a society that seems to be proud of individuality. On the other hand, we don’t really tolerate real individuality. We want to homogenize it.”

Bennis’ statement lends support to Greenleaf’s (1996) assertion that a leader’s effectiveness in leading people is perhaps best indicated by the essence of their character. This view is consistent with George’s (2003) perspective on leadership authenticity. Another interesting perspective about leadership emerges from Mazany (1995, p. 91) who opines:

There are many ideas on what forms leadership. Perhaps the one thing that is convincing is summed up by the “contingency theory” and asserts that “it all depends”. The proper form of leadership depends on issues such as the nature of the task, the skills and attitudes of the followers (for the lack of a better word), and the qualities of the leader.

Mazany’s perspective infers leadership competence is not just reliant on personal character. It also depends on the nature of the task at hand and recognises the role played by followers in leadership. In the writer’s view this is seldom acknowledged in the literature.

A thought-provoking perspective on leadership stems from Frankl (1959), who was inspired by the work of Schopenhauer (1881) to argue that “[Human] will is the key driver of man’s motivation”. Frankl was later influenced by crucibles he experienced in the Auschwitz concentration camp during World War Two, which the writer believes formed his most well known statement (1959, pp. 86 – 87):

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Chapter Two: Leadership

Everything can be taken from a man but one thing: the last of the human freedoms – to choose one’s attitude in any given set of circumstances, to choose one’s way … in the final analysis it becomes clear that the sort of person the prisoner became was the result of an inner decision and not the result of camp influences alone. Fundamentally, therefore, any man can, even under such circumstances, decide what shall become of him – mentally and spiritually … It is this spiritual freedom – which cannot be taken away – that makes life meaningful and purposeful.

The key point in Frankl’s (1959) statement is the notion that people tend to make decisions based on a deeply felt need to be free to make their own choices in life. From this paradigm, Frankl (1959, p. 120) later developed his well known Logotherapy theory. This theory holds the concept that “Striving to find meaning in one’s life is the primary motivational driving force in man via three different routes: doing a deed, experiencing a value – nature, a work of art, another person, or through suffering.”

This writer believes Frankl’s previous (1959) statement is significant in a leadership context because it recognises that people mainly want to derive meaning from whatever they do. Which perhaps explains how leaders develop their unique leadership character. Moreover, Senge (1992, p. 340) offers a different perspective on the leadership role and comments:

Leaders are designers, stewards and teachers. They are responsible for building organisations where people continually expand their capabilities to understand complexity, clarify vision, and improve shared mental models – that is, they are responsible for learning. Taking this stand is the first leadership act, the start of inspiring (literally “to breathe life into”) the vision of learning organisations. Without this stand, the learning disciplines remain mere collections of tools and techniques – means of solving problems rather than creating something genuinely new.

What is so interesting here about Senge’s perspective on leadership is his assertion that learning and problem solving skills are essential ingredients for leadership effectiveness. Finally, Bridges (2003, p. 101) defines somewhat prescriptively, his belief about how leaders should lead, using the metaphor of a symphony orchestra conductor:

… you have to keep track of the many different instruments, each playing different sequences of notes and each starting or stopping on its own terms. While you keep a sense of the whole piece, you have to shift your attention from one section to another. It is important for you to hold in your mind the overall design of the melody and harmonies, for unless you do that, every little change will sound like a new and unrelated melody that just happens to come along, without any relation to the rest of the music.
This statement is echoed by Christine Nixon, Chief Commissioner of Victoria Police, Australia (Daft, 2009, p. 98) who states:

One of the lessons I learned about ... what you need to do to be successful was to recognise the diversity that exists in a team of people in an organisation. You need to provide an environment where people feel like they can contribute.

For this writer, Bridges highlights the relentless intellectually flowing nature of leadership in an active sense. From a more holistic perspective, Daft (2005, p. 4) posits “Scholars and other writers have offered more than 350 definitions of the term leadership”. Furthermore, two renowned scholars on the subject (Bennis and Nanus 1985) argue that leadership “is one of the most observed and least understood phenomena on earth”. Consequently, this writer believes new leadership principles will continue to emerge and influence societal norms and mores as they have done for centuries.

Overall, this leads the writer to believe trying to define leadership in an all encompassing definition is futile, given the highly complex, situational, and multi-faceted nature of leadership principles per se. In other words, there are too many variables.

Summary

This section has examined the essence of leadership from several perspectives and determined that leadership cannot be satisfactorily described in one all-encompassing definition. However, if this writer were pressed to choose one definition that best defines how leadership should work, his choice would be the metaphor stated by Bridges (2003) that leaders should lead like an orchestra conductor. This is because he believes leadership is “… an influence relationship among leaders and followers who intend real changes and outcomes that reflect their shared purposes” (Rost (1993). The next section will examine the main developments in leadership theory spanning from the early 1900’s to today.

Main Developments in leadership Theory
This section discusses the main developments in leadership theory that arose between the early 1900s and today. To start with, it is instructive to acknowledge the paradox of leadership as stated by Van Maurik (2001, pp. 2-3): “None of the ‘generations’ of leadership are mutually exclusive or time-bound, that each leadership generation has added something to the overall debate on leadership in such a way the debate continues ad infinitum”. For this reader, Van Maurik’s statement neatly frames the leadership paradox that exists for researchers and behavioural scientists alike. Moreover, nobody has been able to satisfy this writer’s need to find one all encompassing definition of what leadership is. One reason for this conundrum is offered by Yukl (2006, p. 441), who argues this could be due to:

The sheer volume of publications, the disparity of approaches, the proliferation of confusing terms, the narrow focus of most research, the preference for simplistic explanations, the high percentage of studies on trivial questions, and the scarcity of studies using strong research methods.

With this conundrum in mind, the writer will next examine six main leadership typologies. These are the Great Man leadership Theory, Trait leadership Theory, Behavioural Leadership Theory, Contingency Theory, Transactional leadership Theory, and Transformational leadership Theory.

**Great Man Leadership Theory**

According to Hughes, Ginnett, and Curphy (2006, p. 158), the roots of the Great Man leadership Theory can be traced back to the early 1900s when many leadership researchers and the popular press of the time argued that leaders and followers were fundamentally different to most people. This stimulated many research studies to examine if certain personality traits, physical qualities, intelligence, or personal values distinguished leaders from their followers.

The Great Man Theory emerged from all this, based on the premise that leaders are born not made and will emerge whenever a great need arises for them. This theory arose from early leadership research based on the study of people who were great leaders at the time. This writer believes this is perhaps due to the predominantly male oriented societal mores.
and norms that prevailed during the 1900s. This could also be due to the fact that most researchers were male then. For example, Sir Ernest Shackleton became a high profile public figure and was adulated for his Antarctic adventures. Consequently his high public profile helped to polarise the general United Kingdom public’s perception of the time, that leaders were people with special qualities distinguishing them from mainstream society.

This writer finds it interesting that Stogdill (1948, pp. 35-71) argued the Great Man Theory had three main flaws. Firstly, leaders are not substantially different from their followers and stereotyping them as being gifted or having special qualities is morally wrong. His point was that followers can be just as smart, outgoing and ambitious as their leaders.

Secondly, Stogdill argued that human characteristics like intelligence, initiative, stress tolerance, responsibility, friendliness, and dominance, are related to leadership effectiveness and that followers are likely to have these characteristics too. Stogdill’s third argument held that people with the former characteristics are likely to be more effective in influencing a group to achieve their goals than people who are less smart, lazy, and impulsive or just do not like giving orders to people per se.

Stogdill’s second argument suggests that although having the “Right stuff” (Bennis, 2008) does not guarantee leadership success; it does provide the potential to significantly influence how a group can achieve its goals successfully. It is interesting that further research about the Great Man Theory by Mann (1959) and Stogdill (1974) arrived at similar conclusions to Stogdill’s (1948) earlier research findings on this subject. Therefore, the writer believes this verifies their research validity and reliability.

Overall, Mann and Stogdill’s research has provided evidence that suggests people having the “Right stuff” (Bennis, 2008) are more likely to be successful leaders. Other researchers have since focused on the premise that leaders are not fundamentally different than their followers and their personal characteristics alone are not a definitive measure for predicting future leadership capability or effectiveness.


Chapter Two: Leadership

**Trait Leadership Theory**

Trait leadership theory evolved from the Great Man Theory of leadership as researchers focused more on identifying traits that distinguished leaders from followers. This leads the writer to ask “So what is a trait in a leadership context?” Hughes, Ginnett, and Curphy (2006, p. 160) argue that traits are:

> Trends in a person’s behaviour; (Hogan, 1991, p. 875) and the trait approach to personality upholds that people behave the way they do because of the strengths of the traits they have. Although traits cannot be seen, they can be inferred from consistent patterns of behaviour and reliably measured by personality inventories.

Ott (1989, p. 24) opines that a leadership trait is a “Personality attribute or a way of interacting with others which is independent of the situation, that is, a characteristic of the person rather than of the situation.” (in Fiedler and Chemers, 1974, p. 22). This writer interprets Ott’s view to mean that a trait is a fundamental characteristic that influences a person’s behaviour. However, Bennis (1989, p. 3) argues:

> Leaders are people, who can express themselves fully; they also know what they want, why they want it, and how to communicate what they want to others, to gain their co-operation and support. And they know how to achieve their goals.

Bennis’ statement suggests a leader’s behavioural traits enable them to explain to their followers what they want or need to be done. Instead of researching talented leaders’ traits, many researchers gradually shifted their focus more towards the leadership traits they believed should exist within a leader. For instance, research by Stogdill (1948) and Mann (1959) tried to identify personality characteristics that distinguished leaders from their followers.

Gardner (1989), who researched many North American business leaders' style, argued that because some leadership traits enable a leader to lead effectively in one situation, this also enables them to lead effectively in others. Some of these traits include physical vitality, stamina, intelligence, willingness to accept responsibility, task competence, and understanding of followers and their needs.

This raises two concerns in the writer’s mind about early research findings on trait theory. Firstly, early researchers often assumed a specific set of traits existed that made a leader

> Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
effective, irrespective of their prevailing situational context. For example, they argued the leadership traits that worked well on a battlefield would also work well in a school classroom (Sadler 1997). This writer also believes some leadership traits may not work due to differing environmental contexts and social mores prevailing in a given situation.

Secondly, the early researchers integrated different leadership qualities. For instance, some of Gardner’s traits highlight aspects of a person’s behaviour whereas others tend to more emphasise their temperament and intellectual acuity. Ott (1989, p. 245) also argues against Trait Theory from several perspectives.

First, trait theory has largely fallen out of favour because reality never matched the theory. Instead, starting in the late 1950’s, it started to become standard practice to view leadership as a relationship, an interaction between individuals. The interaction was called a transaction, so the term transactional leadership became the umbrella label encompassing many theories of leadership of the 1950’s, 1960’s, and 1970’s. Second, the situation strongly influences leadership. As Stogdill (1948) stated, the situation has an active influence in deciding the qualities, characteristics, and skills needed in a leader.

Recent researchers have tended to focus more on what combinations of leadership traits might handle given situations, like the trait of ‘Maleness’ which was researched by Rosener (1997). For instance when Rosener asked men and women about each other’s characteristics and leadership qualities, his research showed that both genders had difficulty perceiving women as leaders, and features associated with leadership were mainly viewed as being male. So, to put trait theory into a more holistic perspective, Ott (1989, p. 245) argues that leadership capability is situational:

Probably the most damaging criticism of the theory is its lack of ability to identify which traits make an effective leader. Even among the traits that have been most commonly cited – intelligence, energy, achievement, dependability, and socioeconomic status – there is a lack of consensus across studies. Leadership involves more than owning certain traits. A leader may be effective in one setting and ineffective in another. It depends on the situation (Fiedler, 1969).

As early Trait leadership theorists ran out of new leadership traits to examine, their research gradually focused more towards analysing what leaders do and researched their behaviour towards their followers. This eventually led to the emergence of Behavioural Leadership Theory.
Chapter Two: Leadership

**Behavioural Leadership Theory**

The Behavioural Leadership Theory was used during World War Two by the American government to develop the leadership capability of their military leaders. The primary focus of Behavioural Leadership Theory is on leadership behaviour rather than leadership personality traits. This theory was underpinned by the belief that leadership behaviour directly affected the capabilities of work groups. It also led researchers to examine patterns of leadership behaviour that were later grouped and defined as leadership styles which enabled leaders to wield greater influence over their followers.

Behavioural Leadership Theory gradually gained prominence from leadership research undertaken by the University of Iowa in the 1930s, the University of Michigan, and Ohio State University during the 1940s. Leadership research by Lewin & Lippitt (1938) at the University of Iowa categorised effective leadership behaviours into three styles. Firstly, the Autocratic leadership style which makes unilateral decisions, dictates work methods, limits follower’s knowledge of goals to the next stage and gives them punitive feedback. Secondly, the Democratic style which involves followers in decision making, lets them discover their work methods, makes overall goals known to them, and uses feedback as an opportunity for helpful coaching. Thirdly, the Laissez-faire style which gives followers great freedom to do whatever they think is right. This leadership style also enables leaders to avoid the need to give them feedback about their performance.

Leadership research led by Likert (1961, 1979) and Bass (1981) built on Tannenbaum and Schmidt’s work that leadership expressing the virtues of a more employee-centred leadership approach were better than a job-centred approach, where leaders build effective work groups dedicated to high performance goals. Likert and Bass’ research showed that with a more job-centred praxis, leaders divide work into routine tasks and closely supervise their followers to ensure specific work methods are undertaken and that quality standards are met more effectively. The writer believes their research highlights the aptness of Ott’s (1989, p. 245) assertion that “A leader may be effective in one setting and ineffective in another depending on the situation (Fiedler, 1969)”.

Research undertaken at the Ohio State University during the 1940s examined leadership behaviours through measuring the behaviours of leaders by tracking factors like group

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
performance and their level of work satisfaction. From the research of Kerr, Schriesheim, Murphy, Stogdill (1974), two leadership styles emerged as being the most significant.

The first leadership style is Initiating Structure, which shows the degree to which a leader defines their own role and the roles of their followers with achieving goals, including the managerial functions of planning, organising, directing and task issues. This style is similar to the University of Michigan’s research which began in the 1950s about the job-centred leadership behavioural style, albeit with a broader focus on task related issues as researched by Taylor (1993).

The second leadership style is Consideration. This leadership style reveals the extent to which a leader builds mutual trust with their followers, respects their ideas, shows concern for their feelings, adopts friendly behaviour, adopts two-way communication and encourages participative decision making with them. This was also examined by Gupta (1995), Jacob (1995a), (1995b), and Jacob (1994a). This style is similar to the University of Michigan’s employee-centred leadership behavioural style that developed in the 1950s to highlight people-related issues, as researched by King (1995) and Kirby (2003).

In the late 1930s Ohio State University researchers noticed the Initiating Structure and Consideration leadership styles tended to be independent behavioural entities that occupied separate continuums in one model. For instance, a leader could be high on both styles, low on both styles, high on one style and low on the other, or be variations of both styles. Their two-dimensional model proposed the notion that leaders could emphasise task issues while producing high follower satisfaction through behaving considerately towards their followers.

Lewin and Lippit’s (1938) research led Tannenbaum and Schmidt (1973) to develop a Leader Behaviours Model which outlined leadership behaviours on a continuum ranging from ‘Boss-Centred’ (Autocratic) at one end to ‘Subordinate-Centred’ (Democratic) at the opposite end. In their model, the Autocratic style categorises a leader or manager who makes decisions without input from their followers and announces their decision. At the other end of the continuum, managers who exercise a Democratic leadership style allow followers to work within the limits they define with a comparatively higher degree of freedom. Tannenbaum and Schmidt (1973) proposed in the short-term, that leader
behaviour should be flexible depending on the situation, and in the long-term behaviour should move toward the democratic end of the continuum. They argue this is because this approach increases employee motivation and improves the quality of decisions, teamwork, morale, and staff development.

Blake and Mouton (1964) defined the effectiveness of leadership behaviour in a two-dimensional model they named the Managerial Grid®. This is based on two main concepts. The first concept is a Concern for People. This is the extent that a leader considers the needs of followers, their interests, and areas of personal development when deciding how best to achieve tasks. The second concept is focused on Production, which is the extent to which a leader emphasises organisational objectives, efficiency and productivity when deciding how best to achieve tasks. In essence, their model mapped a leader’s proclivity for people or task.

Blake and Mouton (1964) argue the most effective leadership behavioural orientation is in what they define as the Team Management quadrant, which characterises a high concern for people on one axis, and high interest in producing results on another. In comparison, the least effective behavioural orientation is placed in an opposite quadrant that is labelled Impoverished Management. This characterises a low concern for people and low interest in production. Blake and Mouton’s Managerial Grid® quickly gained acceptance within the international business community and has become a popular way to measure the effectiveness of leadership behaviour. In support of this statement, Inkson and Kolb (1998, p. 370) uphold this model as “A useful tool for visualising the problems of extreme leader behaviour and offers a view of balanced leadership and management practice.”

Overall, Behavioural Leadership Theory does not define inner leadership traits or capabilities. However, it does offer insightful perspectives on behaviour that is outwardly shown by leaders toward their followers. Therefore, this writer believes that Behavioural Leadership Theory is the antithesis of Trait leadership Theory because it accepts the premise that leadership capability can be learned, instead of a person being born with special leadership traits.
Finally, research by Kerr, Schriesheim, Murphy, Stogdill (1974) and Greene (1979) argued that situational elements like follower expectations and the nature of tasks significantly affected the effectiveness of leadership behaviour. This writer believes these findings underpin Ott’s assertion that “A leader may be effective in one setting and ineffective in another, it just depends on the situation (Fiedler, 1969)”.

**Contingency Leadership Theory**

This section describes Contingency leadership theory which stems from the work of Fiedler (1967), and Fiedler and Garcia (1987), who developed the Contingency Model based on two premises. Firstly, leaders usually vary in their degree of orientation toward tasks and people. Secondly, leaders can be effective in some situations but ineffective in others. These factors are commonly referred to as Contingency leadership Theories because effective leadership traits or behaviours are contingent on the unique situational elements they were developed to control. Because many reasons can influence leadership capability, various leadership theories have evolved to control the situational factors involved. These theories are categorised as Contingency Theory, Normative leadership Theory, Situational leadership Theory, and Path-Goal Theory which will be described next.

**Fiedler’s Contingency Model**

Fiedler’s Contingency model (1976) is based on a leader’s Least Preferred Co-worker (LPC) orientation scale measuring personality traits via 18 sets of behavioural criteria. The model works in such a way that for each set of behavioural criteria, a leader rates their follower on a Likert scale ranging from one to eight points. On this scale, one point represents a low strength and eight points represent a high strength.

Fiedler’s model works on the premise that if a leader rates a follower with a low score on the LPC scale, they are likely to be more task oriented than people oriented. Conversely, if they rate the follower with a high score on the LPC scale they are likely to be more people oriented than task oriented. Rue and Byars (2003) argue a leader’s LPC orientation should match situational factors favouring their prospects for success if it is to work as an
effective measurement tool. Overall, the model classifies three situational factors that affect the degree of effective situational control necessary for a leader to assert their authority. Firstly, Leader-Member relations which is the support a leader gets from their followers. Secondly, Task Structure, which is how clearly a task’s goals, methods and performance standards are specified. Finally, Position Power which is the degree of power an organisation bestows upon its leaders to perform their work effectively.

According to Fiedler and Chemers (1976), and Rebello (1995), Fiedler’s model links situational factors with degrees of favourability that rate these as favourable, moderate, or unfavourable. For instance, the model will reveal in an unfavourable situation whether a leader emphasises the need for task completion, or in a more favourable situation if a leader gets followers to cooperate in doing what is necessary to complete the task or not. In a moderately favourable situation, due to poor leader-follower relations or an unstructured task, a supportive, relationship-oriented leader will emphasise good working relationships or provides support with an unstructured task.

Fiedler’s (1976) theory argues that since leaders cannot easily alter their LPC orientation or style, it is important for them to understand what their innate leadership style is. It is also important that they analyse the degree of favourable control over a situation, so that if the match is poor; they can confidently make effective adjustments. For example, increase task structure or perhaps search for a more effective way to assert over a given situation.

Although Fiedler’s Contingency Model might appear plausible at first glance, this writer believes it does not comprehensively cover all situations due to the unpredictability and randomness of how things happen. In other words, one model is not a comprehensive or reliable panacea for all leadership situations.

**Normative Leadership Theory**

The Normative Leadership Model is also known as Vroom and Jago’s (1988) Participation Contingency Theory. It has been argued this theory arose to help leaders assess situational reasons and discover the extent they should involve subordinates in their decision making. Normative Leadership theory works on the principle that decision making is a fundamentally important role undertaken by leaders.

**Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences**
According to this theory, the effectiveness of decision making largely depends upon many aspects of a situation. For example, the importance of the decision quality and acceptance, relevant information owned by the leader and their followers, the likelihood of followers accepting an autocratic decision or co-operate in trying to make a good decision if allowed to participate, or disagreement among followers about their preferences.

It has been argued that Normative Leadership Theory is similar to Situational leadership Theory because it seems to be based on the premise there is no one perfect way to lead people. In other words, in a leadership sense the approach to achieving an ideal outcome is more influenced by the Law of the Situation (Follett, 1926) which holds that everything is constantly changing. The main difference between them is that Situational Theory tends to focus more on behaviours that a leader should adopt in given circumstances. In contrast, Normative Leadership Theory takes a broader perspective that includes factors about a leader’s capability.

Because Normative Leadership Theory is defined more by rational logic than by observation, it can be argued this theory is most likely to work when there are clear and unanimous opinions about the quality of leadership decision making and decision acceptance by everyone involved in a given situation. This writer is sceptical about the efficacy of this position because it has been his experience that not all reasons for situations are usually fully understood or known with certainty or precision.

Also, the Normative Leadership Model has been created on two assumptions. Firstly, that decision acceptance increases commitment and effectiveness of action. Secondly, that participation increases decision acceptance. This model poses eight basic questions that probe key elements about decision making of problems. In the model, each mode is identified with a prefix letter. For example, A for Autocratic, C for Consultative, G for Group. These are categorised with a number referring to two variants of autocratic and consultative methods: I and II.

These modes become more participative when moving from AI (i.e. decide for yourself) to GI (i.e. let the group decide). To help leaders choose the most suitable leadership style for a given situation, the model presents eight questions using one of two decision trees. Firstly, a Development-Driven tree which is used when follower development is more
important than speed in the decision making process. Secondly, a Time-Driven tree which is used when speed is more important than follower development.

Finally, Normative Leadership Theory offers a useful procedural approach to making leadership decisions but might be inadequate to use for some rapidly changing situations that require quick, intuitive decision making by a leader.

**Situational Leadership Theory**

The earliest recorded proponent of Situational Leadership theory was Mary Parker Follett, who according to Ott (1989, p. 248) in her 1926 article “The Giving of Orders” opined:

> How orders should be given in any organisation: They should be depersonalised “to unite all concerned in a study of the situation, to discover the law of the situation and obey that. Follett thus argues for a participatory leadership style where employees and employers cooperate to assess the situation and decide what should be done at that moment – in that situation. Once the law of the situation is discovered, “the employee can issue it to the employer as well as employer to employee” (Follett, 1989, p. 33).

This writer interprets Follet’s statement to argue that the variable Law of the Situation (Follett 1926) dictates the most optimal leadership responses to a given situation. This tends to create a more fluid working relationship between a leader and their followers. Building on Ott’s statement, Follett (1926, p. 33) explained her Law of the Situation in a leadership context:

> If the situation is never stationary, then the order should never be stationary, so to speak; how to prevent it from being so is our [leadership] problem. The situation is changing while orders are being carried out, because, by and through orders being carried out. How is the order to keep up with the situation? External orders never can, only those drawn fresh from the situation. To summarise, integration being the basic law of life, orders should be the composite conclusion of those who give and those who receive them; more than this, that they should be the integration of the people concerned and the situation; even more than this, that they should be the integration involved in the evolving situation.

Follett’s statement suggests that leaders should carefully examine their circumstances, trust their intuition, and make decisions involving the situation. This suggestion is also echoed by Follett (1926, p. 33) who described her Law of the Situation principles:

---

7 Italicised in original text

**Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences**
If you accept my three statements on this subject: (1) that the order should be the law of the situation; (2) that the situation is always evolving; (3) that orders should involve circular not linear behaviour – then we see that our old conception of orders as somewhat changed, and that there should therefore follow definite changes in business practice.

Ott (1989, p. 248) expresses a similar view to Follett’s (1926) Law of the Situation which argues “This manner of giving orders facilitates better attitudes within an organisation because nobody is necessarily under one person; rather all take their cues from the situation”.

A popular contingency theory widely used lately is the Situational Leadership Theory® developed by Hersey and Blanchard (1988). This is based on the notion that leadership behaviours will change, contingent on follower readiness. Also, this theory is based on two core behaviours that are similar to the ‘Initiating-Structure’ and ‘Consideration’ behaviours identified in research by Ohio State University researchers. The first is ‘Task Behaviour’ which is the extent a leader explains duties and responsibilities of a follower or group of followers. The second is ‘Relationship Behaviour’ which is how a leader uses a duplex (two ways) or multiplex (multiple modes) approach to communicating.

In Hersey and Blanchard’s Situational Leadership model, the nature of these two behaviours helps leaders to decide on the most appropriate leadership behaviour to use for given situations. For example, a leader might assess the extent of ‘Follower Readiness’ based on proved ability, skill, knowledge, and experience for a task or based on the followers’ displayed psychological willingness in areas of confidence, commitment, and motivation to complete a task. For instance, the intensity of ‘Follower Readiness’ and ‘Willingness’ ranges from high to low, and offers four readiness levels. For example, R1 (i.e. low to moderate), R2 (i.e. moderate to high), R3 and R4 (i.e. high). A bell curve positioned in the middle of the model intersects with quadrants that represent ‘Ability’ and ‘Willingness’ to show which approach might be the best to adopt. These approaches offer four choices.

Firstly, ‘Telling’ which gives specific directions about what to do and how to do it. Secondly, ‘Selling’ which is to give specific directions and supporting individual willingness and enthusiasm. Thirdly, ‘Participating’ which is a supportive, participating...
Chapter Two: Leadership

style emphasising duplex communication and collaboration as the most effective style. Finally, ‘Delegating’ which can be used for followers that need little support or direction. Ott (1989, p. 248) offers an insightful perspective on this model with his argument that:

When a work group is not mature enough to assume a task, the leader needs to be high in initiation (task) and low in consideration (relationship) behaviour, in order to help the group understand what is required of them. On the other hand, when a group is mature, the leader should be high in consideration (relationship) and low in initiation (task) behaviour, because the group can complete its task without much guidance. Although the model is conceptually intriguing, a major weakness is its lack of a “systematic measurement device to measure maturity” (Schein, 1980).

Finally, the writer believes from his own experience that the Situational Leadership model seems to work best in commercial programmes and project situations characterised by fast pace and low risk. Furthermore, he has noticed the Situational Leadership model tends to heighten a leader’s awareness about how to effectively adapt their leadership style to their followers, based on how ready, willing and able their followers are to perform the tasks they are required to complete.

**Path-Goal Leadership Theory**

Path–Goal Leadership theory created by House and Mitchell (1974 pp. 81 - 97) explains how leadership behaviour influences follower’s motivation and job satisfaction to achieve work (i.e. performance) and personal goals (i.e. intrinsic and extrinsic rewards) (Wofford and Liska, 1993 pp. 857 - 876). This theory is based on the premise that leaders can vary their behaviour to maximise their capabilities in any given situation. It also categorises leadership behaviour into four behavioural groups. Firstly, ‘Directive’ which provides structure, clear rules, guidelines, and commands for others to follow. Secondly ‘Supportive’ which shows empathy for followers, holds regard for their rights, needs and wants. Thirdly, ‘Participative’ which seeks input from others in the decision making process. Finally, ‘Achievement-oriented’ which sets high goals and objectives for followers and expects them to always perform at their highest level.

Path-Goal Leadership theory is underpinned by Expectancy Motivation theory to discover ways that a leader can achieve work goals easier through three expectancy elements. Firstly, ‘Effort-Performance Expectancy’ which is the likelihood of effort leading to a required performance level. Secondly, ‘Performance Outcome Expectancy’ which is the
likelihood of a successful performance leading to positive outcomes. Finally, ‘Valence’ which is the anticipated value of outcomes. Overall, Path-Goal Theory argues that leadership behaviour that is effective in one given situation may not be as effective in another. Unlike Fiedler’s contingency approach, it assumes that leaders can be flexible and learn to use any of its four leadership behaviours as necessary (Gabor 1994).

**Transactional Leadership Theory**

Transactional Leadership Theory is defined by Inkson and Kolb (1998, p. 375) as “Transactions including communication and the interplay of values, needs, and desires between leaders and followers”. From a historical perspective, Ott (1989, p. 245) opines:

The transactional approaches to leadership had early beginnings in the 1930’s but did not emerge as the dominant view of leadership until the 1950’s. Two primary forces were behind the ascendancy: (1) frustration and disappointment with the trait theories, and (2) dramatic post – World War II advances in the applied behavioural sciences.

Furthermore, Bartol, Tein, Matthews, and Sharma (2008, p. 496) state that Transactional leaders “Motivate subordinates to perform at expected levels by helping them to recognise task responsibilities, identify goals, acquire confidence about meeting desired performance levels, and understand how their needs and the rewards they desire are linked to goal achievement.”

Bass (1998) argues Transactional leadership involves “An exchange process in which the leader rewards or disciplines a follower according to their level of performance”. These definitions lead this writer to believe that Transactional leadership is underpinned by Path-goal leadership theory. Therefore this can be perceived as a leadership paradigm influenced by extrinsic goals and environmental factors. For example, in their renown 1999 New Zealand Leadership Survey, Parry and Proctor (2000, pp. 25 - 26) argued that Transactional leadership “Operates out of own needs and agenda; seeks concrete evidence of success; manipulates others and situations; works on basis of exchange (you do this for me and I’ll do that for you)”.

Furthermore, Parry and Proctor (2000, p. 26) also argue that four core qualities characterise the Transactional leadership style. Firstly, Contingent Reward where the

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
leader and follower agree on what needs to be done and for what reward. Secondly, Management By Exception (active) where the leader actively monitors their followers’ errors, mistakes or any deviation from standards and norms in their approach to resolving them. Thirdly, Management By Exception (passive) where the leader passively waits until problems or mistakes arise then reacts to resolve them. Finally, Laissez-Faire wherein a leader usually shirks their responsibilities by leaving their followers alone to look after themselves.

Parry and Proctor’s (2000) research results intrigue this writer and compel him to ponder “How are these transactional leadership qualities expressed in an organisational cultural context?” Bass and Avolio (1993) argue that “In a transactional leadership culture, individualism is strong and therefore concern for self-interest rather than organisational aims are prime”. Also, Shivers-Blackwell (2004) states: “Transactional leaders exchange rewards based on performance and use positional resources to encourage desired behaviours.”

However, Bass and Avolio (1993) offer an alternative view that “The best of leaders are both Transactional and Transformational, in that Transformational leadership augments transactional leadership”. Also, Parry (1996, p. 165) offers an interesting assertion that “Transactional leadership is a basic competency for managers and the extra value of Transformational leadership makes managers fully effective leaders”. Therefore, both of these statements lead this writer to believe that Transactional and Transformational leadership styles tend to be interdependent and complementary in their orientation. This view is also supported by Bartol et al., (2008, p. 498) who argue that:

Transformational leadership does not replace transactional leadership. It supplements it with an ad-on effect: performance above expectations. The logic is that even the most successful transformational leaders need transactional skills to effectively manage the day-to-day events that form the basis of the broader mission (Hooper 2004).

Moreover, Parry and Proctor (2000, p. 32) posit that:

Although transformational and transactional leadership augment one another, they are also in some ways the opposing ends of a seesaw. To reduce one’s display of transactional leadership, one must automatically increase the display of one’s transformational leadership, while the correct balance between the two will support effective leadership.

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Finally, Ott (1989, p. 250) states “A growing number of leadership theorists recently have moved past the Transactional approaches to write about leadership from an organisational culture perspective, or as it is sometimes called, a symbolic management perspective” (from Shafritz & Ott 1987). All of these statements lead this writer to believe that Transactional Leadership Theory led to the development of Transformational Leadership Theory, which will be discussed next.

**Transformational Leadership Theory**

This section discusses the essence of Transformative Leadership Theory, which Ott (1989, p. 251) argues is:

… theoretically consistent with the organisational culture perspective. Whereas the transactional theories of leadership apply mainly to leadership roles, functions, and behaviour within the existing organisational culture, transformational leadership is about leadership to change a culture.\(^8\)

Ott (1989, p. 251) also draws a distinction between Transactional and Transformational leadership in saying that “Transactional leadership focuses on incremental change: Transformative leadership is about radical change.”

In 1978 James McGregor Burns published his ‘Transforming leadership’ research which defined Transformational leadership as a process where “One or more persons engage with others in such a way that leaders and followers raise one another to higher levels of motivation and morality” (Burns 1978, p. 20). Bass (1985) popularised Burns’ theory, proposing that followers tend to trust, admire, and respect their leader, which motivates them to contribute more than they are expected to. Therefore these definitions lead this writer to believe that Transactional leadership draws on the personal qualities of self-actualisation, being visionary, the ability to explain vision well, and being concerned about the welfare of others. This writer’s view is supported by Bartol et al., (2008, p. 497), who argue that Transformational leaders:

Motivate individuals to perform beyond normal expectations by inspiring subordinates to focus on broader missions transcending their own immediate self-interest, concentrate on intrinsic higher-
level goals (achievement and self-actualisation) not extrinsic lower-level goals (safety and security); and be confident in their abilities to achieve the leader’s missions (Wall Street Journal 1995).

According to Bass (1985), Transformational leadership is comprised of three traits: charisma, individualised consideration, and intellectual stimulation. Bass believes charisma is the most crucial factor, which Bartol et al., (2008, p. 498) define as “Comprising the leader’s ability to inspire pride, faith and respect; to recognise what is important; and to explain effectively a sense of mission, or vision that inspires followers”.

Many researchers have published their findings about leadership charisma. For example according to research published by Conger and Kanungo (1987 pp. 637 - 647), charismatic leaders mainly rely on referent and expert power to promote their vision of change. Also, research by Groves (2005, pp. 30 - 46) argues that female leaders seem to have generally better social and emotional skills than male leaders.

Bass (1985) argues that in the Individualised Consideration leadership trait, a leader delegates projects on the basis they will increase the capability of their followers, if they pay close attention to their followers’ needs and treat them respectfully. Finally, Bass’ Intellectual Stimulation trait is perhaps best explained by Bartol et al., (2008, p. 499) as “Offering new ideas to stimulate followers to re-think old ways of doing things, encouraging followers to look at problems from several vantage points, and fostering creative breakthroughs in obstacles that seemed insurmountable.” Their statement leads the writer to ponder “How are these Transactional leadership qualities displayed in an organisational cultural context?” Bass and Avolio (1993, p. 3) state that within a Transformational culture:

There is generally a sense of purpose and a feeling of family, therefore leaders become role models, mentors or coaches that consistently espouse organisational goals and purpose that all followers undertake as important components of their organisation’s vision”.

Bass (1998) also argues that “Transformational cultures encourage and support innovation and open discussion of issues and ideas so that challenges become opportunities rather than threats. People in transformational cultures go beyond their self-interests and strive towards organisational goals”. All these statements lead this writer to believe that cultural dynamics present significant challenges for Transformational leaders to effectively cope

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
with, and that the effectiveness of leadership style significantly influences the strength or weakness of an organisation’s financial performance. Finally, it is worthwhile comparing the Transactional and Transformational Leadership categories and putting them into their correct perspective to each other. Robbins, De Cenzo, Coulter, and Woods (2011) opine that:

Transactional and transformational leadership shouldn’t be viewed as opposing approaches to getting things done. Transformational leadership develops from transactional leadership. It produces levels of employee effort and performance that go beyond what would occur with a transactional approach alone. Moreover, transformational leadership is more than charisma since the transformational leader attempts to instil in followers the ability to question not only established views but those views held by the leader.

This statement highlights an irony that exists wherein both leadership categories differ in their orientation to leading people, but also complement each other. Robbins et al., (2011) reconcile the effectiveness of both leadership categories with each other thus:

The evidence supporting the superiority of transformational leadership over transactional leadership is overwhelmingly impressive. For instance studies that looked at managers in different settings, including the military and business, found that transformational leaders were evaluated as more effective, higher performers, more promotable than their transactional counterparts, and more interpersonally sensitive. In addition evidence indicates that transformational leadership is strongly correlated with lower turnover rates and higher levels of productivity, employee satisfaction, creativity, goal attainment and follower wellbeing.

Overall, on the strength of this statement, it is clear to this writer that Transformational leadership is the more effective way to lead people because it produces better results for leaders and their followers. This writer believes a reason for this could perhaps be because Transactional leadership is harmonious with the prevailing knowledge age paradigm, which holds that knowledge workers are an investment and machinery is a cost. This paradigm distinctly contrasts with the industrial age paradigm that holds workers are a cost and machinery is an investment.

Summary

This section has described the main developments in leadership theory spanning from the early 1900s to today. The main theme emerging here is these theories are still actively used today, albeit in different environments and contexts. Another trend emerged that in today’s global knowledge economy, the Transformational leadership style is more likely to

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrilv” Experiences”
be adopted than the Transactional style, and adapted to effectively lead knowledge workers for corporate competitive advantage in today’s knowledge economy. The next section will discuss leadership task themes that have emerged from the main leadership theories already discussed.

**Leadership Task Themes**

This section discusses the essence of eight important leadership task themes that have emerged from the major leadership theories discussed in the previous section. The first leadership task theme arises from Burns (1978, p. 19) who argues in leadership “The crucial variable is purpose … I define leadership as leaders inducing followers to act for certain goals that represent the values and the motivations, the wants and the needs, the aspirations and expectations of both leaders and followers.” This writer believes the key words in Burns quote are “Purpose”, “Goals”, and “Inducing” and “Act”, which suggests leadership is an activity based on a common or shared purpose. It is also suggested that whenever leaders and their followers have a shared interest, a leader’s key responsibility is to shape purposes and goals. Burns also argues the primary leadership task is to persuade followers to act in pursuit of stated goals.

The second leadership task theme comes from the work of Bennis and Nanus’ (1985) research of 90 corporate and public leaders which identified four discrete leadership strategies. These are creating focus, grabbing attention through vision, capturing imaginations, and aligning people by creating meaning through communication of organisational vision to support implementation of the organisational vision by building trust in the leader.

Finally, there is constancy, reliability with a strong emphasis on “Learning from mistakes, learning to inform the vision, and learning to challenge assumptions and innovate.” Bennis and Nanus’ (1985, p. 103). This writer believes these can be categorised into three key leadership task themes that relate to leadership vision. For instance, creating a vision, aligning people around the vision, and then carrying out the vision.
A third leadership task theme stems from the work of Kouzes and Posner (1987). Their research discovered five fundamental leadership practices which they argue are fundamental to effective leadership. Firstly, Challenging Processes underpinned by strategies of searching for opportunities and experimenting and taking risks. Secondly, Inspiring a Shared Vision underpinned by strategies of envisioning the future and enlisting followers. Thirdly, Enabling others to act, which is underpinned by fostering collaboration between followers and strengthening followers. Finally, “Modelling the Way” through setting a good example for followers, and planning small wins to make progress visible. Finally, “Encouraging the Heart”, which involves recognising their follower’s contributions and celebrating their achievements.

The fourth leadership task theme originates from research undertaken by Conger (1989) who researched non-charismatic and charismatic leadership styles. From Conger’s research emerged the important leadership paradigm that charisma evolves through four discrete stages. These are sensing opportunity and creating a vision, explaining the organisational vision, building trust in the organisational vision, and then achieving the vision. This writer believes Conger’s stages of charismatic development can be reduced to three leadership task themes based on creating leadership trust. These are sensing opportunities and creating organisational vision, communicating and building trust in the organisational vision, and finally achieving the organisation’s vision.

A fifth leadership task theme arises from the work of Tichy and Devanna (1990) who researched the leadership style of 12 Chief Executive Officers (CEO’s) involved in transformational change. Their research showed that CEO’s lead their organisations through three leadership task phases. These phases are recognising the need for change, creating a new vision, and then institutionalising the envisioned changes. A key element in the third phase involves creating a network of people to help the leader carry out their vision. This can be achieved by using special task forces, planning meetings, management development workshops, team building workshops, reorganisation of sub departments, creating new positions, changes in reward systems and appraisal procedures, or designing facilities.
In the sixth leadership task theme, Kotter (1990) surveyed 200 business executives to research instances of effective business leadership. Kotter’s research discovered that four key tasks underpin effective leadership. These are fixing direction, aligning people, motivating people, and inspiring people. This writer understands these tasks can be consolidated to represent the leadership themes of direction and alignment of people, which are critical for effective leadership of an organisation’s value chain.

In the seventh leadership task theme, Sherman and Tichy (1993) undertook research that suggested four primary leadership tasks exist. These themes are awakening and creating a sense of urgency, envisioning an organisation’s strategic intent, mobilising commitment to the organisational vision, and re-architecting to support and perform the vision. This writer believes Sherman and Tichy’s (1993) findings can be consolidated into two leadership task themes of first creating, and then progressing commitment to restructuring an organisation around its vision.

Finally, in the eighth leadership task theme, Gardner (1996) published research that argued two primary leadership tasks exist and are undertaken by three distinctly different leadership types. Firstly, the development of a story by an ordinary leader who relates traditional or conservative stories of their team as effectively as possible. Secondly, an innovative leader who develops a story within their own social context and embellishes it to stimulate the imagination of their followers. Thirdly, Gardner (1996) discovered the rarest leader is someone who creates a new story previously unknown by their followers.

The writer suggests two important leadership task themes emerge from Gardner’s research. Firstly, developing a general story line. Secondly, relating a story line to other people about the leader’s own life. Overall, from the eight leadership task theories outlined here, this writer believes three broad leadership task themes emerge:

1. The need for a vision to be created that recognises the need for change, and then sets about designing a new future (i.e. envisioning)
2. A leader communicating their vision to people and inspiring them to give their personal commitment and support to carry out that vision (i.e. engaging)
3. A leader working towards achieving their vision. This can be achieved through applying the influence of their charismatic personality to inspire and motivate their
followers to achieve the leader’s vision more for themselves than their leader (i.e. enacting)

Furthermore, Cammock (2007 p. 57) categorises these three leadership task themes as envisioning, engaging, and enacting. Cammock posits that although these themes may not represent all leadership skills, they tend to produce virtuous cycles that progressively increase a leader’s capability in the situations (i.e. crucibles) they face. Conversely, when these leadership task themes are absent, a vicious cycle of leadership ineffectiveness can arise and develop the potential to become destructive. This writer accepts the veracity of Cammock’s assertion, based on his own leadership experiences.

**Summary**

In summary, this section has described the main theoretical developments in eight important leadership task themes that have emerged from the six major leadership theories described previously. The consistent theme emerging from these leadership theories is that they all represent different ways for leaders to manage their vision for handling changing situations with varying degrees of ambiguity.

The other main theme emerging was leadership principally involves leaders implanting their vision into other people’s minds about what the future should hold, encouraging them to build a new future, and empowering them to build the future through the influence of their charisma. These themes lead to the next section which will discuss the three key leadership entities of calling, character, and competence.
Chapter Two: Leadership

Leadership Entities Underpinning This Thesis

The three leadership entities of calling, character, and competence are important in this thesis and comprise core elements of the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) discussed in Chapter One. This section of the Chapter addresses each of the three key leadership entities.

Leadership Calling

The first leadership entity of the Primary Research Design Model is leadership calling. For instance, Cammock (2009, p. 47) argues that leadership calling forms a “Crucial link between the individual and the public good”. Figure 3 shows that a leader may choose to adopt the four calling orientations of Job/Career, Duty, Avocation, or Calling within the fundamental dimensions of Internal Prompting and External Invitation.

![Figure 3. Orientations to work](image)

Source: Adapted from Cammock (2009, p. 52)
Firstly, Cammock (2009) posits Internal Prompting categorises internal psychological processes that give people a sense of uniqueness and stimulates passion about their work. Secondly, External Invitation defines “A sense of ‘duty’ which links people to their ‘larger community … not for the self alone but for the common good”. This model is apt in the context of this thesis’ research because it can be used to determine where a leader’s bias is focused towards. For instance, it can be used to show whether a leader’s bias is towards their psychological needs or towards working for the common (public) good. Both of these bias orientations within the dimensions shown in Figure 3 (p. 41) are discussed next to show the importance of their underpinning role in leadership calling.

Fundamental tenets of Cammock’s (2009) ‘Orientations to work’ model are first, that people categorised in the Job/Career quadrant usually tend to be selfishly motivated by their own financial gain. The second principle holds that people situated in the Avocation quadrant usually tend to be fascinated with their work, which they do more for their personal enjoyment than material or political gain. Thirdly, people in the Duty quadrant are usually motivated by their sense of duty toward upholding the common (public) good, and also usually have a strong service orientation for serving people and/or helping them. Finally, people in the Calling quadrant usually have the “Passion of avocation combined with the service orientation of a duty” (Cammock, 2009, p. 47). This is shown in Figure 3 (p. 41) in the ‘Calling’ quadrant, which draws from the nexus of Avocation and Duty quadrants (as arrowed).

The fourth principle (i.e. calling) infers that leaders who can be categorised as being in the calling category usually experience great satisfaction from doing what they are good at while contributing to their communities’ welfare. This writer believes this shows that leadership calling influences development of stronger leadership capability when a person does what they enjoying doing the most.

Cammock (2009, p. 52) says “The final outcome is not that of greater happiness or complexity and flow, but rather an alignment with our destiny”. With in the context of this thesis, the writer interprets this comment suggests leaders who understand who they are (i.e. self-awareness⁹), what they do best (i.e. competence¹⁰), and what their place is in the

⁹ coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 78 ‘Self-awareness’ (Appendix 2)

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
world (i.e. humility\textsuperscript{11}), will eventually realise their calling and support their communities well.

**Leadership Character**

This section will discuss the nature of leadership character, which is the second leadership entity in the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4). According to Cammock (2007, p. 131) the leadership character entity comprises six main characteristics of Integrity\textsuperscript{12}, Faith\textsuperscript{13}, Passion\textsuperscript{14}, Courage\textsuperscript{15}, a Sense of Self\textsuperscript{16}, and a Concern for Others\textsuperscript{17}. Cammock (2007) argues the first four characteristics are critical because his earlier 1991 (p. 131) research holds that “Managers were considered to possess these characteristics on the evidence of consistent and fairly ordinary everyday attitudes and behaviour”. The first leadership characteristic is Integrity which is the most critical characteristic, and is defined by (Cammock 2007, p. 131) as:

Tempers passion [which] helps [them] to stay in touch with the values and sense of calling that guided him or her into the leadership process...involves a consistence between what we feel, what we think, what we say and what we do.

For example, Captain Chesley Sullenberger (2009, p. 307), who crash landed an Airbus A320-214 jet airliner into New York’s Hudson River in 2009, stated that integrity is the core of his profession as an airline pilot. He defined integrity as “Doing the right thing even when it’s not convenient”. In this writer’s view, integrity is a critical underpinning element of effective leadership because it forms a robust foundation of trust\textsuperscript{18} between leaders and their followers. Without this element, leadership is likely to eventually develop into a “vicious cycle of leadership ineffectiveness” (Cammock 2007, p. 57). Secondly, Cammock (2007, p. 133) states leaders with faith are “Seen as optimistic and positive with a good sense of humour and the ability to bounce back quickly from setbacks”. Thirdly,

\textsuperscript{10} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 17 ‘Competence’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{11} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 39 ‘Humility’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{12} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 47 ‘Integrity’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{13} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 61 ‘Optimism’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{14} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 65 ‘Passion’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{15} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 19 ‘Courageous’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{16} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 78 ‘Self-awareness’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{17} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 25 ‘Empathy’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{18} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 88 ‘Trust’ (Appendix 2)

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
Cammock (2007, p. 133) defines courage as “A willingness to tackle unpleasant tasks, take hard decisions, take responsibility when things go wrong, and speak the truth on the numerous occasions when the truth is not welcome”. Finally, Cammock (2007, p. 132) defines leadership passion as “A deep intense, even overwhelming, sense of emotion, enthusiasm and involvement with tasks at hand”.

The next two leadership characteristics involve a “concern for others” and a “sense of self” (Cammock 2007, p. 134) argues these characteristics form the kernel of leadership capability. For instance, Cammock (2007, p. 131) asserts “The leader here functions not as part of an elite that is superior to and abstracted from his or her followers but rather as a fellow servant in the joint pursuit of a great and shared vision”.

Furthermore, Cammock (2007, p.136) also suggests “It involves a choice not only to serve other people, but life itself as it manifests itself within us”. Finally, a “sense of self” according to Cammock (2007, p. 137) is evoked by leadership characteristics of self-esteem, self-confidence, personal security, and self-responsibility. Cammock also argues (2007, p. 139) that:

The sense of self must be balanced with a concern for others. A leader who has a strong sense of self without a compensating concern for others is in danger of becoming self-absorbed and self-centred. By contrast, leaders who have a strong concern for others but no sense of self are in danger of losing themselves in rescuing relationships and of repeatedly having their boundaries violated. It is the paradoxical and complementary existence of both characteristics that creates their strength.

Overall, the statements made by Cammock (2007) lead this writer to believe a leader who demonstrates leadership characteristics of integrity, faith, passion, courage, a sense of self, and a concern for others is more likely to be considered a more effective leader by their followers than a leader who does not demonstrate them. Furthermore, if these characteristics are weak or absent, they might be perceived as signatures of inadequate leadership capability by followers.

**Leadership Competence**

Finally, this section will discuss the leadership competence entity. According to Greenleaf (1996, pp. 170 – 171) leadership competence is defined as “Building the ethic of strength in business” (Greenleaf 1996, p. 163). Moreover, he argues it is comprised of six
dimensions: technical competence\textsuperscript{19}, disciplined analytical sharpness\textsuperscript{20}, intuitive fertility\textsuperscript{21}, foresight\textsuperscript{22}, persuasive ability\textsuperscript{23}, and the ability to use and deal with power\textsuperscript{24}. It is interesting that Greenleaf (1966, p. 170) defines strength as “Technical competence in whatever one is engaged in” which shows effective leaders have an intimate knowledge about the mechanics of their work. Secondly, (Greenleaf 1996, p. 170) “disciplined analytical sharpness”, which includes “Value analysis – the ability to weigh available choices on a scale that is bounded by serving and hurting people”. This is the ability to break complexity down to simple choices to make decisions. Thirdly, “intuitive fertility” (Greenleaf 1996, p. 170), which:

\[\ldots\text{comes from “constantly reviewing one’s experiences and storing in one’s internal computer [mind] the data [knowledge] from which choices are made. Then, in the moment of need, having pursued conscious analysis as far as it will go, one is able to withdraw from the analytical search and allow the unconscious resources to deliver, as on a computer screen, a range of choices.}\]

In this writer’s experience, this is the ability to reflect on crucibles and learn what they mean. Fourth is “foresight”, which Cammock (2007, p.170) defines as:

A facet of intuitive fertility [that is] seeing an event before it happens and preparing for it. The “lead” that a leader has, the possession of which is one of the bases of trust of followers, is that she or he cares more, prepares better, and foresees more clearly than others.

The writer believes this is important because a leader with foresight is usually able to foresee issues before they emerge and work in proactive anticipation of change, which in this writer’s experience is an essential underpinning element of leadership vision.

Fifth (Greenleaf 1996, p. 170) is persuasive ability which usually embraces:

\[\ldots\text{respect for the integrity of the people one would persuade…the person being persuaded must take that intuitive step on his or her own, untrammelled by coercive pressure, expressed or implied. Persuasion is one of the critical arts possessed by those who would be strong.}\]

\textsuperscript{19} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 17 ‘Competence’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{20} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 8 ‘Analytical’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{21} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 49 ‘Intuition’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{22} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 36 ‘Foresight’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{23} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 66 ‘Persuasiveness’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{24} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 67 ‘Power’ (Appendix 2)
The writer believes persuasive ability is important in the leadership context because it is synonymous with the fundamental leadership role of communicating organisational vision effectively to followers.

Finally, the ability to use and deal with power (Greenleaf 1996, p.170), which is defined as being important:

\[
\ldots \text{to use one’s power to avoid being hurt oneself by others’ use of power, but it is more important to use one’s power affirmatively to serve, in the sense that those being served, while being served, become healthier, wiser, freer, more autonomous, and more likely themselves to become servants.}
\]

The writer interprets Greenleaf’s sixth dimension of power in a Servant Leadership context implies power with, rather than power over followers (Follett 1926). What strikes this writer about these six competence dimensions are the themes of exercising integrity and supporting others that also emerge in the second, fourth, fifth, and sixth competency dimensions. This leads this writer to argue the essential ingredients of leadership competence are therefore exercising integrity and supporting people, without which leadership capability could be regarded as ineffective and eventually develop into a vicious cycle of leadership ineffectiveness (Cammock 2007. p. 57).

Finally, Greenleaf (1996, p.171) states “The difficulty in acquiring these competencies is significant if one tries to learn them in a classroom”. He argues “Good practitioners of these competences were not born with them; they learned them, but not in a classroom.” These statements are significant because they infer experiential learning through reflective thinking about crucibles is a more effective way to develop leadership competence than learning leadership theory in a classroom.

**Summary**

In summary, this section has described three key leadership entities of calling, character, and competence. These entities collectively constitute the leadership capability construct in the Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3) and are key elements of the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4). Three main themes emerged from this discussion. Firstly, leaders who have realised their calling in life are more likely to have higher leadership capability which arises from their fascination in doing what they do best. Secondly,
Chapter Two: Leadership

integrity, or being genuinely concerned for others; and a sense of self are both critical characteristics of one’s leadership character. Finally, developing leadership competence through experientially learning from crucibles is a more effective way to develop one’s leadership competence than learning it in a classroom.

Thesis Leadership Concept

In the previous section, a theme emerged about leadership competence from Greenleaf (1996, p.171) who stated: “The difficulty in acquiring these competencies is significant if one tries to learn them in a classroom … good practitioners of these competences were not born with them; they learned them, but not in a classroom.” The writer believes this statement is significant because the notion of effectively developing leadership competence through experiential learning from crucibles links with the primary research purpose of this thesis (Figure 2, p. 4). Therefore, this section will outline the concept of leadership learning through lived experience as an “apprenticed process of ‘becoming’”, argued by Kempster (2006); to show how causal influences operating in a particular context, influence how people develop their ability to lead people. This is followed with discussion about three renowned real-life examples to illustrate the essence of Kempster’s (2006) concept to show how crucibles developed leadership capability in risky situations and prevented loss of human life.

Leadership learning through lived experience

Research undertaken by Kempster (2006, p. 5) determined that:

Leadership learning through lived experience draws on a complex milieu of events and influences that occur through daily engagement within particular contexts, and it is through such engagement that leadership meanings, practices and identities are developed.

Kempster (2006, pp. 16 – 17) posits that leadership learning needs to be seen as a form of apprenticeship underpinned by a process of ‘becoming’ that develops leadership competence. According to Kempster (2006, p. 16) the primacy of ‘lived experience’

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
subsumes four core elements of (1) ‘observed and enacted episodes of leadership experience’, (2) ‘implicit reflection on leadership’, (3) ‘explicit and tacit knowledge of leadership’, and (4) ‘participatory roles in leading’. It is noteworthy that Kempster’s (2006) concept conceptually draws upon Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (1984), which is explained in the next chapter (Figure 7, p. 75).

It is also significant that Kempster’s (2006, p. 17) concept of ‘implicit reflection on leadership’ highlights the importance of reflective thinking in the development of leadership competence. Kempster (2006, p. 17) also argues the impact of reflecting on lived experience(s) on leadership development is more anticipatory than explicit and needs to be seen as a form of apprenticeship; moreover a process of ‘becoming’. Furthermore, it is also noteworthy that Kempster’s (2006) concept about the importance of reflection in the development of leadership competence is also supported by Boud, Keogh, and Walker’s (1985, p. 19) ‘Reflective Learning Model’ which is explained in the next chapter (Figure 5, p. 66).

Kempster (2006, p. 17) also opines that leadership ‘becoming’ through apprenticeship is an evolving yet structured process:

Leadership learning through lived experience places emphasis on the organizational situation. The centrality of the situation is significant as it both shapes and is shaped by the agency actions of the actors in the situation through their participation. This suggests an evolving structure – agency dynamic that is continually creating and sustaining leadership learning throughout the cycle. Further, the notion of cycle seeks to symbolize a process of ‘becoming’ (Tsoukas & Chia 2002) a leader. Such ‘becoming’ appears to be significantly associated with increasing identification with, and salience of, leadership and particularly to the emergence of the leader as both corporate agent and actor, symbiotically shaping both their own learning and that of others in the organizational context.

Finally, Kempster’s (2006) concept that leadership learning develops through lived experience compels the writer to argue that rich opportunities exist in everyday life for leaders to develop their leadership capability and ‘become’ effective leaders through experientially learning and reflecting on the crucibles they experience. Three examples that exemplify this are shown in the next section.
Chapter Two: Leadership

Crucible Examples

Because this thesis is about crucibles, the significance of developing leadership capability through experientially learning from crucibles is shown in three examples of life-threatening leadership situations. Firstly, US Airways Flight 1549. On January 15th 2009 with 155 passengers on board, Captain Chesley Sullenberger crash landed an Airbus A320-214 jet airliner into the Hudson River after suffering a bird strike three minutes after takeoff from LaGuardia Airport, New York. According to Sullenberger (2009, p. 312):

Jeff [First Officer] and I had found ourselves in a crucible, a cacophony of automated warnings, synthetic voices, repetitive chimes, radio calls, traffic alerts, and ground proximity warnings. Through it all, we had to maintain control of the airplane, analyse the situation, take step-by-step action, and make critical decisions without being distracted or panicking. It sounded as if our world was ending, and yet our crew coordination was beautiful. I was very proud of what we were able to accomplish.

This statement from Sullenberger (2009, p. 119) shows this crucible tested his situational awareness and his ability to develop an accurate real-time mental model of his crucible. He credits his ability to achieve this stems from his earlier military fighter pilot training which:

Demanded an absolute commitment to excellence because we were required to do incredible things close to the ground and fast, often changing directions quickly, while always making sure that the way we were pointed was safe to go.

Sullenberger’s reflection on his crucible stimulated his self-awareness about who he is and what is important to him. The writer finds it interesting that Sullenberger (2009, p. 261) has the humility to feel uncomfortable being labelled a hero and states why he feels this way:

We did our best, we turned to our training, we made good decisions, we didn’t give up, we valued every life on that plane – and we had a good outcome. I don’t know that “heroic” examines that. It’s more that we had a philosophy of life, and we applied it to the things we did that day, and the things we did on a lot of days leading up to it.

Furthermore, Sullenberger’s acute self-awareness of his leadership calling, character, and competence, is shown by his statement “We need to try to do the right thing every time, to perform at our best, because we never know which moment in our lives we’ll be judged
Chapter Two: Leadership

on” (Sullenberger, 2009, p. 314). As a consequence of Sullenberger’s leadership competence, everyone on Flight 1549 survived the crash landing.

Secondly, Sir Ernest Shackleton’s Imperial Trans-Antarctic Expedition which set sail in the ship Endurance from London on April 1st, 1914. Shackleton’s objective was to become the first man to successfully cross the Antarctic continent on foot via the South Pole.

Unfortunately, Shackleton and his crew of 27 men never set foot on the Antarctic continent and experienced many setbacks caused by the harsh Antarctic environmental conditions. This started with the Endurance becoming trapped in heavy pack ice within sight of land and eventually sinking into the Weddell Sea after being crushed by the ice. In anticipation of this happening, Shackleton planned to march to the safety of land, however this failed due to unstable ice flows and soft snow blocking all his attempts to reach the Antarctic continent.

Shackleton’s leadership developed strong followership among his crew and endured many failures by creating new plans and reforming his team members’ organisation and roles. Shackleton eventually went on to survive two Antarctic winters and sailed in a converted longboat on a dangerous voyage from Elephant Island to South Georgia to arrange the rescue of his crew. Shackleton never gave up fighting the crucibles besetting him and his crew and he eventually rescued everyone on his fourth try without loss of life.

What this writer believes is most significant here is Shackleton’s acute self-awareness of his leadership calling, character and competence. This is shown in his statement: “The loyalty of your men is a sacred trust you carry. It is something which must never be betrayed, something you must live up to” (Morell and Capparell, 2001, p. 215).

Finally, the Apollo 13 moon mission which NASA launched from Cape Canaveral on April 11, 1970 under the command of Astronaut James Lovell. Two days later on the way to the Moon and about 200,000 miles away from earth, a fault in the electrical system of one of the Service Module’s oxygen tanks exploded. This caused a loss of electrical power and failure of the remaining oxygen tanks. This crucible forced a quick and critical decision by NASA management to cancel their planned lunar landing and return the three
Astronauts safely to earth instead. In response, the three Astronauts on board quickly powered down and evacuated the Command Module, crawled into the Lunar Module, and then manoeuvred around the moon to safely return to earth.

The three Astronauts experienced significant hardships like limited power, loss of cabin heat, and a shortage of water in near freezing cabin temperatures. Meanwhile back on earth, NASA leaders formed teams of Astronauts and Engineers to develop solutions for the failed Service Module systems. All of their solutions worked and eventually enabled the three astronauts to safely return to Earth on April 17th, 1970. Consequently, the Apollo 13 mission was dubbed by NASA management as the oxymoron of a "successful failure", because when this mission’s primary objective of landing on the moon and conducting scientific experiments failed, its revised objective of returning the three Astronauts safely to earth was successful.

Commander Lovell credits Apollo 13’s safe return to earth to effective teamwork between Mission Control’s scientists and engineers who developed effective solutions for the problems, and well trained Astronauts who made the solutions work. What this writer believes is most insightful, is a comment made by Commander Lovell in Morrell and Capparell (2001, p. 178) that expresses his acute self-awareness of his leadership calling, character and competence:

People like Shackleton and myself are individuals who can take on challenges – challenges that might include the unexpected. You go in knowing everything is not going to work, and if you can think of things that can go wrong you can ‘think ahead’. I think he [Shackleton] took the same attitude we took on Apollo 13: You have to look forward as long as there is a chance.

This writer interprets Lovell’s statement indicates his leadership character also embraces a high degree of risk tolerance, optimism and tenacity. This also became evident in the writer’s interview with Commander Lovell. For instance, when this writer asked him: “What was the most important lesson you learnt from your [Apollo 13] ordeal [crucible]?”, he responded: “The most important lesson learnt was to “never give up””.25

25 Italicised by this writer for emphasis. Source: email from Commander Lovell dated 28th August, 2007

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Section Summary

The main theme emerged in three renowned examples that showed how crucibles tested leadership capability in life-threatening situations. The examples given were the US Airways Flight 1549, Shackleton’s Trans-Antarctic Expedition, and NASA’s Apollo 13 moon mission. This writer believes these examples exemplify the influence of crucibles developing leadership capability through focusing leaders’ reflective thinking on the criticality of tasks at hand. Finally, the most significant meaning that can be drawn from the three examples is perhaps best described by Perkins (2000, p. 139) as the “Tenacious creativity to never give up, there’s always another move”. Overall, this leads the writer to emphasise that tenacity is a reliable indicator of how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability in risky situations. The next section will conclude with an outline of the main themes and broad issues that emerged in this Chapter in context with the Research Design Model of this thesis.

Conclusions

In conclusion, four themes have emerged from this Chapter’s examination of the main developments in leadership literature.

Firstly, the writer could not find one all-encompassing definition that comprehensively explained the essence of what leadership is. He thinks this is perhaps partly due to the emergence of coherent leadership theories influenced by societal mores and attitudes over time. It could also be due to the highly complex situational and multifaceted nature of leadership suggested by Hughes, Ginnett, and Curphy (2006), and Bennis’ (1959) statement alluding to the “slipperiness and complexity” of leadership practice. Further, this could also be due to many leadership researchers defining leadership through the lens of their own paradigms and research interests (Yukl, 2006).

All these factors lead the writer to believe it is perhaps more appropriate to explain leadership through metaphor. For example, Bridge’s (2003) metaphor of a symphony orchestra conductor synchronising musical activities in an intellectually flexible and flowing manner that embraces a shared purpose. Another issue arose from Bennis’ (1989)
assertion that no singular personal attribute or combination of attributes exists to guarantee leadership effectiveness.

Secondly, primary developments in leadership theory have evolved from what is generally regarded as the primary leadership theories: Great Man, Trait, Behavioural, Contingency, Transactional and Transformational theory.

Thirdly, three main leadership task themes emerged from the six main leadership theories previously mentioned. Firstly, envisioning which is the ability to intellectually conceive that something needs to be created. Secondly, engaging the emotional and/or intellectual commitment of followers to achieve the leader’s espoused vision. Thirdly, enactment of followers’ efforts to accomplish their leader’s vision because they want the experience of achieving this more for their leader than themselves.

Given his own leadership experiences, this writer believes the three main leadership tasks are practical indicators of leadership capability that develop more through experientially learning from reflecting on their crucible experiences than studying leadership theory in a classroom lesson. Or in other words, as stated by Warren Bennis in a 2008 Harvard Centre for Public Learning interview, “Leadership is something that is caught, not taught.”

Finally, discussion linked the three leadership entities of calling, character and competence to the Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3) which underpins the research purpose of this thesis. Themes emerged of these entities developing from the experiential learning process of reflective thinking, which develops leadership competence.

Given this thesis is about how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability, the themes that emerged in this Chapter not only epitomise the situational and dynamic nature of leadership, they highlight the effectiveness of the experiential learning process of reflective thinking to develop leadership capability. This notion provides the context for the next Chapter which will discuss experiential learning.
CHAPTER THREE: EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING

Introduction

The objective of this Chapter is to examine what is generally understood about adult experiential learning in a leadership context.

This Chapter starts with a discussion about the influence of crucibles on leadership. It will then discuss experiential learning examples and link these to Bennis and Thomas’ (2002, p. 89) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 57). This will be followed with definitions that describe what experiential learning is, and then the role played by the experiential learning process of reflective thinking will be examined. This will then lead into discussion about the important contributions made to experiential learning by Mezirow (1978) and Kolb (1984). Finally, recent research about how New Zealand leaders reflect on their Formative Learning Experiences (FLE’s) will be discussed.

Crucibles Influence on Leadership

Throughout this thesis, the overwhelming experiences that leaders sometimes encounter are referred to as crucibles. Because this thesis is about the influence of crucibles on leadership capability, this section starts with identifying broad groups that crucibles can be categorised in. This will lead into discussion about how crucibles influence adult experiential learning. Then Bennis and Thomas’ (2002, p. 89) Leadership Development Model will be discussed because it provides a conceptual framework that suggests how lessons learned from crucibles develop leadership capability. This model will then be used to interpret three examples of life-threatening leadership situations to show how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability.

Crucible Categories

Thomas (2008, p. 20) suggests crucibles can be grouped into three main categories:
Some involve encounters with the new or unknown which I refer to as new territory\textsuperscript{26}. The crucibles sharpen an individual’s alertness to new information and his or her skill at sense making in the midst of confusion. A second crucible involves loss, impairment, defeat, or failure; I refer to this as reversal. Reversal teaches both endurance and imagination. Finally, there are the crucibles that involve an extended period of contemplation or deliberation, which I refer to as suspension. Suspension challenges a leader to clarify his or her values and purpose in life.

This writer believes Thomas’ (2008) categorisation of crucibles is useful for three reasons. Firstly, it generally shows how crucibles can develop leadership capability. Secondly, it offers a simple and convenient framework to categorise crucible sources. Thirdly, it promotes a general understanding about how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability.

\textit{Learning from Crucibles}

To start with, research by Bennis and Thomas (2002, p. 4) referred to challenging life experiences and obstacles that confront and develop leaders’ capability as ‘crucibles’. More specifically, they defined crucibles as “A process of “meaning-making” [that] both galvanizes individuals and gives them their distinctive voice”. They also argue that crucibles present leaders with difficult challenges that force them to reflect on their identity and what matters to them the most. What this writer finds so interesting is their definition for crucibles resonates with the early work of Dewey (1938, p. 44) who argued that:

\begin{quote}
As an individual passes from one situation to another, his world, his environment, expands or contracts. He does not find himself living in another world but in a different part or aspect of one and the same world. What he has learned in the way of knowledge and skill in one situation becomes an instrument of understanding and dealing effectively with the situations which follow. The process goes on as long as life and learning continue.
\end{quote}

Dewey’s (1938) statement is important in the context of this thesis because he suggests the process of experiential learning provides leaders with knowledge that can be stored, reused, or adapted to handle future crucibles. In other words, crucibles seem to provide the catalyst for a leader to learn about what their life means, to cope with future crucibles.

Also, Schon (1987) posits “Reflective learning is especially relevant to learning from experiences that are complex, happened ‘then and there’ and not necessarily through ‘here

\textsuperscript{26}Italicised in source
and now’ simulations”. Overall, this writer believes the statements made by these scholars illuminate the rich learning value that crucibles can provide to effectively develop leadership calling, character, and competence.

**Crucible Learning Process**

As a result of their research that examined the relationship between crucibles and experiential learning in leadership capability development, Bennis and Thomas (2002, p. 89) created the Leadership Development Model. Because their model (see Figure 4, p. 57) represents a process that is important within the context of this thesis, it has been adapted by this writer into a funnel shape. It will be cross-referenced to discussion showing how crucibles are systematically processed by leaders from inputs, and then reflectively processed to produce the outputs of a leader’s leadership calling, character and competence.

This experiential learning process will be described and cross-referenced next with footnotes linking it to Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) that arose from this writer’s analysis and interpretation of respondents’ interview transcripts. The purpose of all this is to link the conceptual relationship that exists between the primary research data gathered by this writer with Bennis and Thomas’ (2002) Leadership Development Model. Each stage of their model will therefore be described next for clarity.
Chapter Three: Experiential Learning

Figure 4. Leadership Development Model

Source: Adapted by this writer from Bennis & Thomas (2002, p. 89, Fig 4-1)

Inputs

Figure 4 shows that in the Inputs stage, the leadership development process is triggered by two separate psychological inputs that underpin leadership experiential learning. The first input is the influence of a leaders’ Era (A) or the societal context that shaped their

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Chapter Three: Experiential Learning

paradigms. The second input is the influence of a leader’s unique Individual Factors (B) which is comprised of leadership traits like pro-activity, decision making, problem solving, critical thinking, vision and goal setting.

**Processes**

In the process stage, both of the inputs are processed by the experiential learning process of reflection which creates a cognitive sense of meaning (C) from crucibles. This process stimulates the outputs that develop leadership competencies in four categories (D).

**Outputs**

In the Outputs stage the first category develops Adaptive Capacity (E) which triggers the hardiness or tenacity to overcome obstacles (F), noticing people’s talents, identifying opportunities, grasping situational contexts (G), learning about how to learn (H), confronting unfamiliar situations with confidence and optimism (I), and the ability to proactively seize opportunities and develop creative solutions for problems or crisis (J). The second category stimulates the engagement of others by creating Shared Meaning (K) through exercising empathy, obsessively communicating with people, and encouraging people to think independently. The third category develops Voice, which is the nurturing of people’s talent and passion about what they are good at and enjoy doing the most. In this area, crucibles influence the development of a strong sense of self-

---

27 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 63 ‘Orientation’ & 64 ‘Paradigm’ (Appendix 2)
28 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 36 ‘Foresight’ (Appendix 2)
29 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 50 ‘Judgement’ (Appendix 2)
30 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 8 ‘Analytical’ (Appendix 2)
31 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 21 ‘Critical Thinking’ (Appendix 2)
32 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 92 ‘Vision’ (Appendix 2)
33 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 62 ‘Organiser’ & 69 ‘Prioritising’ (Appendix 2)
34 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 71 ‘Reflection’ (Appendix 2)
35 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 87 ‘Tenacity’ (Appendix 2)
36 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 60 ‘Opportunist’ (Appendix 2)
37 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 9 ‘Aplomb’ (Appendix 2)
38 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 61 ‘Optimism’ (Appendix 2)
39 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 21 ‘Critical Thinking’ (Appendix 2)
40 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 25 ‘Empathy’ (Appendix 2)
41 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 15 ‘Communicating’ (Appendix 2)
42 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 54 ‘Mentoring’ (Appendix 2)
awareness\textsuperscript{43}, self-confidence\textsuperscript{44}, emotional and social intelligence\textsuperscript{45}. The fourth category develops Integrity\textsuperscript{46} (M) which influences people’s morality by developing their ethical values. These output elements eventually translate into outcomes.

**Outcomes**

The instance of reflective thinking in the previous stage develops outcomes of enhanced leadership calling, character, and competence. This leads the writer to believe that reflective thinking about crucibles equips leaders with knowledge that will help them to better cope with future crucibles they encounter.

The outcomes from this process will usually become overtly seen and interpreted by people as a leader’s level of leadership capability. Furthermore, the outcomes will also be intuitively sensed by a leader in the form of heightened self-awareness about their leadership calling, character, competence, and overall leadership capability. In this writer’s view, the Leadership Development Model is important in the context of this thesis for three reasons. Firstly, it shows how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability. Secondly, it provides a conceptual process that trainers can adapt and transform into leadership development training courses. Thirdly, it promotes more understanding about how crucibles cognitively develop leadership capability.

**Crucible Examples**

In the previous section this writer described Bennis and Thomas’ (2002) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 57) and used this as a metaphor to suggest how crucibles develop leadership capability. The process implied by this model will be illustrated next with three renowned examples of life-threatening leadership situations. Firstly, the pilot of the doomed Flight 1549, Captain Chesley Sullenberger (2009) pp. 229 – 230 reflects:

> Through all my years as a commercial pilot, I had never forgotten the aircrew ejection study I had learned about in my military days. I had never shaken my memories of fellow Air Force pilots who didn’t survive such attempts. And having the details of that knowledge in the recesses of my brain was helpful in making those quick decisions on Flight 1549. As soon as the birds struck, I could

\textsuperscript{43} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 78 ‘Self-awareness’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{44} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 9 ‘Aplomb’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{45} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 81 ‘Sensitivity’ (Appendix 2)
\textsuperscript{46} coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 47 ‘Integrity’ (Appendix 2)
have attempted a return to La Guardia [airport] so as not to ruin a US Airways aircraft by attempting a landing elsewhere.

I could have worried that my decision to ditch the plane would be questioned by superiors or investigators. But I chose not to. I was able to make a mental shift in priorities. I had read enough about safety and cognitive theory. I knew about the concept of “goal sacrificing.”

When it’s no longer possible to complete all of your goals, you sacrifice lower-priority goals. You do this in order to perform and fulfill higher goals. In this case, by attempting a water landing, I would sacrifice the “airplane goal” (trying not to destroy an aircraft valued at [US] $60 million) for the goal of saving lives. I knew instinctively and intuitively that goal sacrificing was paramount if we were to preserve life on Flight 1549.

It took twenty-two seconds from the time I considered and suggested Teterboro [airport] to the time I rejected the airport as unreachable. I could see the area around Teterboro moving up in the windscreen, a sure sign that our flight path would not extend that far.

This writer believes Sullenberger’s statement shows how his leadership competencies align with key elements of Bennis & Thomas’ (2002) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 57). For instance, Sullenberger’s era (A) of air force fighter pilot training influenced his decision to land at the nearest airport or crash land in the Hudson River. While making his decision, he was forced to draw on Individual Factors (B) like effective problem solving, rapid decision making, and goal setting under the extreme pressure imposed by his crucible. These situational inputs were cognitively processed by Sullenberger to develop a sense of meaning (C) out of the situation. This influenced him to exercise the leadership competencies of Adaptive Capacity (F), Leadership Voice (L), and Integrity (M). Overall, this process shows how Sullenberger’s leadership saved his passengers lives in the crash landing he attempted.

Secondly, Sir Ernest Shackleton’s ill-fated Imperial Trans-Antarctic Expedition which set out from London in 1914 and ended three years later in 1917. After his ship, the Endurance, was crushed by ice and sank Shackleton recorded his thoughts while it was sinking (republished 2004, p. 73):

Again the pressure began, and at 5 pm. I ordered all hands on to the ice. The twisting, grinding floes were working the will at last on the ship. It was a sickening sensation to feel the decks breaking up under one’s feet, the great beams bending and then snapping with a noise like heavy gunfire. The water was overmastering the pumps, and to avoid an explosion when it reached the boilers I had to give orders for the fires to be drawn and the steam let down. The plans for abandoning the ship in case of emergency had been made well in advance, and men and dogs descended to the floe and made their way to the comparative safety of an unbroken portion of the floe without a hitch.
Shackleton’s statement reveals key characteristics of his leadership competence (D). For instance, hardiness (F), proactive seizing of opportunities (I), planning to safely evacuate the Endurance before it sank (I), and problem solving ability and critical thinking when abandoning his ship. Shackleton also wrote (republished 2004, p. 74):

Tonight the temperatures had dropped to -16° Fahr., and most of the men are cold and uncomfortable. After the tents had been pitched I mustered all hands and explained the position to them briefly and, I hope, clearly. I have told them the distance to the Barrier and the distance to Paulet Island, and have stated that I propose to try to march with equipment across the ice in the direction of Paulet Island. I thanked the men for the steadiness and good morale they have shown in these trying circumstances, and told them I had no doubt that, provided they continued to work their utmost and to trust me, we will all reach safety in the end.

The writer believes this statement shows Shackleton’s leadership competence with engaging his crew as a “First-class noticer” (G) by recognising and harnessing their high morale in the face of serious obstacles besetting them. His effective leadership is attributed by Morrell and Capparell (2001, p. 4) as being the main reason why everyone survived the expedition. “Credit Shackleton” (p. 4).

Thirdly, in a keynote speech given by Apollo 13 Mission Commander James Lovell (2004) said:

There is something that I had learned in the space program based on what I am about to say that I took with me from the public sector into the private sector: always expect the unexpected. When everything is going right, when everything looks rosy, when nothing is wrong, it’s always nice to look ahead to see if there are symptoms coming down that maybe are pending of a possible crisis.

This writer interprets that Lovell’s statement defines his leadership capabilities in Bennis & Thomas’ (2002) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 57) as ‘Adaptive Capacity’ (E) and ‘Hardiness’ (F). This writer understands that Lovell’s leadership competencies were initially learnt in his naval career as a pilot and later developed while he was a NASA Astronaut. It is interesting that NASA management attribute effective leadership at Mission Control and in the Apollo 13 spacecraft was the primary reason why the three Astronauts survived and safely returned to earth.

---

47 Italicsised in source

48 “Lessons learnt from Apollo 13” to NASA’s Symposium on Risk Evaluation in Monterey, California on 26th September 2004.

49 Italicsised by this writer for emphasis
Summary

In summary, this section has discussed the essence of experiential learning from the perspective of how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability. In the first theme, it was shown crucibles can be grouped into three broad categories, which suggests how they influence the development of leadership capability. Firstly, through rapidly acquiring knowledge to make sense of ambiguous situations. Secondly, coping with loss to endure hardship. Thirdly, reflectively thinking about experiences to understand one’s leadership calling, character, and competence.

The next main theme emerged in discussion about how crucibles stimulate leader’s experiential learning through reflectively thinking about their experiences. This showed the experiential learning process of reflective thinking develops clear perspectives about how to handle crucibles, and prepares leaders’ readiness for, and response to future situations. This theme leads the writer to believe in the significant potential that crucibles provide for developing leadership capability through the experiential learning process of reflective thinking.

The most significant theme emerged in Bennis and Thomas’ (2002, p. 89) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 57) which promotes clear understanding about how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability through reflective thinking. This model provides two significant benefits. Firstly, a clear construct for mentors to examine specific areas to develop leadership capability. Secondly, a logical foundation for further research to examine how crucibles influence the development of leadership capability through the experiential learning process of reflective thinking. The next section will define what experiential learning is and will then outline the significant role played by the experiential learning process of reflective thinking in the development of leadership capability.
Chapter Three: Experiential Learning

Experiential Learning

According to Dewey (1916, p. 140) experiential learning is an action oriented process of experimentation and discovery that influences people’s intellectual development, sense of destiny and self-discipline:

To learn from experience is to make backward and forward connections between what we do to things and what we enjoy or suffer from things in consequence. Under such conditions, doing becomes a trying, an experiment with the world to find out what it is like; the undergoing becomes instructions - discovery of the connections of things … there is no discipline in the world so severe as the discipline of experience subjected to the tests of intelligent development and direction.

During his career, Dewey (1938, p. 25) argue “All genuine education comes about through experience” (Dewey 1938, p. 44) which this writer interprets being more a journey of personal discovery than a finite destination:

As an individual passes from one situation to another, his world, his environment, expands or contracts. He does not find himself living in another world but in a different part of aspect of one and the same world. What he has learned in the way of knowledge and skill in one situation becomes an instrument of understanding and dealing effectively with the situations which follow. The process goes on as long as life and learning continue … the environment, in other words, is whatever conditions interact with personal needs, desires, purposes, and capacities to create the experience which is had.

These statements from Dewey lead this writer to interpret experiential learning is really an ongoing process and leads him to question “What insights can be learnt from Dewey’s definitions?” Answers to this question arise from two sources. Firstly, Boud, Cohen, and Walker (1993, p. 6), whose work is similar to Dewey’s, state “For Dewey, experience is not simply an event which happens; it is an event with meaning.” Secondly, Lewis and Williams (1994) argue that “Experiential learning means learning from experience or learning by doing. Experientially learning first immerses adult learners in an experience and then encourages reflection about their experience which develops new skills, attitudes and new ways of thinking”.

From the perspective of his lecturing role, this writer interprets experiential learning is principally about reflectively thinking about what one’s crucibles mean. Or as stated by Boud and Walker (1991, p. 18), where “Each learner forms part of the milieu, enriching it with his or her personal contribution and creating an interaction which becomes the individual as well as the shared learning experience”. This statement leads this writer to

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Survivial” Experiences”
believe that developing insights through the experiential learning process of reflecting about crucibles plays a significant role in the development of leadership calling, character, and competence.

This belief leads the writer to ponder “What propositions and implications can be drawn from reflectively learning from experience?” Boud, Cohen, and Walker (1993, pp. 8 – 18) argue that learning from experience is usually a five stage process. Firstly, experience is the foundation of, and the stimulus for learning. Every experience is potentially an opportunity to learn something new or relearn something. Secondly, learners actively construct their experience and each experience is influenced by the unique past of the learner. Thirdly, learning tends to be a holistic process. In other words, one feature of learning may be prominent at any particular time, however all learning involves feelings and emotions (affective), the intellectual and cerebral (cognitive) and action (conative) which interact in unpredictable ways. Fourth, learning is socially and culturally constructed which means when learners construct their own experience, they do this within the context of a particular social setting and a range of cultural values. Finally, learning is influenced by the socio-emotional context in which it occurs and where two key sources of influence exist. For instance, past and present crucibles.

Moreover, past experiences tend to create expectations that develop a leader’s present paradigms which are usually influenced by their present socio-emotional context in how they approach their crucibles. For example, their expectations about what can and cannot be done with their new knowledge. Also, the present context can be used to reinforce or counterbalance this and how people interpret their crucibles is usually intimately connected with their degree of self-awareness. Overall, the main theme emerging from this section is that learning from crucibles is usually triggered by the experiential learning process of reflective thinking.

Reflection

A recurring theme arising in discussion throughout this thesis concerned the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about crucibles and what they mean. Dewey (1933, p. 9) was interested in this phenomenon and argued that reflective thought is:
Active, persistent, and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in the light of the rounds that support it and further conclusions to which it leads ... it includes a conscious and voluntary effort to establish belief upon a firm basis of residence and rationality.

According to Boud, Cohen, and Walker (1993, p. 19) the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about learning is “Those intellectual and affective activities in which individuals engage to explore their experiences in order to lead to new understandings and appreciations.” Freire (1970) frequently used the term “Conscientization” to examine and reference reflecting thinking. He later defined this as “The process by which one’s false consciousness becomes transcended through education”, which this writer interprets to mean that reflective thinking tends to start out as a virtual learning process whose end is consolidated by further education. Furthermore, Mezirow (1981, p. 3), argued that “Critical reflectivity” plays a part in adult experiential learning. He also argued that six forms of reflectivity exist in people’s “Ordinary consciousness” as defined below:

Reflectivity\(^{50}\) is the act of becoming aware of a specific view, meaning or behaviour, of our own or of habits we have of seeing, thinking or acting; affective reflectivity is becoming aware of how we feel about the way we are noticing, thinking or acting or about our habits of doing so. Discriminant reflectivity is assessing the efficacy of our perceptions, thoughts, actions and habits of doing things: identifying immediate causes: recognizing reality contexts (a plan, game, dream, or religious, musical or drug experience, etc) in which we are functioning and identifying our relationships in the situation. There is also judgemental reflectivity, which is making and becoming aware of our value judgements about our perceptions, thoughts, actions and habits in terms of their being liked or disliked, beautiful or ugly, positive or negative. There are also forms of reflectivity which pertain particularly to perspective transformation and to our critical consciousness. Conceptual reflectivity is becoming conscious of our awareness and critiquing it as, for example, when we question the constructs we are using when we evaluate another person. Psychic reflectivity is recognizing in oneself the habit of making precipitant judgements about people on the basis of limited information about them and recognizing the interests and anticipations which influence the way we perceive, think or act.

The key point emerging in Mezirow’s statement is that the experiential learning process of reflective thinking may take many forms and there is no all-encompassing way for people to reflect on their crucibles. Furthermore, Boud, Keogh, and Walker (1985, p. 19) define reflective thinking as:

An important human activity in which people recapture their experience, think about it, mull it over, and evaluate it. It is this working with experience that is important in learning. The capacity to reflect is developed to different stages in different people and it may be this ability which characterises those who learn effectively from experience.

\(^{50}\)Italicised in source

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrive” Experiences
Mezirow’s statements lead this writer to believe they show how reflective thinking influences how leaders experientially learn. This suggests their learning effectiveness influences their ability to reflectively think about crucibles. To support of this statement, the writer highlights the importance of Boud, Keogh, and Walker’s (1985, p. 21) Reflective Learning Model (Figure 5) which was based on their research about learning processes, and their analysis of Mezirow’s (1981) research. They argue that the learning benefits of the adult experiential learning process of reflective thinking incorporates the:

- Totality of experiences of learners, the behaviour in which they have engaged the ideas of which learners are aware, and the feelings which they have experienced. It examines the results of reflection, which may be a personal synthesis, integration and suitable [application] of knowledge, confirmation of personal knowledge, a new affective state, or the decision to engage in some further activity.

This writer interprets their statement to mean reflective thinking stimulates development of leadership capability because it interprets the meaning of crucibles and transforms them into information that is later stored as personal knowledge to prepare one’s readiness for, and response to future crucibles.

**Figure 5. Reflective Learning Model**

![Reflective Learning Model Diagram](image)

Source: Adapted by this writer from Boud, Keogh, Walker (1985, p. 36)
Dynamics of Reflective Thinking

Within the context of this thesis, Boud, Keogh, and Walker's (1985) Reflective Model (Figure 5, p. 66) is important because it shows that people usually develop behavioural patterns from their ideas and feelings (A) about their life experiences (G). Secondly, when reflecting on their experiences, people are replaying these in their mind (B) and recall their positive and negative feelings about their experience. Furthermore, removing obstructing feelings is psychologically necessary for rational interpretation of their experiences and usually involves expressing their feelings to other people.

This may lead to re-evaluating experiences (B) that are unlikely to be fully understood unless their positive or negative feelings are satisfactorily reconciled with reality. This usually involves reconciling their experience(s) with their learning intent and association of new knowledge with their experiences. This will enable them to develop new perspectives (C) which will influence how they are likely to handle future crucibles (D). Ultimately, this will trigger behavioural changes (D) as they develop their readiness for and response to future crucibles that are encountered (E).

This writer has adapted Boud, Keogh, and Walker’s (1985) Reflective Learning Model (Figure 5, p. 66) because he believes it infers the relationship between experiences, reflective thinking processes, and outcomes as a linear chain of cognitive processes. In this writer's experience, reflection tends to be an erratic process. To represent this, the writer has added a box titled ‘praxis’ (F) with dotted lines connecting it to the outcomes (I), reflective processes (H), and experiences (G) stages. This is meant to illustrate their non-systematic nature, which he believes does not occur in the sequential manner inferred by Figure 5 (p. 66).

Although the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about crucibles has been upheld as an effective learning process for developing leadership capability, criticisms have also arisen about its learning effectiveness. For instance, Zepke, Nugent, and Leach (2003, p. 25) argue:

1. Our memories of experiences tend to vary because when we reflect on them they usually change in some way.
2. When we reflect on our experiences we usually want to achieve specific purposes which might alter prior conclusions drawn from these experiences according to our immediate needs. This shows that reflective thinking is neither accurate or precise.

3. Some learning experiences provide richer learning experiences than others. Therefore a possibility exists to not automatically reflect on which experience might be more valuable.

4. Individual reflective thinking is usually an account of one’s personal experience. This might potentially lessen the importance of their shared experiences with other people.

5. Reflective thinking tends to be inward looking. This means if we do not actively seek new experiences we might not learn anything new.

6. Learning can develop from our experiences with social classes, gender, or cultural groups. Therefore, membership of groups can set boundaries on the experiences that we choose to reflect on and might restrict the scope of our learning capacity.

According to Zepke, Nugent, and Leach (2003, pp. 17-33), reflective thinking can be categorised in three ways:

1. It enables one to create knowledge from personal experiences.
2. It focuses on one’s external world. Both of these phenomena are rational approaches that consciously focus on developing a specific skill, idea, understanding or behaviour.
3. Meditation is a relatively emotional process that may not lead to immediate action.

This usually removes conscious thoughts from one’s mind and leads one to become more aware of their current state of mind through what this writer terms as ‘relaxed alertness’.

Finally, a concept has recently emerged in the literature about the process of reflective thinking in adult learning from Covey (2011, p. 10). For instance, Covey has developed a ‘See – Do – Get’ Experiential Learning Model that merits discussion here because it not only builds upon the themes outlined earlier.

Covey’s See – Do – Get Experiential Learning Model (Figure 6, p. 69) is based on the premise that people’s paradigms are triggered by their experiences (i.e. crucibles [ed]) which influence their decisions about how they behave and what direction they will proceed in to achieve their vision or goals. For instance, as discussed earlier in this

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
section, crucibles force a leader to cognitively reflect on what this experience personally means to them (i.e. See). This is usually stored as knowledge to use for coping with future situations.

What a leader does with this knowledge (i.e. Do) usually determines the outcomes they achieve (i.e. Get). The reality of achieving outcomes to fulfil their vision or goals may force revision of their paradigms (i.e. See) in an ongoing and cyclic manner. Covey (2011, p. 10) posits: “Our paradigms govern our behaviour, which in turn governs the consequences of our actions. We GET results based on what we DO, and what we Do depends on how we See the world around us.” The writer believes this model infers that if paradigms change, behaviours and results do so too, which provides a powerful catalyst for leadership development.

**Figure 6. See – Do - Get Experiential Learning Model**

![See – Do - Get Experiential Learning Model](image)

*Source: Adapted by this writer from Covey (2011, p. 10)*

Overall, the writer believes this model is important because it shows the process for how crucibles can influence the development of leadership calling, character, and competence. Overall, this model builds on the other themes about reflective thinking described earlier in this Chapter and underpins the research results discussed in Chapters Five and Six.

**Summary**

In summary, this section has discussed experiential learning from numerous perspectives, and indicated that experiential learning is an action oriented process of discovery that stimulates the development of leadership capability. A recurring theme emerged about the role played by the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about crucibles and...
what lessons can be drawn from them. This theme is underpinned by Boud, Keogh, and Walker’s (1985) Reflective Learning Model (Figure 5, p. 66) which illustrates the general experiential learning process of reflective thinking usually adopted by people. This writer challenges the model’s inference that people tend to reflect on their experiences in a systematically linear or organised manner, because his experience with reflecting on crucibles has shown this tends to be an erratic process. Therefore, he has adapted the model to show how leaders experientially learn by reflectively thinking in an erratic manner. The next section will examine the contributions to adult experiential learning knowledge made by Mezirow (1978) and Kolb (1984).

**Major Experiential Learning Theories**

Two scholars emerged in the writer’s research as producing the most significant knowledge to the experiential learning literature, Mezirow (1978) and Kolb (1984).

**Mezirow’s Contribution to Experiential Learning Literature**

According to Taylor (1998), Jack Mezirow’s (1978) concept of ‘transformative learning’ has been a “Topic of [considerable] research and theory building in the field of adult education.” Furthermore, the Transformative Learning Centre (2004) defines transformative learning as “A deep, structural shift in basic premises of thought, feelings, and actions”. In the writer’s view this statement implies significant shifts influence one’s paradigm about their world, which is highlighted in the following statement by Mezirow (1991a, p. 167):

> For learners to change their “meaning schemes (specific beliefs, attitudes, and emotional reactions), they must engage in critical reflection on their experiences, which in turn leads to a perspective transformation. Perspective transformation is the process of becoming critically aware of how and why our assumptions have come to constrain the way we perceive, understand, and feel about our world; changing these structures of habitual expectation to make possible a more inclusive, discriminating, and integrating perspective; and finally, making choices or otherwise acting upon these new understandings.

This writer believes Mezirow’s (1991a) statement is accurate because he has frequently noticed his adult students do not appear to consciously think about what they are learning while they are learning. They usually seem to be engrossed with interpreting how they are
feeling about what they are learning. Conversely, this writer has also noticed sometimes that when his adult students focus on what\textsuperscript{51} they are learning; this sometimes constrains their thinking about how\textsuperscript{52} they are learning. Particularly if their learning experience is fully engaging all of their senses. The opposite seems to hold if adult’s learning experiences are not totally engaging their senses.


These theorists’ ideas are significant because they underpin the Transformative Learning Elements (Table 2) that include dilemmas, meaning schemes, meaning perspectives, perspective transformation, frame of reference, levels of learning processes, habits of mind, and critical self-reflection.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influences</th>
<th>Transformative Learning Elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kuhn’s (1962) paradigm</td>
<td>Perspective transformation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frame of reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meaning perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Habit of mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freire’s (1970) “Conscientization”</td>
<td>Disorienting dilemma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Critical self-reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Habit of mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Perspective transformation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meaning scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meaning perspective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Kitchenham (2008, p. 104)

Mezirow (1978a p. 6) also conducted a qualitative study to “Identify reasons that characteristically impede or promote” women’s progress in the [ed: workforce] re-entry programmes. This led him to develop 11 phases of transformational learning (Table 3, p. 72) which was developed from his study of American women returning to post-secondary study or the workplace after an extended period of time away from university or the workforce.

\textsuperscript{51}Italicised by this writer for emphasis
\textsuperscript{52}Italicised by this writer for emphasis

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Over the next two decades Mezirow revised the order of, and added new phases to his 11 phases of Transformational Learning (Table 3) as his research produced new discoveries. However, despite the comprehensiveness of Mezirow’s research, this writer is sceptical about the applicability of his 11 phases (Table 3) to all learning situations. This is because his experiences as a lecturer have shown him that learning processes and the contexts they prevail in tend to be highly situational and variable. Mezirow’s learning phases come across as being too absolute.

In other words, although a learning process may be effective in one learning situation, there is no guarantee that it will work well in another. The writer believes this is probably due to unique factors like student age, experience, teacher’s lecturing style, their age, experience, and the nature of the learning environment.

Furthermore, the writer believes whilst Mezirow’s learning phases listed in Table 3 might be suitable in some circumstances, they may not be suitable in all learning circumstances; nor in the linear manner shown in Table 3.

Table 3. Transformative Learning Phases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A disorienting dilemma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A self-examination with feelings of guilt or shame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>A critical assessment of epistemic, socio-cultural, or psychic assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Recognition that one’s discontent and the process of transformation are shared and that others have negotiated a similar change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Exploration of options for new roles, relationships, and actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Planning of a course of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Acquisition of knowledge and skills for implementing one’s plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Provisional trying of new roles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Renegotiating relationships and negotiating relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Building of competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>A reintegration into one’s life on the basis of conditions dictated by one’s perspective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Kitchenham (2008, p. 105)

Mezirow (1998b) later refined his earlier work on critical reflective thinking (Mezirow, 1995) and created a classification of critical reflective thinking based on assumptions involving two phenomena: Objective Reframing and Subjective Reframing. These are defined by Kitchenham (2008, p. 117) who argues:
Objective reframing is one of two phenomena. First, a narrative critical reflection of assumptions and requires critically examining something that was being communicated to a person. Or second, an action critical reflection of assumptions that requires taking a moment to critically consider one’s own assumptions in a task-oriented problem-solving situation to define the problem itself.

Kitchenham (2008, p. 117) argues that “Subjective reframing is critical self-reflection on, rather than of, assumptions. This can also include one of four forms of critical self-reflection on assumptions. Firstly, Narrative Critical Self-reflection on assumptions is the application of narrative critical reflection of assumptions to oneself. Secondly, Systemic Critical Self-reflection on assumptions is going beyond the action critical reflection of assumptions to self-reflect on the taken-for-granted cultural influences which might be organizational (e.g. workplace) or moral-ethical (e.g. social norms). Thirdly, Therapeutic Critical Self-reflection on assumptions is examining one’s problematic feelings and their related consequences. Finally, Epistemic Critical Self-reflection on assumptions is investigating not only the assumptions but also the causes, the nature, and the consequences of one’s frame of reference to surmise why one is predisposed to learn in a certain manner.

Overall, Mezirow (1998b, p. 197) argued that “Learning to think for oneself involves becoming critically reflective of assumptions and participating in discourse to validate beliefs, intentions, values, and feelings”. This writer tends to agree with Mezirow’s argument, based on his own reflective thinking about his crucibles.

According to Kitchenham (2008, p. 118) Mezirow (2000) later revised his original argument based on the basis that “A meaning perspective is a frame of reference and comprises habits of mind and subsequent points of view. Habits of mind were expanded to include a variety of dimensions: sociolinguistic, moral-ethical, epistemic, philosophical, psychological, and aesthetic”. He argued these perspectives were expressed by teachers as their own points of view, which comprise clusters of meaning schemes, or “Sets of immediate specific expectations, beliefs, feelings, attitudes, and judgments.”

Despite its comprehensiveness, criticisms about Mezirow’s (2000) theory of transformative learning have emerged. For instance, Taylor (1998) suggests that no one way of transformative learning exists. He argues that differences in learning contexts, learners, and teachers all affect the experiences of transformative learning. Also, Cranton

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
(1994) argues that people learn in different but integrated ways, and that educators should not see transformative learning as the only goal of education. However, Taylor (1998) argues Mezirow (2000) places too much emphasis on the role of the teacher at the expense of the learner’s role:

Although it is difficult for transformative learning to occur without the teacher playing a key role, participants also have a responsibility for creating the learning environment. As a part of a community of knowers, learners share the responsibility for constructing and creating the conditions under which transformative learning can occur.

Further debate exists about Mezirow’s (2000) theory of his high emphasis on rationality. For instance, some empirical studies support Mezirow’s (2000) argument that critical reflection underpins transformative learning. However, others declare “Critical reflection is granted too much importance in a perspective transformation, a process too rationally driven” (Taylor, 1998, pp. 33 – 34). This writer therefore believes these views present circular and unanswerable arguments that are unlikely to ever be conclusively resolved.

Kolb’s Contribution to Experiential Learning

The second significant contribution to experiential learning literature is the work of David Kolb. He was heavily influenced by Dewey’s research about adult education principles and researched it so assiduously; he eventually became regarded by education scholars as a significant contributor to adult education in his own right. Kolb (1984, p. 4) argued that “Experiential learning theory offers the foundation for an approach to education and learning as a lifelong process that is soundly based in the intellectual traditions of social psychology, philosophy, and cognitive psychology.” Kolb also argued that “Experiential learning is a lifelong process” and developed the Experiential Learning Cycle (Kolb (1984, p. 4) to show the essence of how experiential learning occurs as a process (Figure 7, p. 75). Moreover, Kolb (1984, p. 4) argued the model is:

A framework for examining and strengthening the critical linkages among education, work and personal development. It offers a system of competencies for describing job demands and corresponding educational objectives and emphasizes the critical linkages that can be developed between the classroom and the “real world” with experiential learning methods. It pictures the workplace as a learning environment that can enhance and supplement formal education and can foster personal development through meaningful work and career development opportunities. And it stresses the role of formal education in lifelong learning and the development of individuals to their full potential as citizens, family members, and human beings.
Chapter Three: Experiential Learning

Figure 7. Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle

As adapted by this writer for clarity, Kolb’s (1984) Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7) has a triangle in the centre whose corners are labelled Personal Development, Work, and Education. These elements indicate areas of people’s lives where they usually learn the most from their life’s experiences. The circular process shown in the middle of the triangle marked (A) is meant to show that adults tend to learn experientially from their life experiences in a cyclic manner within the areas of Personal Development, Work, and Education. This phenomenon is defined by Zepke, Nugent and Leach (2003, p. 32) as “Constructivism”, which is a form of experiential learning where learners take an active role in developing meaning from their life experiences. The writer believes this also includes the process of reflective thinking.
For instance, Figure 7 (p. 75) shows learners usually observe things from different perspectives during their learning experiences (1). Then they usually interpret or reflect on their experiences (2) from which they create abstract concepts drawn from generalisations (3). Then they usually apply or test their concepts in new situations, albeit with some adaptation where they feel this is necessary (4). This usually triggers another round of experiences (1) that introduces new interpretations (2), produces new concepts and generalisations (3) to use in new emerging situations with more complexity or sophistication (4) in an ongoing manner.

Kolb (1976, pp. 21 – 31) argues that in order for learners to learn effectively, they need four different abilities matching the four stages of his learning cycle: Concrete Experience, Reflective Observation, Abstract Conceptualisation, and Active Experimentation. It is interesting that the main concept underpinning Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) was inspired by Carl Lewin’s Feedback Process (Figure 8) which shows their conceptual similarities with each other.

**Figure 8. Lewin’s Feedback Process**

1. Concrete experience
2. Observations and reflections
3. Formation of abstract concepts and generalizations
4. Testing implications of concepts in new situations


What this writer finds interesting about Lewin’s Feedback Process (Figure 8) is that the second stage (Observations and reflections) is identical to stage 2 (Interpreting/reflecting) in Kolb’s (1984) Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75). This leads the writer to...
believe the presence of stage 2 in this model supports the statement quoted earlier (p. 67) by Boud, Keogh, and Walker (1985, p. 21) about the importance and learning benefits of the reflective learning process on experiences (Figure 5, p. 66).

Although Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) gained wide acceptance from many scholars, this writer ponders “Is it applicable for use in all modern learning practices?” In riposte, Beard and Wilson (2006, p. 39) allege criticism has arisen about experiential learning’s perceived conceptual weaknesses because of its strong linkage with Kolb’s learning cycle (Figure 7, p. 75).

This mainly stems from Miettinen’s (2002, p. 68) assertion that Kolb’s interpretation of Dewey, Lewin and Piaget’s work, on which he based the development of his Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75), is selective and therefore not fully representative of the facts.

Miettinen (2002, p. 68) has analysed, interpreted and reconciled Dewey’s work with Kolb’s work. He believed that Kolb did not reason the distinction Dewey made between the habit that enables people to behave predictably when faced with challenges and the habit that influences them into behaving without thinking about alternative choices. Beard and Wilson (2006, p. 41) tend to support Miettinen’s view with their argument that:

Much of our lives are spent on automatic pilot, e.g. taking our normal route home after work then realizing after we arrive we cannot remember anything other than the work problem we were contemplating. We just do not think, never mind reflect on the many of the actions that we undertake. This is a natural process that prevents our conscious brains becoming overwhelmed with all the things that we need to think about, However, it is not included in Kolb’s learning cycle.

This writer agrees with Beard and Wilson’s (2006, p. 41) statement, because he has observed the rapid pace and ambiguous nature of modern life often compel him to spend some time on what he euphemistically defines as “automatic pilot”. In other words, not consciously thinking specifically about what he is doing, why, how, when, where, who for, or considering the consequences for that matter. Miettinen (2002, p. 68) also argues that:

- Kolb’s learning cycle also does not show [that] empirical (i.e. experiential) thinking based on action has three limits:
  1. It may result in false conclusions.
  2. It may not help us understand and explain change and new experiences
  3. It may cause mental laziness and dogmatic thinking.
Although this writer believes Miettinen’s assertions about limitations with Kolb’s Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) might be apt for most learning contexts, it is not unreasonable to assume they may not be suitable for all. Therefore, this writer believes Kolb’s learning cycle is not necessarily flawed because he believes that models are seldom appropriate for all situational contexts. Further criticism stems from Holman et al., (1997, p. 145) who disagree with Kolb’s concept of progressing sequentially through his Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) because:

The four stages of the cycle are independent and represent dualism or dialectic opposites, e.g. active experimentation and reflective observation … learning can be considered as a process of argumentation in which thinking, reflecting, experiencing and action are different aspects of the same process. It is practical argumentation with oneself and in collaboration with others that actually forms the basis for learning … emotion and individual differences play a significant role in the ability to learn.

This writer disagrees with Holman et al’s., (1997) criticism because he believes Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) stages are interdependently linked in a stimulus and response relationship, which means they are likely to be erratic in nature. Moreover, the allegations from Miettinen (2002) and Holman et al., (1997) infer Kolb’s (1984) Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) is more theoretical in its orientation than practical for everyday use. Also, Beard and Wilson (2006, p. 41) argue:

Kolb’s learning cycle can be regarded as a minimalist interpretation of the complex operations of the brain and therefore it is not surprising that this model is somewhat limited in describing the learning process. This model provides an accessible structure that is both understandable and applicable, and yet possesses an immense menu upon which to design experiential activities.

This writer agrees with Beard and Wilson’s (2006) contention for three reasons. Firstly, the simplicity of Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) encourages a visually clear and readily understandable perspective of the general adult experiential learning process. Secondly, this writer recalls the most significant lessons learned in his own life have occurred in a similar way to that showed by Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75). Finally, this writer consciously uses Kolb’s (1984) Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) as a process to develop and facilitate lessons for his students in his lecturing role.
Chapter Three: Experiential Learning

This strategy usually achieves consistently high student engagement and gets positive feedback from most of his students about their learning experiences. Therefore this writer tends to agree with the final sentence of Beard and Wilson’s (2006, p. 41) argument: “This model provides an accessible structure that is both understandable and applicable, and yet possesses an immense menu upon which to design experiential activities.”

Overall, although it was published nearly 30 years ago, and despite the criticisms levelled at it, this writer believes Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle (Figure 7, p. 75) is a reliable process widely used in adult experiential learning praxis for many adult learning situations. Furthermore, it is likely to be used for many years to come.

Summary

In summary, this section has examined the contributions made to adult experiential learning literature by Mezirow (1978) and Kolb (1984). A theme emerging from Mezirow’s work is about the value of transformative learning, which is the cognitive process consciously adopted by an individual to understand the essence of problems and the truth of alternative solutions for them. Another theme emerged from Kolb’s research that experiential learning theory is a lifelong journey underpinned by elements of social psychology, philosophy, and cognitive psychology. Overall, based on the themes emerging from both scholars, this writer is led to believe that experiential learning is a reliable life-long process for developing leadership capability. The next section will discuss research recently undertaken to understand how New Zealand leaders develop their leadership capability by reflecting on their formative experiences (i.e. crucibles).

Recent New Zealand Research in Leader’s Formative Learning Experiences

This section discusses research recently undertaken to understand how New Zealand leaders develop their leadership capability by reflecting on their formative experiences (i.e. crucibles). The research in Leadership Formative Experiences (LFE’s) published by Janson (2008) define LFE’s as “Experiences that make a high impact on leaders resulting in learning relevant to their leadership”.

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
This writer believes conceptual similarities exist between Janson’s (2008) research and Bennis and Thomas’ (2002) Leadership Development Model (Figure 4, p. 54) because they both focus on the transformational nature of how and what leaders learn from their crucibles.

Janson produced categories and examples of LFE’s that emerged from her research (Table 4). For instance as cross referenced to Table 4, out of 66 respondents interviewed, 76% of LFE’s occurred during their adulthood, 40% occurred while identifying self-improvement opportunities (A), 33% occurred while coping with struggle (B), 13% occurred in personal relationship role models (C), 5% occurred in parental/symbolic relationships (D), 8% occurred as a natural process supporting the Born Leader (trait theory) view (E), and only 1% occurred through identifying with a cause (F).

### Table 4. Leadership Formative Experience Types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>LFE Type (% response)</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Self improvement (40%)</td>
<td>Included an element of striving to challenge oneself (and/or challenge but not adversity, except in slight degree, e.g. taking time out for mid-life academic study to fulfil dream)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Coping with struggle (33%)</td>
<td>Included an element of adversity (e.g. dealing with a difficult boss)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Personal relationship role models (13%)</td>
<td>Where one or more role models was prominent in the formative experience (e.g. subject was developed by admired leaders)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Parental/symbolic relationship (5%)</td>
<td>Included instances where the relationship with parents was prominent in the formative experience (e.g. wanting to prove to his mother that he would amount to something, unlike his father)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Natural process (8%)</td>
<td>Subjects have naturally or without conscious effort taken leadership or had leadership thrust upon them, often for reasons they were unsure of (e.g. individual naturally takes charge as a child when self or older cousins get lost)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Alignment with a cause (1%)</td>
<td>Showed evidence of being partly driven by serving a particular cause (e.g. indigenous empowerment)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Adapted from Janson (2008, p. 82)**

The writer believes two main themes emerge from Janson’s research results. Firstly, the high proportion (40%) of LFE’s arising in self-improvement opportunities. The writer believes this shows reflective thinking builds self-awareness of one’s leadership capabilities. Secondly, the high proportion (33%) of LFE’s arising from coping with struggle. The writer believes this shows leaders learn a great deal about themselves when
they struggle with crucibles. Janson’s research also shows that through building storytelling capability, leaders can integrate their experience with new learning and increase their accrued leadership knowledge. Furthermore, only five out of 198 LFE’s (2.5%) were concerned with gaining information from formal leadership development courses. The writer believes this is significant because it shows leaders believe they can learn more about leadership from their crucibles than through learning leadership theory in classroom lessons.

On this moot point, Janson (2008) posits that leadership development courses might have a delayed “Trigger Effect”. In other words, a time lag might exist between the leader’s crucible and their actions based on the information they gain from experiencing it. Janson also believes there could be a “Psychological Tipping Impact Mechanism” that forces a critical mass of information to reach into a leader’s consciousness. In other words, leaders will learn through absorbing a critical mass of information from their crucibles.

Furthermore, Janson opines that a leadership development programme is likely to be more successful in shaping and transforming formative leadership experiences into changed leadership performance if it includes activities that stimulate reflective thinking. Jason’s statement resonates with Boud, Cohen, and Walker’s (1993, p. 19) statement about the totality of the experiential learning process of reflective thinking for learning (p. 63).

Overall, this writer believes three significant insights emerge from Janson’s (2008) research. Firstly, despite their subjectivity, LFE’s offer significant potential to provide leaders with a self-directed means of improving their leadership capability with a low need for support. This view is supported by the research of Daniel Pratt (1988) who argued that most adult learning experiences are situational, therefore adult learners are more likely to behave differently in different learning situations. For example, Janson’s statement that LFE’s provide a self-directed means of learning that needs a low need for support as shown by quadrant 4 on Pratt’s (1988) model of Adult Learning Readiness in Figure 9 (p. 82). This model is adapted by the writer into four quadrants to show how the experiential learning process of adult learning moves from a position of high need for direction and support (Quadrant 1) to a low need for direction and support (Quadrant 4). Overall, this shows a learner’s degree of learning dependency on a tutor.
Secondly, encouraging reflective thinking and discussion on LFE’s encourages more sense to be made of one’s crucibles through reflective thinking, which this writer believes is beneficial to developing leadership capability. Finally, reflecting on and discussing personal experiences is a LFE in its’ own right that can enrich development of leadership capability.

**Summary**

In summary, this section has examined the research recently undertaken by Janson (2008) to better understand how New Zealand leaders develop their leadership capability through reflective thinking about their Leadership Formative Experiences (i.e. crucibles). The main theme emerging from Janson’s (2008) research is that when leaders reflectively think about their crucibles in a self-directed manner, this process usually helps them to more effectively develop their leadership capability than through comparatively orthodox learning about leadership theory in classroom lessons. This writer believes both
approaches have pros and cons from a learning praxis perspective, therefore a blended approach using the best attributes of both would probably provide optimal approaches for developing leadership capability.

**Conclusions**

In conclusion, this chapter has examined what is generally understood about adult experiential learning in a leadership context. Five main themes have emerged. Firstly, crucibles were grouped into three broad categories in terms of how they influence the development of leadership capability. This is usually through acquiring knowledge to make sense of ambiguous circumstances, coping with personal loss to endure hardship, and reflectively thinking about these. This writer believes these may lead one to better understand their leadership calling.

Secondly, crucibles stimulate an experiential learning process that influences leaders to reflectively think about what their crucibles mean and develop new paradigms to prepare their readiness for, and response to future crucibles. This supports the notion that crucibles stimulate the development of leadership capability.

Thirdly, a recurring theme arose about the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about what crucibles actually mean. The Reflective Learning Model (Figure 5, p. 66) by Boud, Keogh, and Walker (1985) leads the writer to believe people do not usually learn or reflect on their experiences in a linear or organised manner, but erratically.

Fourth, the examination of contributions to adult experiential learning literature by Mezirow (1978) and Kolb (1984) highlighted two main themes. Firstly, Mezirow’s work argued for the value of transformative learning; the cognitive process that individuals adopt to check the essence of problems and the truth value of alternative solutions to resolve them. Secondly, Kolb argued experiential learning is a lifelong journey underpinned by elements of social psychology, philosophy, and cognitive psychology in an ongoing manner. The writer believes both themes support the notion that experiential learning is essentially an ongoing phenomenon, and is therefore an effective approach for developing leadership capability.
Fifth, primary research undertaken by Janson (2008) to understand how New Zealand leaders develop their leadership capability indicated that leaders usually reflectively think about their crucibles in an independent manner. Janson (2008) also argued reflective thinking is a more effective approach for developing leadership capability than orthodox leadership training facilitated in a classroom. Janson’s (2008) research raises a moot point that development of leadership capability through orthodox classroom training may not be as effective as experientially learning it from crucibles outside a classroom. This writer euphemistically calls this classroom the “University of Life”.

Overall, this writer interprets the main themes emerging in this Chapter indicate the experiential learning process of reflectively thinking about crucibles is a more effective way of developing leadership calling, character, and competence than the comparatively orthodox approach of learning leadership in a classroom lesson. Metaphorically speaking, the former is like watching a movie; the latter is akin to looking at a still photograph. The difference is that profound. The next Chapter will explain the Primary Research Design developed for this thesis.
CHAPTER FOUR: PRIMARY RESEARCH DESIGN

Introduction

The purpose of this Chapter is to explain the research design developed for this thesis to examine the truth about how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ leadership calling, character, and competence. To start with, an outline is given about basic research methodologies used by most researchers today. This will be followed by discussion about how research methods were used to achieve this thesis’ research purpose. Discussion will then explain how data analysis was undertaken to achieve the primary research purpose of this thesis which will be followed with a recap about the Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3) that formed its genesis. Finally, this leads to discussion about elements comprising the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) that was developed to achieve this thesis’ primary research purpose.

Basic Research Designs

According to Hair et al., (2003, p. 57) most researchers usually choose from three basic research design categories: Exploratory, Descriptive, or Causal designs which will be briefly discussed next.

Firstly, exploratory research is particularly suitable when researched phenomena is ambiguous, or if there is little information or theory available to start research from. In such cases, when researchers find it challenging to make a robust statement of the research problem, they may develop an exploratory research design to gain a better understanding of what conceptual position to start their research from. This category outlines the primary research approach adopted by this thesis. Exploratory research can take many forms. For instance, writing a literature review to develop a better understanding of some issues. Focus groups are one of the most widely used exploratory interview techniques today where probing questions are used to identify the hidden reasons for phenomena. Another example is an interview between a trained interviewer and a carefully chosen respondent with a specific research focus. Finally, the Delphi technique is another approach where an
Chapter Four: Primary Research Design

interviewer seeks the knowledge of an expert or panel of experts to help the research achieve its objectives.

Secondly, descriptive research describes phenomena by analysing and measuring data with descriptive statistics like standard deviation, median, mode, and mean. Typical approaches to analysing statistics include ranking data from high to low strength, frequency counts of how many times phenomena occurs, cross-classifications of elements, or the correlations between entities. Descriptive research designs are usually designed to measure the characteristics described in a research question. For instance, hypotheses drawn from theory usually serve to guide the research process and provide a list of what is to be examined.

Data collection might include structured interviews, perhaps using a questionnaire that asks respondents to select from various options. Often, descriptive studies may be used to provide researchers with a snapshot of phenomena at a given point in time to provide cross-sectional data for later analysis. Researchers might survey business phenomena to describe a population’s characteristics and take measurements by using a questionnaire. Longitudinal studies are often used to sample and describe how events change over time. This usually involves regular gathering of data from the same respondents to detect trends in phenomena.

Finally, causal research is usually the most intricate research approach because it is principally designed to test and determine if one event causes another, or if a change in one event triggers change in another event. Causality is usually determined with experiments where a researcher controls a potential cause and notes any changes in hypothesised effects. Control is carried out by experimentally manipulating a causal variable that is altered in different research scenarios.

Researchers often choose from two experimental types. Firstly, laboratory experiments, which manipulate a hypothesised causal variable within an artificial setting. An artificial setting provides the researcher with maximum control and enables laboratory experiments to be scientifically precise. Secondly, a field experiment which is undertaken in a natural setting to provide a greater opportunity for field experiment respondents to be representative of a sampled population.

*Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences*
Research Methodology and Method

A research methodology is the philosophical rationale or assumptions underpinning research, which according to Neuman (2006, p. 2) is “Broader than methods and [also] envelope[s] methods”. In other words, a research methodology is a research strategy and is distinctly different from, and often confused with the role of a research method.

According to Neuman (2006, p. 2) research methods are “Sets of specific techniques for selecting cases, measuring and observing aspects of social life, gathering and refining data, analysing the data, and reporting on results”. In other words, a research method defines the tactical activities that attend to the detailed data analysis and interpretation.

Overall, a research methodology defines the strategy for undertaking research, whilst a research method defines the tactical tasks to gather and process research data within the scope of the (strategic) research methodology. Principally, there are three main research methodologies, to choose from. These are quantitative and qualitative research and what is commonly referred to as a ‘mixed’ methodology that comprises both quantitative and qualitative research methodologies within one research design. These methodologies will be discussed next.

Quantitative Research

In quantitative research according to Hair et al., (2003, p. 419), “Numbers are used directly to represent the properties of something”. This suggests quantitative researchers mainly focus on issues of design, measurement, and sampling, and adopt a deductive approach that involves detailed planning for the collection and analysis of research data.

According to Neuman (2006, p. 181) quantitative researchers “Contemplate and reflect on concepts before they gather any data” and “construct measurement techniques that bridge concepts and data.” Also, according to Davis (2005, p. 307), the nature and potential applications of quantitative research include:

Being driven by an objective to quantify characteristics or behaviour of phenomena with a structured approach, using a large sample size (i.e. greater than 12 research respondents), requiring low to moderate interviewer skill, in relatively short interviews that last around 30 minutes.
To complement the predominantly qualitative primary research data gathered to satisfy the primary research purpose of this thesis, the writer decided that it would be appropriate for a basic quantitative research approach be adopted to determine the comparative frequency\(^{53}\) of leadership concepts arising in a percentile capacity. This is shown in Appendix 2.

Furthermore, it was not a research objective to determine the dynamic cause and effect\(^{54}\) nature of relationships that might exist between independent and dependent variables in the research data. Therefore the Chi Squared research method that would ordinarily be adopted to achieve this was deemed inappropriate by the writer to use in this thesis. Perhaps this could be adopted in future research.

**Qualitative Research**

The other main research methodology researchers can choose from to undertake their research is qualitative research. For the variety of reasons expressed in the statements that follow, this writer decided to adopt a primarily qualitative research approach supplemented with quantitative research. This decision is influenced in part by Neuman (2006, pp. 179 – 181) who argues that qualitative researchers:

> Develop ways to capture and express concepts using various alternatives to numbers. They often take an inductive approach, creating new concepts as part of measuring … Data for qualitative researchers sometimes is in the form of numbers; more often, it includes written or spoken words, actions, sounds, symbols, physical objects, or visual images (e.g. maps, photographs, videos, etc). The qualitative researcher does not convert all observation into a single, common medium such as numbers. Instead, he or she develops many flexible, constant processes that leave the data in various shapes, sizes, and forms … Qualitative researchers also reflect on ideas before data collection, but they develop many, if not most, of their concepts during data collection … re-examines and reflects on the data and concepts simultaneously and interactively.

Also, Ghauri and Gronhaugh (2005, p. 202) argue that “Qualitative research is relevant when prior insights about a phenomenon under scrutiny are modest, which implies qualitative research tends to be exploratory and flexible because of unstructured problems (due to modest insights.” However, Neuman (2006, p. 157) gives a fuller appreciation of what qualitative researchers do:

---

\(^{53}\) Italicised by this writer for emphasis

\(^{54}\) Italicised by this writer for emphasis

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Qualitative researchers employ bricolage, examine social processes in their social context, and look at interpretations of creating meaning in specific settings. They borrow ideas from the people they study and place them within the context of a natural setting. They examine ideas instead of variables, and they adopt the inductive approach of Grounded Theory.

These statements suggest qualitative research mainly examines unpredictable or ambiguous phenomena that are not usually defined with accurate empirical evidence, and are described by the researcher to make sense of it all. This leads the writer to ponder whether qualitative research can be categorised or not. Tesch (1990, pp. 72 - 73) proposes it can and that four categories of qualitative research exist.

Firstly, by their interests in characteristics of language, for example, discourse analysis. Secondly, by discovery of regularities, for example through grounded theory, critical research, or ethnography. Thirdly, by detecting meaning, for example through phenomenology, case study research, or hermeneutics which underpins the primary research approach adopted for this thesis. Finally, by thinking reflectively through reflective phenomenology or heuristic research.

**Mixed Research Methodology**

The previous two sections individually outlined characteristics of quantitative and qualitative research, which are the main research methodologies available to researchers. To recap, this thesis is undertaking social research about leaders which presented a diverse array of quantitative and qualitative phenomena to study. This is typified by Neuman (2006, p. 150) who argues “All social researchers systematically collect and analyse empirical data and carefully examine the patterns in them to understand and explain social life.” Furthermore, this writer’s decision about which optimal research methodology should be adopted by this thesis was complicated. This is exemplified by Neuman’s (2006, p. 151) argument that:

> All social researchers systematically collect and analyse empirical data and carefully examine the patterns in them to understand and explain social life. One of the differences between the two styles comes from the nature of the data. *Soft data*\(^{55}\), in the form of impressions, words sentences, photos, symbols … dictate different research strategies and data collection techniques than *hard data*\(^{56}\), in the form of numbers.

---

\(^{55}\) Italicised in source document

\(^{56}\) Italicised in source document

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”

89
Furthermore, according to Neuman (2006, p. 150) other differences exist that may complicate the social researcher’s decision about which research methodology to adopt:

People who judge qualitative research by standards of quantitative research are often disappointed, and vice versa … Qualitative researchers often rely on interpretive or critical social science. They apply “logic in practice” and follow a nonlinear research path. Qualitative researchers speak a language of “cases and contexts.” … Most quantitative researchers rely on a positivist approach to social science. They apply “reconstructed logic,” and follow a linear research path. They speak a language of “variables and hypotheses.”

Consequently, this writer believes the more one reconciles the differences between quantitative and qualitative research methodologies, the greater the potential to not appreciate or misunderstand the potential synergies that exist between them. This belief has support from several scholars. For instance, Hair et al., (2003, p. 76) posits:

Some researchers debate the superiority of qualitative research over quantitative research or vice versa. However, this view is near-sighted. A comparison of the two approaches suggests that they complement each other very well. Qualitative techniques are more often part of an exploratory design. Thus, a very important alliance between the two is that qualitative studies may develop ideas that can be tested with some type of quantitative approach. Effective decision-making often requires input from both quantitative and qualitative data.

The main idea expressed here is that although both research methodologies differ in concept and research praxis, they are also complementary and provide a discursive array of data that assists effective decision-making. This writer interprets this to mean research synergy arises from the synthesis of differences that exist between both research methodologies. Veal (2005, p. 26) supports this statement and argues both research methodologies are becoming more aligned with each other in research praxis:

Although there is a vigorous debate between proponents of qualitative and quantitative research methods, and some researchers are ‘wedded’ to just one approach, it is widely held that the two approaches complement one another and even that quantitative research should be based on initial, exploratory qualitative work. It can be argued that the two approaches are moving together, as computers are increasingly being used to analyse qualitative data.

The writer believes the key point made by Veal (2005) is that advances in computer technology are making it easier to process qualitative research data in a similar way to quantitative research data. In the writer’s view, it is perhaps not surprising that both research methodologies are becoming more aligned with each other in research designs.

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Davis (2005, p. 307) perceives qualitative research from a comparatively holistic perspective with the argument that “Qualitative research should not be viewed as a competitor but rather as a complement to quantitative research.” This writer believes his view also lends support to the previous two statements that both research methodologies complement each other. Finally, Neuman (2006, p. 177) adds weight to the previous statement with the view that:

The qualitative and quantitative distinction is often overdrawn and presented as a rigid dichotomy. Too often adherents of one style of social research judge the other style on the basis of the assumptions and standards of their own style. The quantitative researcher demands to know the variables used and the hypothesis tested. The qualitative researcher balks at turning humanity into cold numbers. The well-versed, prudent social researcher understands and appreciates each style on its own terms and recognises the strengths and imitations of each. The ultimate goal of developing a better understanding and explanation of the social world comes from an appreciation of what each has to offer.

Overall, this writer accepts the key theme emerging from the previous three statements that the non-numeric nature of qualitative research complements the numerate focus of quantitative research in a thesis and antithetical sense. The synthesis of both research methods used together can provide more discursive insights about the underpinning truth in primary research data than if one research methodology was used. This form of research led the writer’s decision to adopt a mixed research methodology approach to process interview data gathered for this thesis.

Summary

In summary, this section has discussed three basic research design methods used by most researchers today. These are generally known as quantitative (numerically oriented research) and qualitative (non-numeric research) approaches, and the mixed research methodology which comprises both research approaches. The theme emerged that qualitative and quantitative research data are complementary and are becoming more so due to advances in computer technology. Moreover, when research data is processed by both research methodologies, the resultant output tends to assist decision making because of its discursive and deep examination of phenomena.

Furthermore, the primary research data gathered for this thesis led this writer to determine that a qualitative approach to the research, using phenomenological case studies was a
suitable approach to process the qualitative interview data gathered. Closer inspection of the research data suggested that a quantitative research approach was also needed to identify the frequency of leadership concepts and their relationships existing within the data. This led the writer’s decision to adopt a mixed research methodology. The next section will discuss how research methods were used to accomplish the research objectives of this thesis.

Research Methods

This section starts with discussion about the essence of the research investigation adopted for this thesis and will be followed with identification of the primary and secondary data sources. Then an explanation is given about how data was triangulated, which is followed by analysis of the respondents’ demographics. Discussion will then focus on describing the instance of data saturation that occurred, and will also describe how comments from the respondents’ interview data will be referenced in Chapter Six. Then how the primary research data was validated will be discussed. Finally, Yin’s (1994, p. 37) criteria for achieving data reliability will underpin discussion about the software applications used by this writer to process primary research data (Appendix 1).

Research Investigation

To achieve the primary research purpose of this thesis (Figure 2, p. 4), this writer decided to adopt a predominantly qualitative case-study approach, supported with rudimentary quantitative analysis of the interview data. This decision was mainly influenced by several scholars. First, Yin’s (1994) assertion that “the case-study approach enables researchers to explore a leader’s personal experiences within the context of their unique environment and circumstances”. Second, Ghauri and Gronhaugh (2005, p. 202) argue that:

Qualitative research is relevant when prior insights about a phenomenon under scrutiny are modest, implying that qualitative research tends to be exploratory and flexible because of ‘unstructured’ problems (due to modest insights).
Their statement about the exploratory and flexible nature of qualitative research appeals to this writer as an optimal research method mainly because of the spontaneous nature of crucibles and more specifically, their influence on development of leadership capability.

**Research Data Sources**

According to Cooper and Emory (1995, p. 240) primary data comes from “Original sources and are collected especially to answer our research question.” Primary data for this thesis was sourced from interviews with a sample of 20 Northland community leaders. This writer transformed the raw interview data into information to answer the primary research question of this thesis (Figure 2, p. 4). Secondary data, according to Hair et al., (2003, p. 72) is “Data that have been collected for some other research purpose. Secondary data may still address the research question at hand”. This writer sourced secondary data from a wide variety of sources that included the internet, emails, books, magazines, newspapers, videos, DVD’s, radio, television programmes, libraries, journal articles, company reports, conference presentations and discussions with fellow lecturers and researchers.

**Research Data Triangulation**

This writer triangulated interview transcripts by sending a typewritten copy of each transcript to each interviewee by email. Overall, 17 (85%) of the respondents confirmed the accuracy of their interview transcript via email contact with this writer. Unfortunately, three (15%) respondents did not respond to this writer’s repeated requests for confirmation of their quality assurance. The writer ceased attempts to contact the leaders beyond a third request, to avoid generating nuisance value and preserve the significant goodwill developed by this research.

**Research Sample Demographics**

As shown in Table 5 (p. 95), this writer interviewed a research sample size of 20 Northland community leaders to gather data. The age range of eligible respondents was set at a minimum of 20 years of age, with no maximum age threshold set. To remove as
much research bias as possible, the respondents could be male or female, of any race, religious faith, organisation, political, or community group.

Overall, other than the minimum age there were no other limitations or criteria imposed on the respondents. Table 5 (p. 95) shows 12 (60%) of the respondents interviewed were female and eight (40%) were male. Also, 13 (42%) of the respondents worked in a Community or non-profit volunteer role, 11 (35%) worked in Commercial roles, and seven (23%) worked for local councils.

The respondents’ tenure in Northland ranged from one month to 55 years which equates to a median of 31 years tenure overall. Interview durations averaged just over two hours each and had a high skewness. This tends to indicate that interviews were generally of a longer duration with a comparatively low Standard Deviation of 38.3 minutes on a mean of 131 minutes, which shows low variance in the length of interview durations. Overall, the writer interprets the results to show respondents’ strong personal engagement with the writer during their interviews.
Chapter Four: Primary Research Design

Table 5. Research sample demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Narrator Code</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Work Sector</th>
<th>Northland Tenure (Years)</th>
<th>Commercial Council</th>
<th>Community Minutes</th>
<th>Interview Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 PS</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2 CN</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3 CT</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4 VC</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5 TV</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6 TA</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7 LQ</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8 RM</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>9 HW</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 AM</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>11 PR</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12 TM</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>13 JT</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14 AS</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15 SM</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>16 RT</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>17 AK</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>18 AJ</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>19 KB</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>20 MJ</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Northland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td>8 12 645 11 7 13 2,615 43.58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Theoretical Data Saturation

According to Corbin and Strauss (2008, p. 145):

Analysis begins after the first day of data gathering. Data collection leads to analysis. Analysis leads to concepts. Concepts generate questions. Questions lead to more data collection so that the research might learn more about those concepts. This circular process continues until the research reaches the point of saturation; that is, the point in the research when all the concepts are well defined and explained.

This statement is important in the context of the primary research undertaken by this thesis, because the writer noticed that Theoretical Data Saturation occurred after he

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
processed the ninth interview transcript. Although 11 more interview transcripts were processed after the ninth transcript and added more leadership concepts (Appendix 2) to codify, these did not significantly skew the most significant concepts that had already emerged. Appendix 2 shows that a total of 93 leadership concepts were coded and 22 (24%) were of in-vivo origin.

In-vivo concepts are significant according to Corbin and Strauss (2008, p. 65) because they “Use the actual words of research participants rather than being named by the analyst”. In a research context, this means they are comparatively reliable indicators of the truth, so were considered by this writer to be significant when analysing and interpreting interview data for this thesis.

**Interview Transcript Referencing**

To efficiently process the large amount of interview research data gathered, this writer developed an Interview Transcript template in Microsoft® Word 2007 software to achieve three main research purposes. Firstly, to provide a logical structure for recording interview data to easily identify and code concepts. Secondly, to preserve a consistent data format to achieve data integrity. Thirdly, to provide an effective referencing system that would enable each interview comment to be accurately linked to its source transcript. The latter proved to be invaluable for sourcing data in the data analysis and write-up phases.

An anecdote referencing schema (Table 6, p. 97) was created for accurate referencing to interview comments throughout this thesis. The comments will be referenced in the next Chapter with precise identification of a respondents’ role. This will be comprised of their sample code, followed by the numerical sequence in which they were interviewed and then their initials. This is followed with a semi colon and the line number precisely indicating where their comment starts on the Interview Transcript template.

For example, the reference data shown in Table 6 (p. 97) would be referenced to a comment in such a way that “A Media Advisor (10AM: 45) said …” In other words, the comment is quoted from a Media Advisor who was the 10th consecutive sample interviewed, the respondents’ initials were AM, and their comment is located on line 45 of the master interview transcript document.
Chapter Four: Primary Research Design

Table 6. Anecdote referencing schema

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Sample Code</th>
<th>Line #</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Media Advisor</td>
<td>10AM</td>
<td>:45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed for this research by the writer

Research Data Validation

After this writer completed typing the interview transcript, he sent a copy to the relevant research sample accompanied by a quality assurance template by email. The template asked respondents to confirm the accuracy of the interview transcript data then sign it with their signature and date it. Then respondents read their interview transcript, highlighted any revisions that were necessary, and verified with an email they sent to this writer that the transcription was correct or highlighted where revisions were necessary. The respondents’ confirmation email was printed, attached to a copy of their respective transcript and then stored in a safe to ensure its security. The personally sensitive nature of the research data warranted this precaution being adopted.

Software Application Use

This writer decided to use the Microsoft® Excel 2007 software application instead of N’vivo or MAXQDA\textsuperscript{57} software to process the qualitative interview data gathered from interviews. The reason for this decision was two-fold. Firstly, due to the writer’s familiarity with Microsoft® Excel 2007’s rich functionality. Secondly, Microsoft® Excel 2007 has simple and reliable data sorting and searching features that enable easy customisation of spreadsheet and database formats, enables rudimentary statistical analysis and graphing of the analysis results within one spreadsheet. It also allows one screen to be split horizontally and vertically to show four simultaneous views of coded research data at once. This was invaluable when coding data to remember what the overall research objective was. This was important because it enabled the writer to efficiently navigate around the data without getting lost in it.

\textsuperscript{57} Popular commercial software dedicated to process qualitative data

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Overall, the most significant benefit of using Microsoft® Excel 2007 software for processing primary research data was that it enabled this writer to quickly interpret and discover trends in 93 coded leadership concepts (Appendix 2) in the primary research data, rather than relying on software to find them. This approach gave the writer a robust understanding about what the primary research data was saying and what it meant. It also enabled him to intimately relate to what it meant within the primary research context.

The primary research data from each quality assured interview transcript was Open Coded and then Axial Coded by this writer. The writer’s Open Coding approach was influenced by Corbin and Strauss (1990, p. 61) who define this as “The process of breaking down, examining, comparing, conceptualising, and categorising data.” The writer’s Axial Coding process was also influenced by Corbin and Strauss (1990, p. 96) who define this as “A set of procedures whereby data are put back together in new ways after open coding, by making connections between categories. This is done by utilising a coding paradigm involving conditions, context, action/interational strategies and consequences.”

Finally, in accordance with Yin’s (1994, p. 37) Reliability Test to enable the primary research processes adopted by this thesis to be reliably repeated, a summary of the software applications used by the writer to process the research data gathered for this thesis was created (Appendix 1).

**Summary**

In summary, this section discussed the research methods used by the writer for this thesis which produced four themes. Firstly, it was evident that when primary research data is highly ambiguous, robust triangulation methods are needed to verify data integrity. Secondly, the significant value of codes with an in-vivo origin. These are words that are uttered by research participants, and provide reliable indicators of the truth when a high number of concept codes are identified in primary research data. Thirdly, the importance of having a logical structure for accurately recording and referencing interview data for precise linkage to relevant discussion elsewhere in the thesis. Finally, the high value of using effective software to efficiently process primary research data to enable quick and accurate interpretation and efficiently identify trends. This provided the writer with an
intimate understanding about what primary research data meant. The next section will outline the nature of data analysis undertaken to achieve the primary research purpose (Figure 2, p. 4).

**Research Data Analysis**

This section will discuss the essence of four tests undertaken by this writer to ensure the full integrity of primary research data was preserved while it was being analysed: Construct Validity, Internal Validity, External Validity, and Data Reliability. This will include discussion about how this writer applied these tests to maintain data integrity while processing the primary research data.

**Construct Validity**

The first test is for Construct Validity because Yin (1994, p. 9) warns about the potential lack of rigor in case study research, where past researchers have been careless and “Not allowed equivocal evidence or biased views to influence the direction of the findings and conclusions”. Yin (1994, p. 34) also argues the construct validity test is problematic in case study research if a researcher “Fails to develop a sufficiently operational set of measures and that “Subjective” judgments are used to collect the data”.

To satisfy the Construct Validity test, Yin recommends researchers’ follow two steps. Firstly, to select specific types of changes to be studied, in relation to the original objectives of the study. Secondly, to show the selected measures of these changes do indeed reflect the specific types of change selected.

To satisfy Yin’s first step, this writer examined the extent that crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence as defined by the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4). To satisfy Yin’s second step, multiple sources of evidence from a research sample size of 20 Northland community leaders were examined as individual case studies.
Relating to this first test, Yin (1994, p. 80) highlights the need for a Chain of Evidence test because “A good case study will want to use as many sources of evidence as possible to establish construct validity and reliability of the case study”. To satisfy this test, the writer interviewed a sample of 20 Northland community leaders who volunteered to take part in the primary research for this thesis.

Achievement of the Chain of Evidence test according to Yin (1994, p. 98) requires “The reader of a case study to follow the derivation of any evidence from initial research questions to ultimate case study conclusions”. To satisfy this test, the writer tried to establish a Delphi Group comprised of the 20 primary respondents whom he interviewed. The aim was to get their objective quality assurance of the primary research data findings by tracing these from the findings all the way back to the research questions, or vice versa to confirm accuracy.

This process would have enabled quick detection of any logical anomalies and for them to be quickly and accurately corrected as suggested by the Delphi Group before this writer wrote the results for Chapter Five. Unfortunately, the Delphi Group could not be established due to difficulties in getting a 50% quorum of the 20 sampled Northland community leaders to leave their workplace for several hours on the same day and time to participate in a Delphi Group meeting.

Internal Validity

Yin’s second test (1994, p. 35) for Internal Validity is usually used for causal (or explanatory) case studies. This is where a researcher tries discovering if, for example; event X connects to event Y. Yin (1994, p. 35) also argues that:

> If the investigator incorrectly decides that there is a causal relationship between x and y without knowing that some third factor –z- may actually have caused y, the research design has failed to deal with some threat to internal validity.

To satisfy Yin’s Internal Validity test, this writer created a list of prompts for him to draw as much breadth and depth of information as possible about the influence of crucible experiences on the respondents’ leadership capability.
Chapter Four: Primary Research Design

External Validity

The third test is for External Validity, which according to Yin (1994, pp. 35 – 36) deals with the problem of “Knowing whether a study’s findings are generalisable beyond the immediate case study”. In other words, External Validity tests whether the research results apply in another environment or not.

Yin (1994, p. 36) argues this approach is usually inappropriate when dealing with case studies because “Survey research relies on statistical generalisation, whereas case studies (as with experiments) rely on analytical generalization. In analytical generalisation, the investigator is striving to generalize a particular set of results to some broader theory”.

The writer believes this matter raises the question about what theoretical underpinning should be used to decide the extent of External Validity in research. In other words, to examine if primary research results are similar to the results of similar primary research done in other environments. Unfortunately, this question cannot be answered while writing this thesis because the writer could not find any evidence of similar primary research being undertaken in the Northland region before this thesis was written. Nor is he likely to in the foreseeable future. Therefore, until the primary research results of this thesis are revised by further research, this writer believes the External Validity test is unlikely to be achieved.

Reliability

The fourth test for Reliability, according to Yin (1994, p. 36) is to ensure that:

If a later investigator followed exactly the same procedures as described by an earlier investigator and conducted the same case study all over again, the later investigator should arrive at the same findings and conclusions. (Note that the emphasis is on doing the same case over again, not on “replicating” the results of one case by doing another case study).

In response to Yin’s statement, the writer believes the results of this research are intimately linked with the Northland regional context described in Chapter One. Consequently, he is uncertain if a similar primary research to that done by this thesis would deliver similar

---

58 Italicised in source

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
results if the same research procedures were repeated in other New Zealand regions, or overseas. The writer believes this could be mainly due to the distinct socio-environmental uniqueness of the Northland region as discussed in Chapter One.

According to Yin (1994, p. 37), the best way of handling the reliability problem is to:

Make as many [research] steps as operational as possible and to conduct research as if someone were always looking over your shoulder … to conduct the research so that an auditor could repeat the procedures and arrive at the same results.

To satisfy Yin’s (1994) Reliability test to ensure the same research procedures used for this thesis could be used by future researchers in Northland or elsewhere, this writer standardised his research approach with simple templates and procedures to sustain research reliability.

Summary

In summary, this section has described the essence of four important tests undertaken by this writer to ensure the integrity of primary research data was preserved. In the test for Construct Validity, an issue emerged with trying to satisfy Yin’s (1994) Chain of Evidence test. For instance, this writer tried to establish a Delphi Group comprised of the 20 Northland community leaders who were interviewed, to confirm the accuracy of the research findings. Unfortunately, this writer could not get a 50% quorum of respondents to leave their workplace for several hours on the same day and time to participate in the Delphi Group. This infers an issue might exist wherein the research findings could be considered vulnerable to bias. The writer believes this has been satisfactorily offset by triangulating the primary research data and findings. In this thesis, data triangulation was achieved by each interviewer reviewing their interview transcript and verifying in writing that data recorded on the transcript was accurate before it was analysed and interpreted by this writer.

To satisfy Yin’s (1994) Internal Validity test for data causality, this writer created a list of question prompts for him to draw out the maximum breadth and depth of information in case respondents were hesitant to provide satisfactory responses. Fortunately, each interviewee engaged so intensely with this writer during their interviews, the prompts were
not used. However, the writer stresses the importance of comprehensive interview preparation, particularly simulating the interview; to verify the interview process is effective. The writer believes this approach is fundamentally important because without careful interview preparation, the integrity of primary research data could become compromised and therefore undermine the credibility of research findings.

An issue arose when this writer attempted to satisfy Yin’s (1994) test for External Validity to determine if the primary research results would also apply in another environment. Unfortunately, this test could not be completed because the writer could not discern any evidence of prior primary research similar to this thesis being undertaken in the Northland region. Therefore, until the primary research results of this thesis are revised by further primary research in Northland, the test for External Validity is unlikely to be achieved.

Although no issues arose with the Reliability test, this writer stresses the value of creating robust research procedures and clearly documenting them to ensure the consistent processing of research data, not only by this writer; but also for other researchers to use in future research. The next section will discuss the Thinking Framework which led to formation of the Research Design model and scoped the genesis of this thesis.

**Research Genesis**

This section will discuss the Thinking Framework that arose as the genesis of this thesis.

**Thinking Framework**

In Chapter One, the Thinking Framework was introduced and will be repeated in Figure 10 (p. 104) to focus and clarify discussion.
Figure 10. Research Thinking Framework

Source: Developed for this research by the writer

To recap, Figure 10 shows the Research Thinking Framework that led this writer to create the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4). The Thinking Framework is important because it formed the genesis of this thesis to examine how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders calling, character, and competence. Figure 10 shows the Research Thinking Framework is comprised of two constructs which are constructed of related concepts. The experiential learning construct (A) is based on the premise that crucible experiences (C) influence a leader to reflect on and learn about their identity (D). This usually triggers a psychological transition that takes the leader on a psychological journey from the experiential learning construct (A) to the Leadership Capability construct (B). This journey consciously or unconsciously influences the development of the three leadership categories comprising the Leadership Capability construct (B). These categories are leadership calling (E), leadership character (F), and leadership competence (G).

An important element shown in Figure 10 is the ‘Emotional Transitions’. This is represented by the title ‘ET’ to highlight the emotional transitions experienced by 20 Northland community leaders at a high construct level that connects the Experiential...
Learning Construct (A) with the Leadership Capability Construct (B). At a lower conceptual level the linkages are shown to also occur between the Crucible Experiences concept (C) with the Leadership Lessons Learnt concept (D) within the Experiential Learning Construct (A). Furthermore, the emotional transitions are also shown to exist between the Leadership Calling (E), Leadership Character (F), and Leadership Competence (G) categories within the Leadership Capability construct (B).

The emotional transitions are important because their existence frequently emerged in interview anecdotes. Their existence is characterised by Bridges’ (2003, p. 5) research which argues that when people are confronted with changing circumstances (crucibles), they usually undergo a journey of emotional transitions that are triggered by a crucible.

This journey is shown in Figure 11 as a three-phase psychological process, because the writer believes this concept satisfactorily explains how crucibles influenced the respondents’ leadership calling, character, and competence.

Figure 11 shows crucibles tend to trigger a process of Ending, Losing, and Letting Go (A) in the form of psychological changes that force research respondents to psychologically discard their old ways and identity. This triggered their psychological transition into the second process which is known as the Neutral Zone (B) as shown by the dotted arrow.

**Figure 11. Psychological Transition Phases**

![Figure 11. Psychological Transition Phases](image)

**Source: Adapted from Bridges (2003), p. 5**

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
When the research respondents arrived in the Neutral Zone, their former ways and identity no longer existed and their calling or destiny was unknown. The writer noted that while they were in the Neutral Zone, all respondents mentioned feeling bewildered and trapped in what the writer euphemistically describes as a “Mental vacuum that was nowhere between two somewheres”. The respondents mentioned they emotionally transitioned from the Neutral Zone (B) to create a New Beginning and identity (C) for themselves as shown by the dotted arrow in Figure 11 (p. 105). Furthermore, the writer believes that as a consequence of this journey, all interviewed Northland community leaders rebuilt their lives to discover a new sense of purpose and meaning. Ironically, most said they achieved results that would not normally have been within their capability if crucibles had not forcibly intruded into their lives.

Overall, this writer believes what is important here, is the emotional journey travelled by interviewed research recipients to a new beginning (C) in their lives. This process is described in the next Chapter. To put a real-life context around this, Bridges (2003, p. 9) argues these phases do not occur sequentially but tend to simultaneously overlap:

The phases don’t happen separately; they often go on at the same time. Endings are going on in one place, in another everything is in neutral zone chaos, and in yet another replace the new beginning is already obvious. calling them “Phases” makes it sound as though they are lined up like rooms in a house. Perhaps it would be more accurate to think of them as three processes and to say that the transition cannot be completed until all there have taken place.

This writer believes Bridges (2003, p. 9) transition concept shown in Figure 11 (p. 105) is important because it shows that when crucibles influence leaders’ calling, character, and competence, this plays out as gradual emotional transitions from process A to C in Figure 11 (p. 105) rather than happening in an erratic manner. In other words the writer believes this process occurs by evolution (gradually) rather revolution (haphazardly).

**Summary**

In summary, this section has outlined the essence of the Research Thinking Framework that underpins the Research Design Model developed for this thesis. The main theme that emerged is crucibles trigger an emotionally driven process that forces respondents to discard their old ways; then they enter into the Neutral Zone, and eventually move into the
New Beginning phase to create a new identity or renewed self-awareness about who they are. Another theme that emerged is crucibles also trigger an emotional process that forced respondents to incrementally discover a new sense of purpose and meaning in their lives. The writer believes this process developed their leadership calling, character, and competence. The next section will describe each element that comprises the Research Design Model developed for this thesis.

**Research Design**

This section describes each element that comprises the Research Design Model (Fig. 2, p. 4) developed for this thesis, in a structured top - down approach.

**Research Design Model**

The Research Design Model shown in Figure 2 (p. 4) forms the research kernel of this thesis and is underpinned by the Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3). The specific purpose of each level of the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) will be described in a top-down manner starting from an abstract concept at its peak and ending with concrete facts that comprise clear research themes and future research options at its base.

To start with, the Primary Research Topic (A) concerns the influence of crucibles on leadership which provides the scope for primary research for this thesis. This drives the primary research purpose (B) to examine how crucibles influenced Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence, and identify areas for further research. This underpins the primary research question (C) by asking “How do crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence?” Because this primary research question is open-ended, it is subdivided into three primary research objectives (D) which are each designed to gather primary research data to answer this (Table 1, p. 5).

For instance, Research Objective One examined how crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ calling. Research Objective Two examined how crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ character and Research Objective Three examined how crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ competence. Then each primary...
research objective (D) is subdivided into two primary research questions (E) to gather primary research data from interviews with a sample of 20 Northland community leaders (F) to identify themes (G) that will answer the primary research objectives (D) and provide options for further research to examine (H).

The research sample size (F) of 20 Northland community leaders was influenced by Cammock (2009, p. 82) who did phenomenological case study research similar to this thesis with 16 respondents for two main reasons. Firstly, to satisfy his publisher’s commercial needs. Secondly, to control the significant workload involved with transcribing interview data, coding this data, drawing concepts from the coded data and then translating this into a sound explanation for publication. Cammock’s second reason influenced this writer’s decision to exceed 16 samples and utilise the large number of leaders volunteering to participate in the research designed for this thesis.

**Summary**

In summary, this section has described the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) developed for this thesis. The main theme emerging from the discussion is the fundamental importance of a precisely scoped and appropriately structured model to underpin the primary research question (Figure 2, p. 4). The next section will conclude with an outline of the main themes that emerged in this Chapter and what they mean in context with the Research Design developed for this thesis.

**Conclusions**

In conclusion, this Chapter discussed the Research Design (Figure 2, p. 4) developed by this writer to structure the approach for gathering primary research data for this thesis. Two main themes emerged from this discussion that formed this writer’s decision about how the primary research data was to be processed for this thesis.

Firstly, when researched phenomena is ambiguous or if little relevant information exists, researchers should develop research thinking framework to develop an understanding of the best research methodology to adopt for processing primary research data.
Secondly, this writer’s decision to choose individual phenomenological case studies as the basis for producing primary research data. Given this thesis is about the influence of crucibles on developing leadership capability; the writer determined these phenomena are essentially qualitative. Therefore a qualitative research methodology was adopted to process the research data.

Processing of the research data indicated a rudimentary quantitative research method should also be adopted to calculate the comparative frequency of coded leadership concepts (Appendix 2). Overall, the writer believes the mixed research methodology that was used, helped to provide a balanced version of the truth to answer the primary research question of this thesis.

Two unrelated themes emerge that challenge the veracity of primary research data gathered from interviews with respondents. Firstly, the potential for respondents to be unconsciously selective and choose what they remembered or they could have forgotten elements of their experience. Secondly, the potential for respondents to respond differently to crucibles had they had been in a different mood when experiencing their crucible. The writer believes this is primarily because people’s moods tend to change frequently.

It was previously mentioned (p. 91) that to preserve the veracity of primary research data, the writer triangulated interview transcripts by sending a typewritten copy of each transcript to each respondent by email. In the few instances where errors were detected in the research data, these were corrected by the respondent, signed as being accurate; then the master transcript was corrected by this writer before it was analysed and interpreted. To put all this into an appropriate context, this writer believes the primary research findings of this thesis should be considered more an approximation of the truth than an exhaustively precise account of it. In other words, it is approximately right, more than precisely wrong. The next Chapter will discuss the primary research findings for this thesis.
CHAPTER FIVE: PRIMARY RESEARCH RESULTS

The purpose of this chapter is to show the research results that were processed by the writer for this thesis. This has been achieved through interweaving strands of data from many disparate sources.

Introduction

This Chapter will discuss findings that emerged from analysis and interpretation of interview data gathered by this writer from interviews with 20 Northland community leaders. Processing this data produced 93 unique coded leadership concepts (Appendix 2) and created themes that provide opportunities for further research to add new knowledge and improve leadership praxis. The themes emerging from within each of three primary research objectives will be discussed to determine how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence. These themes will then be supplemented with relevant information that emerged from the interviews to illustrate the context underpinning them. Finally, four themes that emerged from the three leadership categories will be interpreted to provide a lateral perspective of how crucibles influenced 20 Northland leader’s leadership capability.

At this point it is important to appreciate that the interview data used in this thesis was derived entirely from respondents’ recollection of ambiguous circumstances experienced several years prior to their interview with this writer. Therefore the reliability of interview data is heavily reliant on the accuracy of respondents’ memory recall which is vulnerable to their personal bias, values, attitudes, beliefs and expectations. This means the primary research results presented in this chapter had to be exhaustively triangulated to avoid further potential distortions of the truth.
Research Objective One: How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders Calling

Introduction

The purpose of Research Objective One was to determine how crucibles influenced the development of 20 Northland community leaders calling. Or in other words, how crucibles influenced them to realise their purpose in life.

The results and themes will be described and supported with a selection of comments from interviews with the respondents to show the context underpinning the results. Overall, the first theme relates to how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders to serve others, while the second theme relates to how crucibles influenced them to become more self-aware of their leadership calling in life.

Thematic Results

The primary research results for Research Objective One stem from 61 leadership concepts (Appendix 3) relating to the influence of crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ sense of calling in life. Table 7 shows 65% of respondents believed crucibles influenced them to be benevolent towards people, so this theme was categorised as their calling to Serve Others. Another 65% of respondents said crucibles influenced them to be interested in people so this theme was also categorised as their calling to Serve Others. Finally, 55% of respondents said crucibles influenced them to become more self-aware of their character, feelings, motives, and desires, so this theme was categorised as their calling for self-awareness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Concepts</th>
<th>Samples / 20</th>
<th>% of Responses</th>
<th>Serve Others</th>
<th>Self-Aware</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serve Others</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self Awareness</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>130%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>70% 30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
Table 7 (p. 111) shows the benevolence and orientation concepts are conceptually similar so they have been re-categorised as the Serve Others theme. Their merger represents 130%\(^\text{59}\) of the total sample responses for Research Objective One. In comparison, the self-awareness concept arose from 55% of respondents so this has been categorised as the Self-Aware theme.

Overall by ratio, Table 7 (p. 111) shows 70% of respondents chose to serve others, whilst 30% chose to become more self-aware\(^\text{60}\) about their character, feelings, motives, and desires. This writer believes both of these themes provide an opportunity for future research to examine why some leaders were influenced towards one theme more than the other.

**Thematic Context**

Relevant comments drawn from interviews with respondents will be outlined next to show the underpinning context in which crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others or to be self-aware about their character, feelings, motives, and desires.

*How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to Serve Others*

The following selection of comments from 70% of the respondents’ responses shows the underpinning context of how crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others. For example, the crucible of sleep deprivation from nursing her baby for 24 hours a day influenced a Civil Defence Officer’s (2CN:48,50) decision to find meaningful employment and provide value to Northland society: “I need to work. I need to have direction other than Ben [son]. And I need to give back. I need to be with communities and giving something back.”

Also, his constituent’s requests for help with their crucibles influenced a District Councillor (4VC:9, 82) to realise that volunteer work stimulated his passion for helping people in need:

\(^{59}\) Calculated thus: Benevolence (65% of responses) + Orientation (65% of responses) = Serve Others (130% of responses)

\(^{60}\) Calculated thus: Serve Others (130% of responses) + Self Aware (55% of responses) = 185% of responses.

\[ \frac{130}{185} \times 100 = 70\% \text{, and Self Aware: } \frac{55}{185} \times 100 = 30\% \]

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
Chapter Five: Primary Research Results

That was a calling for me. I always wanted to be helping people always. So everything I’ve ever done in my life is always helping other people. As much as I can help people as best as possible … then I went and did volunteer work. I went around the world, travelling around helping people. So when I was with the voluntary organisations, I was helping people get through, find things, teach them English … I have a strong affiliation with younger people. And I’ve been that father figure for a lot of them. Because I didn’t have the father figure.

The 24 hour responsibility of running a small rural Fire Station involves daily management and leadership of life-threatening crucibles. Attending many crucibles over a long period of time led a Fire Station Manager (5TV:1) to develop much personal satisfaction from the support he gave his community. This led to attending free training courses which strengthened his calling to serve people and improved his competence in doing so.

… [my calling] came through the want to do some good for the community. Thirty plus years later I am still in the Fire Brigade. So it was definitely for the common good of the community, as my reasons for joining. And it leads to personal gratification, and yeah, just lots of personal gains, lots of training, continual training courses, and to where I’m now in the position of Chief Officer of the Fire Brigade.

Also, the crucible of planning and running New Zealand’s largest annual ‘Beach and Boat’ fishing competition influenced an Event Organiser (7LQ:15, 50) to experience considerable personal satisfaction from this responsibility, which strengthened her calling to help people:

The reason I did it was that it made me feel great inside … I just felt great about what I was doing … And I thought “yes, that was my calling”, and I felt it, and I lived it, and I breathed it, and it just consumed me. And it was nothing to do with money. It was nothing to do with fame … I’ve always got to do the right thing by other people.

Her close affinity with the Northland environment influenced a Chief Operations Officer (13JT:3, 5, 7, 9) to realise that her leadership calling was to protect it for future generations of Northland people:

For me … I believe I can make a difference. I believe that it is very, very linked to Northland. But, there’s just something about Northland and my roots and what I see as a desperate need for this community. We are the poorest, we die the earliest, and we are the least educated, and it needs people like me along with my other colleagues to stand up, and in our time on this earth we have to make a difference and we have to try to change that. We absolutely have to. I’ve had some gifts passed onto me from others, some of them have passed on, some of them haven’t, and I need to ensure that for future generations that I do my bit while I’m here … Yeah, I guess it’s a little bit like the Kaitiaki61, you just look after and nurture it while you’re here, but also the leadership is critical

61 Kaitiaki is Māori vernacular for a “trustee, minder, guard, custodian, guardian, keeper’”– Retrieved 17th October 2010 from http://www.maoridictionary.co.nz/.

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
Chapter Five: Primary Research Results

… the Kaitiaki is about looking after, you know that nobody owns anything, that you look after the treasures while you are here, and nurture them and grow them, and then you will move on, you will pass on … Yeah it is very much around stewardship, yeah.

Also, a District Councillor’s (14AS:3, 19, 86, 88) role as a voluntary Hospital Chaplain provided her with a sense of great personal fulfilment, which led her to realise that helping people in need was her life’s calling:

I suppose it was at that stage that I became a Girl Guide. I really enjoyed the way the Guiding was structured. And a sisterhood as well, which I hadn’t got at home. You know, I hadn’t got a sister and I hadn’t got a brother. And I became a Patrol Leader. And oh, you know, this was really my role you know, being able to help people and show people. Yeah, I think that was the start of how I felt about leading people and being able to help people … I am very much a person that likes to fix things or to help people to fix things. I have expanded that this last year and become a Hospital Chaplain. I really do enjoy that work. I mean, you can’t say it is enjoyable, but the fulfilment is there being able to help those people that want some help.

Feelings of admiration and respect for his mother’s desire to help people influenced a Human Resources Advisor (16RT:3, 5, 9, 40) to become aware that helping was his calling in life:

I have this fairly strong desire to help people. And where I can, I help and support people. I like being part of a close team. I like to make things successful … I see myself as nurturing or shifting competencies. And helping people to help themselves. If I’m unable to put someone into a particular position … that’s not very often … more the nurturing, more the helping, but I get a buzz out of other people being successful … But I like to contribute, I like to help, and I like to see people grow, and I like to have good relationships with people … I would say the sense of duty and wanting to help people has come from my Mother. My Mother is very much about that and is a very good person and thinks good of just about everyone. So I think that’s influenced me, I think it has rubbed off. Yeah.

Also, a Human Resources Consultant’s (17AK:25, 29, 34) achievements in ice skating competitions during her childhood triggered a lifelong desire to coach people how to skate well on ice. This realisation eventually led her to discover that her leadership calling was to help people achieve their personal goals:

So if you had to sort of purify my calling, it is to “pass on knowledge and see other people reach their potential as much as I can help them to because not one person alone can do it. So that’s it in a nutshell. I just get excited about seeing somebody, the lights going on an saying ‘yes’ or going into a business and saying “this is why you can’t manage your staff because you haven’t got this, this in play” … So to purify it, that’s my calling. I believe is to help other people on their life journey, where I come into it, to help them to take that to learn something to take their potential to the next level … But also going back to my childhood with the support that I had at the time from my

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences

114
family was just huge. They invested in me hugely, you know. It was that not only I took a passion, which was my skating, but I also learnt the pleasure of giving back and watching other people achieve. So that set something alight in me that has never gone away.

Joining his local Fire Brigade as a volunteer influenced a Senior Fire Station Manager (STV:99) to also volunteer for other community roles, which helped him to realise that his leadership calling was to support people in his community:

Sometimes you wonder why you are doing it. But it just feels the right thing to do, yeah. When I was approached to join the Fire Brigade, well you know it was the right thing to do. And it was the same with the approach to be a Justice of the Peace, and yeah, the Boat Club work is you know, for pleasure. But again, it’s you know, to make sure the club works for everybody’s benefit.

Finally, the positive crucible of achieving registration as a certified Electrician gave a Network Project Engineer (18AJ:124) great satisfaction in helping his community. This made him feel valued by society and strengthened his believe that his leadership calling was to serve his community:

You have to have that empathy with other people, because of the interaction. Like the registration as an Electrician, that’s quite clinical but I actually thought I was more use to society because I had a trade. I now had some value in the community because I could go out there and do stuff in the community. So once again, that was sort of putting me into a position to serve the greater good. It made me feel good, yeah.

Overall, these comments show how 70% of the respondents were influenced by crucibles to serve other people in their community. They also show that the interviewed leaders derived great personal satisfaction from contributing to society. In some cases this experience strengthened their desire to serve others with more resolve.

*How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Self-awareness*

The following selection of comments from 30% of respondents shows the underpinning environmental context of how crucibles influenced their leadership calling to become more self-aware of their character, feelings, motives, and desires (Appendix 7). For example, the multiple occurrence of crucibles relating to finding a new home, unemployment, not exercising, and having an irregular daily living routine influenced a Civil Defence Officer (2CN:189, 253) to reflect that her life situation was unsatisfactory.

These crucibles influenced her to find employment that would enable her to use her Master’s degree qualification to improve her life situation and develop more personal self-
Crucibles arising while sailing around the world in merchant ships for five years as a Deck Officer influenced a Regional Fire Service Manager (5TA:5, 7) to realise he thrived on having challenging management and leadership responsibilities. This realisation led him to achieve his calling and eventually became a Senior Manager in the region’s Fire Service:

I found being on the bridge on the help so important because it was precision stuff. You take a ship through the Panama Canal, you’ve got a Pilot who instructs you, they come aboard, or your Officer of the Watch is instructing you. But you are still responsible for steering that, physically steering that ship on a steady helm. And adjusting for the waves, for the wind, for the cargo, how the ship is loaded … Yeah, I actually thrived on it. If I saw a difficult job or a difficult role, I would pursue it to manage it, to overcome it, to conquer it really, to overcome my own fears of that particular role.

For a 65 year old Rotary President (8RM:92, 96) the crucible of seeing a much loved family Bach severely damaged by a storm stimulated profound humility about her leadership ability to cope with life’s misfortunes. This experience was keenly felt because she had previously overcome many serious crucibles in her lifetime that had developed within her a strong sense of self-confidence in being able to handle crucibles:

It was terrible. But I was shocked at the way I reacted. I was disappointed in myself. I thought that I’d worked through enough, you know, with all the deaths and everything going wrong … and here I was getting sort of twitchy about a damaged property. I guess it was because I just felt helpless. I didn’t know what to do. And I’ve never felt helpless in my life before. Nature absolutely wins, it does. It showed me that I wasn’t as gung-ho as I thought I was. You know, a hugely humbling experience. Hugely.

The crucible of her trust being abused by a respected family friend influenced a School Teacher (9HW:35) to reflect on her leadership capabilities. This experience influenced her to develop a stronger belief in her leadership capabilities and led her to develop a more optimistic outlook on her calling in life:

I went on a self discovery kind of experience for a good couple of years. And from that, I asked deep questions I guess. And so that was it, I guess you’ve got to think that things happen for a reason and this did. Before that, my life was flowing pretty nicely, and I graduated from this, and did really well at school. And then I guess something like that kind of happens. I guess I learnt from that to believe in yourself, and that if you want to do it, you can do it.
Also, the variety and complexity of crucibles encountered by a Media Advisor (10AM: 82, 86) highlighted gaps that existed in her personal development and influenced her to learn and acquire new skills to fill those gaps by acquiring more knowledge:

[crucibles] feeds my calling … so every time I have found there has been a big brewing of issues, I have decided “right, I’ll tackle the buggers”. So I’ve always come out of it knowing more and having more tools in my toolbox to deal with the next round of issues that come up … Each time there’s been a gap holding me back, I’ve filled it … So it gave me skills to do what I wanted to do. So it gave me a skill. Each time there has been a crucible in my life, it’s pointed out things in my life that have been holding me back from progressing as an individual.

The crucible of a Communications Manager’s (11PR:28, 32) divorce influenced her to develop more tenacity in her approach to living and discover her calling:

When we split up of course, I was by this stage living away from my parents. They were horrified at the thought we were splitting up. They cut me off and didn’t speak to me for eighteen months, that’s where they were at. And his parents wouldn’t speak to me. And when I moved into a flat by myself, with … I had my car, I had an Ali Baba basket. And that is all I had. And I didn’t know how much I could afford in rent. I had never budgeted, I had no idea. And so I moved into a grotty flat in Parnell. And as I was moving in, I went to put something in the kitchen cupboard and there was a broken, rotten egg on the shelf which I put my hand in, it was all furry. And I sat on that kitchen floor and I so nearly went back. It was just absolutely a defining moment. No friends, no nothing. I just felt totally alone, and thinking “No. You’ve just got to just … there’s no one to rely upon but yourself, you will just have to get on and do it … Oh that rotten egg moment was absolutely, I’ve struck other ones that have sort of brought up, well similar emotions.” And always that thing is “move on and keep going”.

The crucible of belonging to the Sea Cadets during a Banking Consultant’s (12TM:10) childhood, influenced her to adopt a more structured approach to her daily life which boosted her self esteem and helped her to realise her calling:

I joined the Sea Cadets when I was 13, and then I stayed with them right through until I left High School, which was eighteen. And that was a major, major part of my life and I learnt so much from that. More so when applying it to everyday life. Just the organisation, the discipline, you know those structured … yep … communication, those structured things they teach you so well in the Armed Forces I guess. And that really cemented for me, yeah, a structured way of rolling all of those into one I suppose. So I always look back on my days in the Sea Cadets and think “wow, that whole experience has changed the person that I am.”

The crucible of failing a school examination during her childhood influenced a District Councillor (14AS:3) to better understand her leadership capabilities and led to her understanding her calling in life:

I think it all started with being an only child and never being able to satisfy my father. He always wanted me to be top in class, top in this, top in that. And I was. And that enabled me to sit the ‘eleven plus’ at the tender age of eleven in the UK, which I failed dismally. And I suppose that was...
really a turning point with regards to “I can’t do everything, I’ve disappointed my father, I’m a failure”. You know, at eleven.

When a Human Resources Advisor’s (16RT:202) marriage and employment terminated at about the same moment in time, these crucibles influenced him to trust his intuition more and act decisively on his instincts when he senses that something is amiss. This has had a profound effect on his leadership calling:

When I got married, I intuitively knew some things weren’t right, but I chose to ignore my intuition. So that was a big one in terms of trusting my instinct. The crucible around getting made redundant from the Whangarei District Council, I had a sense that all was not well, and that things were going wrong. What I have learnt around my intuition is that if I do get a ‘warning bell’ that I need to explore and find out whether I have got reasons to be concerned.

Finally, marriage difficulties triggered by her passion for her career influenced a Human Resources Consultant (17AK:115, 118, 135) to reflect deeply on her personal values. This forced her to reflect on what her life meant which led her to develop practical processes for rebalancing or reprioritising her life’s priorities whenever she feels becomes necessary:

I went through marriage difficulties which also had a huge impact on my life to really re-think about my values, personal values. I was so passionate and into my work, that I just didn’t know when to stop. Yeah, and my friends, the works, if they wanted to see me they had to make an appointment in my diary. Well that’s how bad it got. Yeah, you have to be aware of it, it creeps up on you, yeah. Well I had to physically re gear myself, because I couldn’t keep up the pace. But I’ve learnt, I’ve really learnt, because what I’ve not got it so in my being at the moment, I call it my value of leading a healthy, balanced life. And so I’m very aware now, when I start to breach that because it actually starts to make me feel uncomfortable. Although it was a very difficult time, I’m always grateful if happened, because again it was a correction. Yeah, well I’ve got it now. I’ve got the mechanism. Yeah. It’s a self mechanism now, because it makes me feel really ... I become self aware when I am starting to get out of balance or if I am denying my own values, which is to lead this healthy, balanced life. I recognise how I feel very quickly, and I know “aha, when did you last diary in your walk?”, “why aren’t you eating properly?”

Overall, these comments highlight the diversity of crucible sources and how they influenced 30% of the respondents to become more self-aware about their leadership calling.

Summary

In summary, this section has examined comments from 70% of respondents who indicated crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others. Three main themes emerged:
1. Supporting their community made some respondents feel valued by Northland society, which affirmed their desire to provide even more help for their community.

2. The act of serving people provided most respondents with a feeling of personal fulfilment.

3. Volunteering for community work provided most respondents with personal development opportunities that enabled them to provide even more support for their community.

This section has also interpreted comments from 30% of respondents who felt crucibles influenced their leadership calling to become more self-aware about their identity, character, feelings, motives, and desires (Appendix 7). Themes also emerged of them being more self-aware of their humility, intuition, developing an enquiring mind, independence, tenacity, a need for structure, and being passionate about finding meaningful work to engage in.

Overall, this section shows crucibles arise from diverse sources and situations that are either difficult or impossible for the respondents to foresee. Although some crucibles provided positive experiences for them, most imposed robust hardships that forced respondents to decide whether to fight with, flow with, or flee from their influence. Ironically, the experience of having to make this decision was considered by some respondents to be a crucible in its own right. Selection of these choices forced respondents to reflect deeply on what their crucibles meant to them and led them to make personal decisions about their leadership calling to serve others and/or become more self-aware.

Finally, this writer believes the results created by Research Objective One provide an opportunity for future research to perhaps determine why some leaders were influenced by one theme more than the other. The next section will examine the essence of results gained from Research Objective Two, which is about how crucibles influenced Northland community leaders’ leadership character.
Chapter Five: Primary Research Results

Research Objective Two: How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Character

Introduction

The purpose of this section is to discuss two themes that emerged from interview data to achieve Research Objective Two’s objective of determining how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leader’s character. These themes will be supplemented with relevant comments from interviews with respondents to develop an appreciation of the environmental context they occurred in.

Thematic Results

The results for Research Objective Two stem from 81 coded leadership concepts (Appendix 5) relating to how crucibles influenced the development of 20 Northland community leaders’ character. The summary of research results in Table 8 shows two themes emerged which this writer has titled Be and Do for reasons that will become apparent in the next section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Samples / 20</th>
<th>% of Responses</th>
<th>Be</th>
<th>Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Awareness</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courageous</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compassionate</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimism</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals: 450% 450%
Ratio: 50% 50%

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Table 8. Crucible influences on Northland community leaders' character

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
The first theme arose from 50% of respondents who said crucibles influenced their leadership character to embrace and demonstrate integrity, self-awareness, courage, communication, compassion, optimism and benevolence. Because they felt these characteristics helped them to be the best at whatever they did, this writer has categorised them as the Be theme.

The second theme stems from another 50% of respondents who also felt crucibles influenced them to adopt the seven leadership characteristics previously mentioned. They felt these characteristics influenced how they behaved in their relationships with people. Therefore the writer has categorised them as the Do theme.

Summary

Overall, analysis and interpretation of interview data gathered by Research Objective Two suggests crucibles equally influenced Northland community leaders’ character to be the best at whatever they do (Be) and how they behave in their relationships with people (Do). The research did not reveal why the second theme triggered their decision to be the best at whatever they do instead of how they behave in their relationships. The writer believes this provides an opportunity for further research to determine the reasons for their choice.

Thematic Context

The Be and Do themes that shape leadership character will be supported with appropriate comments that were mentioned by the respondents. They are recorded below to develop an appreciation of the environmental context underpinning how crucibles influenced their leadership character.

How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to be their best

The following selection of relevant comments from 50% of respondents are presented to show the context of how crucibles influenced the respondents’ decision to Be the best at whatever they do by exercising their integrity, self-awareness, optimism, communication, intuition, and benevolence. For example, the pressures of a hectic operational environment
influenced a Chief Operations Officer (JT:104,106) to work from her personal values. However, she frequently had to put her own values aside in order to control her crucibles more effectively. The following comment shows an example of how crucibles influenced her integrity:

> At times I have been a bit principled, and I think these are my values, and you have to be prepared sometimes to think, you just have to accept decisions that are against your personal values, without letting it cripple you. Where it is still ok to say “that’s against my values, I’m just going to have to go into it”. Because otherwise the energy that it takes from you is crippling … I will always try and influence the outcome. But you know, when you think about where you put your energies and your resources, you can control the outcome. If you can’t, you have to be efficient with your time and energy in a role like I’m in. I think particularly when it comes to our personal lives, we can expend a whole lot of energy which you never get back, trying to influence or control outcomes that in actual fact, you have no control over at all.

Crucibles arising from teaching handicapped children made a Primary School Teacher (9HW:61) aware of the need to prioritise her teaching workload better in order to teach more effectively. She explains how crucibles influenced her self-awareness and optimism:

> I have faith. I try not to sweat the small stuff. However, I am quite diligent and I do things to details, because I am a detailed sort of person. I’d rather spend another extra hour at work getting things done, and sometimes I get a bit overwhelmed with things that are happening. So I think I should probably loosen up a bit on some of the smaller stuff that I shouldn’t have to sweat.

The crucibles of attending to fatal house fires and car accidents influenced a local Fire Station Manager (5TV:129) to emotionally deal with these distressing events by using lessons he learnt from previous incidents. The following is an example of how crucibles influenced his confidence to be optimistic and courageously deal with fatal incidents:

> When you have dealt with a difficult experience it gives you more confidence in yourself you know. When you’ve got an outcome, you’ve made the tough decisions, you’ve got an outcome, and it gives you more confidence to do it again when you have to.

The crucibles arising from managing a hectic operational environment influenced a Chief Operations Officer (13JT:91) to work from her passion to be the best at whatever she does. The following comment shows how crucibles influenced what she communicates to others verbally or through practical examples she sets for her staff:

> When I get passionate about things people had better look out. “We’re just going to do it because we can. There are no limits.” That has some risks, because sometimes you can be doing the wrong stuff. If the worm turns a bit, you can get very grumpy or angry. You can get very passionate about that too.
Life-and-death crucibles that arise while managing her team of nurses in an Accident and Emergency Clinic influence a Medical Centre Manager (19KB:85, 90) to trust her intuition when making decisions about people’s lives. Notice in her comment below, the level of trust she has in her intuition when caring for her patients:

Oh it’s huge. It’s huge. Absolutely. Intuition, you need, well you need it all round. When making financial decisions, business decisions, a lot of that is made from intuition. Am I going to? what is happening around me? what is happening to government policy? Do we bring this change in? Is it worth it? What’s in it for the patient? ... I call it “gut feeling”. I work on my gut feeling a lot. I look at the staff. I read their body language. I was taught body language, it is very important, and that’s where a lot of intuition comes from ... Life has probably taught a lot of that. You know, is this patient really just wanting to go the loo or is he having a heart attack? Intuition, yeah. Because when most are having a heart attack, their bowels tend to want to go and so, you know, there’s no more responsible intuition than that really.

Challenging operational crucibles influence a Council Media Adviser (10AM:246) to intensively research anything that she has no knowledge of and triggers her desire to understand how to do her job better. The following comment is an example of how crucibles influence her self-awareness and optimism to learn more by seeking people’s opinions:

My crucible experiences have taught me to seek knowledge. And I can seek knowledge through talking to other people who have been through life experiences, there’s nothing better than that. That’s the best advice, find somebody who has been through this, talk to them, take from what they say, but talk to them if they survived it. If they fail it, have that conversation another time. But go off and find someone who has succeeded. Because you need to know what happens around the failure situation, and they might need to talk it through too.

Finally, the responsibility and pressure of effectively managing fires and road accidents in the Northland region influence a Regional Fire Manager (6TA:65) to appreciate the importance of his role and renewed his passion for helping Northland communities. The following comment shows how crucibles influence his benevolence:

When you face a difficult challenge, you know, I think yeah, now how does that compare to my younger brother losing his life? And I suppose that my passion for my job and my role, and my regards for the safety of my personnel, the people who work for me, in ensuring that they are safe, and also this role of handling road accidents, car crashes, the ability to rescue and extricate people out of accidents like that. Assisting people to live, you know, helping them to stay alive basically.
Chapter Five: Primary Research Results

How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Behaviour in Relationships

This section presents relevant comments from another 50% of respondents who said crucibles influenced how they behaved in their relationships with people (Do). The following comments provide examples of their leadership characteristics that were most influenced by crucibles such as integrity, self-awareness, courage, communicating, compassion, optimism, and benevolence. For instance, diverse crucibles arising from operating a local Fire Station influenced how a Fire Station Manager (5TV:103) led his Fire Fighting team. He did this through setting his own examples and by drawing on lessons learned from his previous fire fighting experiences. The following comment is an example of how crucibles influence this leader’s integrity:

I would never put a leader into something that I wouldn’t be prepared to go and do myself. And always prepared to, and enjoy you know, get the gear on out there, get dirty, and do the job.

The crucible of project managing New Zealand’s largest annual fishing competition influenced an Event Organiser (7LQ:111, 113) to rely on her trustworthiness to establish relationships with the competition’s sponsors. The next comment shows how crucibles made her more self-aware about her character:

They all knew they didn’t have to worry about me. They knew that they didn’t have to come with a contract, because when I shook their hand I would always [deliver], that was it. I mean, some of them were giving me a hundred thousand dollars in cash. True. Still can’t believe it.

The emotionally intense crucible of her court battle for custody of her children also influenced her (7LQ:123,125) to exercise tenacity and honesty to persevere with the legal system and be honest throughout the process. This was despite receiving legal advice to lie in court. The following comment is an example of how crucibles’ influenced her to act with courage and integrity:

I nearly lost my two oldest children through a court custody battle with my ex husband. Talk about tragic. And it was a horrific time in my life. Ten years of it … the only reason why I didn’t lose the kids, was because of that fact. And I know this is because I could see it in the judge. The judge kept looking at me and she, I think in the end, saw my solid perseverance and that I never, ever change my tune, and even when my lawyer was telling me to lie, I was just plain refusing to. I’m not giving up on the court and lying … I went to hell and back for my kids.

The pressure of crucibles arising from managing the Rotary International organisation influenced a Rotary President (8RM:138) to mentor and communicate more effectively
with her management team. The following shows how crucibles influenced the way she communicated with her team. As she comments:

Walk alongside someone, and to sort of reflect, chew over situations, to have a chat. My Mum used to have this saying that “two heads are better than one, even if they’re both sheep’s heads”. Yeah, halve the problem, you bring a bit of sense of humour into it, and you know, you sort of … let’s see how we can muddle through this, and sort of see the direction that we are going. To be able to get alongside them and to do that sort of ‘peered reflection’ on something.

The crucibles of hospital patients’ imminent death influences a District Councillor (14AS:139,141,143) to be empathetic when giving palliative care to terminally ill patients in her pastoral role. The next comment reflects how crucibles influence this leader’s compassion towards her patients:

I feel I can encourage people who are, yeah close to death, and in the realisation that it’s something that happens to us all, and I’m not able to tell you what happens afterwards. Because I haven’t experienced it, you know, and come back. And so those sorts of things, I think encourages people to realise that none of us can live forever, you know … And the feeling that you get back, particularly when you say to somebody, you know, “would you like me to pray with you?”. And the sheer release those people get, you know, when we do pray together. And the feeling of relief for that person, you can actually feel it, you know. And they may cry … I mean we are not supposed to, because of cross infection, you’re not supposed to hold people’s hands, and things like that. But I do. You know, I can’t give my feelings to somebody just standing at the side of the bed, you know. I’ve got to hold a hand. And as long as you do the hand washing, and that sort of thing, so yeah it’s good to talk to people who are already in dress and ready for ‘off’. You know, they’ve had enough of this place, they’re off you know, yeah.

A crucible that arose in her community for the establishment of a Community Resource Centre influenced her (14AS:109) to take responsibility for completing the project and draw on her commercial experience to complete the project. The following comment exemplifies how crucibles influenced her optimism:

I’ve been involved with starting a Community Resource Centre here. And eighteen months ago, Barry who lives next door, is the local Methodist Minister who had got no say whatsoever in that it was going to be successful. And I said to him then “well, I’ve got every faith. I know it’s going to work”. And it did. And I said that I would lead that organisation until it got its ‘stand alone’ status, become a Trust on its own, and then I would out of it. And that has just happened just recently.

The complexity of social crucibles arising from her constituency influenced a District Councillor (15SM:90, 95) to reflect on how fortunate she was in her childhood to have been nurtured in a loving family environment. This experience influences her to adopt a caring attitude towards people who are less fortunate than her. The following comment shows how crucibles influenced her sense of benevolence:

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrive” Experiences
I am always out helping other people, do things and organise things, and what have you … Coming back to that “all roads lead to Rome” type thing, the experiences that I had as a child, living in a really fabulous family, you know where that sense of being loved and cherished, I mean how lucky am I? Yeah, and unconditionally … But I’ve had a charmed life really, blessed. So I guess the sum of all things, the life experiences and you taking out that lovely nurtured, challenged, exciting childhood that I had. And being able to give that part of myself to other people. That’s kind of my way of giving back.

Summary

In summary, this section has discussed a selection of relevant comments from 50% of the respondents who felt that crucibles influenced their leadership character to be the best at whatever they do. It also discussed insights from another 50% of respondents who said crucibles influenced how they behave in their relationships with people. It is noteworthy their crucibles arose from unpredictable sources and situations that strongly influenced and developed their leadership character. The research data did not reveal why crucibles triggered respondents desire to be the best at whatever they do instead of how they behave in their relationships which provides an opportunity for future research to determine. The next section will examine the findings that emerged from Research Objective Three about leadership competence.
Chapter Five: Primary Research Results

Research Objective Three: How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders’ Competence

Introduction

The purpose of this section also is to discuss the essence of primary research results and two themes that emerged from interview data gathered to achieve the aim of Research Objective Three. This objective aimed to examine how crucibles influenced the development of 20 Northland community leader’s competence. The first theme relates to how crucibles influence Northland community leaders to draw on their own knowledge. The second theme relates to how crucibles influence them to use external knowledge sources to enhance their leadership competence.

Thematic Results

The primary research data generated by this research objective stems from 62 leadership concepts relating to the influence of crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ competence (Appendix 6). The research results presented in Table 9 show two themes emerge from analysis and interpretation of interview data. Firstly, that crucibles influenced respondents to draw upon their own aptitudes or skills to be a competent leader. This theme stems from leadership character traits of intuition, being self-aware, analytical and courageous which accounts for 68% of all leadership concepts identified in the interview transcripts relating to leadership competence. Because these traits are drawn from a leader’s consciousness, this writer has categorised them as the Pull theme.

Table 9 Crucible influences on Northland community leaders’ competence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concepts</th>
<th>Samples / 20</th>
<th>% of Responses</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intuition</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuasiveness</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Awareness</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courageous</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td></td>
<td>95% 205%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio:</td>
<td></td>
<td>32% 68%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
The second theme relates to crucibles influencing respondents to draw on external knowledge sources to enhance their leadership competence (e.g. other people). These sources arose from 32% of the main leadership concepts and were identified as character traits of being persuasive and communicating well to gain resources to enhance their leadership competence. Because these traits have an outward orientation towards people, this writer categorised them as the Push theme.

**Summary**

Overall, analysis and interpretation of the interview data to accomplish Research Objective Three indicated crucibles influenced 68% of Northland community leaders’ competence to primarily draw knowledge from their own experience (Pull), and to a much lesser extent (32%) improve their leadership competence by using external resources (Push). The research data did not identify why a leader would choose to pull or push to develop their leadership competence so this writer believes this could form the basis for primary research to identify the reasons for either choice.
Thematic Context

The Pull and Push themes will be illuminated with relevant comments from respondents to develop an appreciation of the underpinning environmental context about how crucibles influenced their leadership competence.

How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to draw on their own competence

The following comments were obtained from respondents who said crucibles influenced them to primarily rely on their own aptitudes or skills to be competent leaders. They stem from the leadership characteristics of intuition, self-awareness, being analytical and courageous. For instance, the following comment shows how crucibles influence a Chief Operations Officer (13JT:166) to draw on her intuition to lead her staff effectively. Her competence stems from acute self-awareness about her ability to quickly analyse risks and willingness to take responsibility for the consequences of her decisions. As described below, she also draws on her intuition, being self-aware and analytical:

Cos I’m like “Oh Jesus I’m getting into unchartered territory here and I’m not sure where …”, you know in this job the Rate Payer would probably be mortified, but there’s many a time where I say “back yourself, keep the faith”. You know, just back yourself, ask for forgiveness not permission, just get on and do it. You’ve got to be able as a leader, to do a very quick risk assessment, very quickly in your head. You know, you’ve got to back yourself, and you just do it, accepting that you’re not always going to get it right. The thing is, in this job, you’ve just got to assess the risk and say “am I prepared, if it all turns to custard, that I can actually take the consequence”.

The following comment highlights how a District Councillor (14AS:50) described that the crucible of her divorce forced her to become more self-aware and self-assured in her work role:

I suppose since being divorced, I have had to be more forthright and make decisions on the hoof sort of thing. And then I became Chair of the YWCA. And then I was involved in other women’s organisation until a friend said to me “I need to say something to you. I think you belong to too many women’s organisations, and people will be starting to think things, you know [laughter]. I said “Really!” And that really put me on the back foot, you know. And I thought well “Is this the way I am leaning?” But erm, no, no I was still more comfortable in a man’s world.

Another District Councillor (13JT:162) describes what she learnt from her crucibles to draw on her analytical skills:
Analytical sharpness … I’ve become hugely psycho analytical in the last couple of years. Almost to a point of exhaustion, where I’m just, and I think that is an appetite for learning, and constantly watching people looking at people, trying to figure out why the hell they are doing what they are doing, erm because in terms of influencing them to change or putting a strategy in place to lead people forward, I think that is important.

Finally, A Civil Defence Officer (2CN: 316) explains how she learnt to draw on her courage from the influence of crucibles arising during her tenure in the Air Training Corps:

I think the Air Training Corps gave me a basis, or a strong basis for everything to carry on with. Well you did leadership courses, and they put you in situations, you know, they wake you up in the middle of the night, you had to get dressed and go and do exercises. Throw you in the bush for three days. You know, make you go tramping and that sort of thing. And I think that’s probably played a large important role, and carried on into the activities that I undertook as an adult … out of my comfort zone yeah. And I just liked that military feel. Maybe it is, young kids that don’t have a good family, they gravitate towards gangs. Or maybe if you are losing a parent or something you gravitate toward the military because at the end of the day you are kind of looked after.

How Crucibles Influenced Northland Community Leaders to draw on external knowledge resources

This brief section examines relevant comments from the respondents who said crucibles influenced them to push on external knowledge sources to be more competent in their leadership and included the characteristics of persuasiveness and communicating well. For instance a Banking Consultant (12TM:3) describes how she persuaded her manager to help her realise her desire to be competent in training people.

I’ve always had a desire and a passion for training and development … My role at the moment is not doing anything like that unfortunately. I am working in banking and the option of doing training and development is not available to me in Whangarei … I did say to my Manager that that was my passion and would she be able to help me? And so we did an eight month pilot with me training new members in the branch in systems and processes and things like that, which was fabulous. And from that I did some Massey University papers extramurally and that sort of thing, which just sort of cemented that was what I enjoyed doing the most.

Finally, in the following comment, a Human Resources Consultant (AK17:301) explains how she prefers to communicate with her clients when leading change in their organisation. The following anecdote shows how crucibles influenced her to communicate well.
I call it ‘to from’ planning which is one process I use quite often. Once we have established where the organisation wants to go, I ask them why they want to go there because you don’t have change for change sake. And what’s in it for everybody. And so you communicate, communicate, communicate. But the ‘to from’ planning is we want to go here. So I try to break it down to the individual roles in the organisation, and what that is going to actually mean to the individual … And then I sit down with the individuals and I say “Hey you are here now, but this is where the organisation would like to go. These are the new skills you might need, these are the changes, where do you feel uncomfortable with that process and how can we facilitate you to get to where you need to be.

Summary

In summary, this brief section has examined the primary research results delivered by Research Objective Three, which aimed to identify how crucibles influenced Northland community leaders’ competence. Two main themes emerged from the results. For instance, in the first theme, 68% of respondents preferred to pull knowledge from their own competence, whilst 32% preferred to push on external knowledge sources (e.g. people) to extend their leadership competence. Therefore, the writer interprets these themes to show that a strong preference by respondents exists to be self reliant and independent of external knowledge sources by drawing knowledge from within themselves. The next section will interpret the meaning of the main themes described in the previous sections of this chapter to develop an appreciation of how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leader’s leadership capability.

Research Theme Interpretation

The previous Thematic Context section interpreted and analysed two significant themes that emerged individually within each of the leadership calling, character, and competence categories. This section will interpret these themes across all three categories to provide a uniform lateral perspective of how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leader’s leadership capability.

62 Italicised by this writer to emphasise consistent crucible influence laterally across the leadership calling, character, and competence categories

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
**Most Highly Influenced Leadership Influences Across Categories**

Analysis and interpretation of interview data (Appendix 7) indicated the self-awareness and communicating leadership concepts (arrowed) rated consistently as the most highly influenced of the leadership calling, character, and competence categories (Table 10) within each leadership category.

**Table 10. Highest leadership influence across categories**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Leadership Calling Category</th>
<th>Leadership Character Category</th>
<th>Leadership Competence Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concept</td>
<td>Responses</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Awareness</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data**

What the writer finds interesting about this theme is the notion that self-awareness develops within a leader from their reactions to crucibles, in what he believes is an outside-in process. Concurrent with this theme is a leader’s capability to communicate is also influenced by crucibles. This stems from within the leader and is projected to the external environment in what the writer believes is an inside-out process. The writer interprets this phenomena means the stronger a leader's self-awareness the greater the probability they are also likely to communicate effectively with people.

**Most Influenced Leadership Concepts**

From all responses to the leadership calling, character, and competence categories in Table 11 (p. 133), the self-awareness and communicating leadership concepts (arrowed) also rated overall as being the most highly influenced by crucibles (Appendix 7). This result is consistent with themes that emerged in the previous section. The writer attributes this phenomenon to the high number of responses received within each individual leadership category.
Consequently, the writer interprets this result underpins his previous statement that strong self-awareness also develops effective communication skills within people and therefore forms a foundation for developing leadership capability.

Table 11. Most influenced leadership concept

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concepts</th>
<th>Samples / 20</th>
<th>% of Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self Awareness</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>180%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>155%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>125%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courageous</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>120%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intuition</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>120%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organiser</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>110%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptability</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>105%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compassionate</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>105%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenacity</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>105%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aplomb</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgement</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimism</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflection</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Most Influenced Leadership Category

Another significant theme to emerge was that character rated as being the most highly influenced leadership category by a significant margin over the competence and calling categories (Table 12, p. 134). The writer believes this result is consistent with findings in the previous two sections because self-awareness and communicating concepts are key elements that comprise leadership character.

Overall, the writer believes it is logical for leadership character to rate as the most influenced leadership category because this is synonymous with self-awareness. It also consistently rates highly across all leadership categories in the previous sections.
Table 12. Most influenced leadership category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Leadership Category</th>
<th>Coded Responses</th>
<th>Total Responses</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calling</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Research theme orientation to leadership style

Finally, this writer analysed the themes to determine if they had an orientation towards a Transactional or Transformational leadership style. This led the writer to examine statements made by several eminent scholars. Firstly, Parry and Proctor (2000, pp. 25 – 26) were quoted saying (p. 32) saying that Transactional leadership “Operates out of own needs and agenda; seeks concrete evidence of success; manipulates others and situations; works on basis of exchange (you do this for me and I’ll do that for you).” Secondly, Burns (1978, p. 20) defines the Transformational leadership style as a process where “One or more persons engage with others in such a way that leaders and followers raise one another to higher levels of motivation and morality”.

In Chapter Three this writer was led to believe the Transactional and Transformational leadership styles are very different to each other. This matter led to his interest in examining which leadership style respondents were oriented towards. So this writer linked the three Research Objectives to their respective research themes, interpreted their meaning in context with the primary research question, mapped these to the highest scoring leadership concept codes and traits, and then reconciled these with Transactional and Transformational leadership style characteristics as shown in Table 13 (p. 135).
Table 13. Research theme orientation to leadership style

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Objective</th>
<th>Research Themes</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>Leadership Codes</th>
<th>Leadership Style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RO1: Leadership calling</td>
<td>70% Serve Others</td>
<td>High concern for people, service orientation</td>
<td>Stewardship</td>
<td>Stewardship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30% Self-awareness</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RO2: Leadership character</td>
<td>50% Be the best at what they do (Be)</td>
<td>Ambition, perfectionism</td>
<td>Tenacious</td>
<td>Tenacious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50% Behaviour with people (Do)</td>
<td>Socially intelligent in relationships</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RO3: Leadership competence</td>
<td>68% Draw on own knowledge (Pull)</td>
<td>Self-reliance</td>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>Independence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>32% Seek knowledge externally (Push)</td>
<td>Resourcefulness</td>
<td>Resourceful</td>
<td>Resourceful</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Leadership entity most influenced by crucibles:
- Character: Develop authentic identity → Charisma
- Self-awareness: Self-awareness of character → Self-awareness
- Communication: Communicate knowledge & ideas → Communicating

Totals:
- Transactional: 5
- Transformational: 8

Ratio: 38% 62%

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
Overall, Table 13 (p. 135) also shows the research themes tend to be oriented towards the Transformational leadership style (62%) as arrowed. This lends support to Robbins et al., (2011, p. 34) statement that:

The evidence supporting the superiority of transformational leadership over transactional leadership is overwhelmingly impressive. For instance studies that looked at managers in different settings, including the military and business, found that transformational leaders were evaluated as more effective, higher performers, more promotable than their transactional counterparts, and more interpersonally sensitive. In addition evidence indicates that transformational leadership is strongly correlated with lower turnover rates and higher levels of productivity, employee satisfaction, creativity, goal attainment and follower wellbeing.

Finally, the previous statement leads the writer to argue the themes that emerge laterally across the three categories indicate crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leader’s leadership capability to develop Transformational leadership characteristics.

**Summary**

In summary, this Chapter (Five) has discussed the results emerging from analysis and interpretation of interview data gathered by this writer to answer the primary research question “How do crucibles influence Northland leaders’ calling, character and competence?” The themes emerging from within each of three leadership categories show how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence leadership categories. Regarding leadership calling, 70% of respondents indicated crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others. The remaining 30% of respondents stated crucibles influenced their leadership calling to become more self-aware about their identity, character, feelings, motives, and desires. On the matter of leadership character, 50% of respondents believed crucibles influenced their leadership character to be the best at whatever they do. Another 50% of respondents stated crucibles influenced their behaviour in relationships with people. Relating to leadership competence, 68% of respondents preferred to pull knowledge from their own experience, whilst 32% preferred to push on external knowledge sources to enhance their leadership competence.

Furthermore, three themes emerged laterally across all three leadership categories which provided a lateral perspective of how crucibles influenced leadership capability. Firstly,
respondents indicated the self-awareness and communicating leadership concepts were the highest influenced by crucibles. Secondly, character rated the most highly influenced leadership category. Finally, crucibles predominantly influenced the development of Transformational leadership characteristics. The next Chapter will conclude this thesis with an interpretation of the main primary research findings made by this thesis. It will also propose further research.
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION

This writer’s research journey started out with the hubris and uncertainty of discovering new knowledge. Five and a half years later, this journey is ending in this Chapter with humility and the certainty there is more to discover about the influence of crucibles on developing leadership capability.

Introduction

This Chapter will focus on establishing what has been learnt overall from the themes discussed in the previous Chapter and how they relate to the primary research question and research arguments introduced in Chapter One.

To achieve this, the research context including the research argument underpinning the research results and themes will be described. This will be followed by a summary of the general research results and themes that emerged from the primary research data and an outline of what they mean in relation to the research argument. This will lead to discussion about the ‘Surthrive’ concept which emerged from the research themes as this thesis’ major contribution to knowledge. This will be followed by discussion about implications of the ‘Surthrive’ concept for literature and Northland leadership praxis, followed by an outline of further research options. Finally, concluding comments will end this thesis.

Research Context

To start with, recent crucibles experienced by this writer formed the genesis for the research argument underpinning this thesis. To recap, these crucibles were his previous three Line Managers’ low self-esteem, their low self-awareness and inability to communicate effectively with people. In the writer’s opinion, these factors developed low levels of trust between staff, and constrained selling their products and services, which in turn minimised their organisation’s financial performance and also triggered high staff turnover. The writer believes these crucibles might have been avoided had the Line

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
Managers been more self-aware about their leadership capabilities, articulated their leadership vision clearer, understood principles of effective leadership, or all of these factors combined. These crucibles were so tangible; the writer coined the phrase ‘leadership vacuum of ineffectiveness’ to represent the phenomenon of leadership incompetence (the antithesis of leadership capability). Labelling this complex situation led the writer to develop a Research Thinking Framework (Figure 1, p. 3). This framework formed the research argument that crucibles trigger an experiential learning process of reflective thinking through emotional transitions that gradually develop leadership capability.

The Research Thinking Framework led the writer to develop the Research Design Model (Figure 2, p. 4) to focus this thesis with a primary research question that asked “How do crucibles influence Northland leaders’ calling, character and competence?” The answers produced by this question will be outlined in the next section.

**Overall Research Findings**

This section will first reprise this thesis’ overall research results and interpret their meaning in relation to the research argument to summarise what the general research results mean. As outlined in Chapter Five, the research findings revealed 70% of respondents felt crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others, whilst 30% said crucibles influenced their leadership calling to become more self-aware about their character. Furthermore, 50% of respondents mentioned that crucibles influenced their character to be the best at whatever they do and another 50% said crucibles influenced how they behaved in their relationships with people. Finally, 68% of respondents indicated that crucibles influenced them to pull knowledge from their own experience and 32% chose to push on external sources for knowledge to supplement their leadership competence.

Three themes emerged from this writer’s analysis and interpretation of the research results. First, respondents’ self-awareness and ability to communicate were the leadership concepts most influenced by crucibles. The writer interprets this to mean that crucibles influence leadership capability in an inside-out capacity. In other words the more one understands one’s self, the more visible this becomes to their external environment through their leadership capability dealing with crucibles. Second, the leadership character category

**Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”**
Chapter Six: Conclusion

emerged as being the most highly influenced leadership category by crucibles. The writer believes this supports his belief that crucibles influence the development of leadership capability in an inside-out capacity. In other words, by moulding a leader’s personal characteristics to effectively understand and deal with changing circumstances in their external environment.

Finally, crucibles influenced respondents to generally develop more Transformational leadership traits than Transactional leadership traits. This is hardly surprising because renown scholars Parry and Proctor (2000, pp. 25 – 26) were cited earlier (p. 33) as saying Transactional leadership “Operates out of own needs and agenda; seeks concrete evidence of success; manipulates others and situations; works on basis of exchange (you do this for me and I’ll do that for you).” Furthermore, Burns (1978, p. 20) defined the Transformational leadership style as a process where “One or more persons engage with others in such a way that leaders and followers raise one another to higher levels of motivation and morality”.

Interpretation of this in context with Parry and Proctor’s (2000) and Burns’ (1978) statements, leads the writer to believe that crucibles develop leadership capability in an inside-out manner. For instance, the more leaders become self-aware about their own calling, character and competence, the more effectively they will relate to, communicate with, and work with other people in their external environment.

The writer’s argument that the research results show crucibles influence leadership capability in an inside-out manner, is best illustrated by dynamic stimulus and response scenarios that stem from the writer’s analysis of interview data shown in Appendix 4. In other words, crucibles (i.e. stimulus) influence leaders to reflectively think about their leadership calling, character and competence (i.e. stimulus) in a cognitive process to decide whether to flow with, flee from, or fight with their crucibles (i.e. response) to survive and/or thrive as a consequence of handling their crucible experience (i.e. outcome).

This process is illustrated in Figure 12 (p.141) as three interdependent scenarios represented by three virtual pistons operating within three virtual combustion engines. Each virtual engine represents a scenario that illustrates the development of leadership capability and each virtual piston within it represents leadership calling, character and competence dynamics.

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
To clarify this, the movement of these pistons metaphorically symbolises the influence of crucible stimulus (i.e. labelled ‘$S$’) on the leadership categories and the responses they influenced (i.e. labelled ‘$R$’) to develop leadership calling, character, and competence. This is undertaken in an inside-out direction.

Firstly, in Scenario ‘A’ (Figure 12) when a crucible influences the leadership calling category this will also stimulate development of leadership character and competence categories. Secondly, in Scenario ‘B’, whenever a crucible exerts an influence on the leadership character category this will also stimulate development of the leadership competence and/or calling categories. Finally, in Scenario ‘C’, when a crucible influences the leadership competence category, this stimulates development of the leadership calling and leadership character categories. The underpinning basis of these scenarios stem from 93 leadership concepts (see Appendix 2) that were coded in the leadership calling, character, and competence categories from the research data.

The magnitude of crucibles influence on the respondents’ leadership calling, character, and competence categories is illustrated in Table 14 (p.142). This shows crucibles primarily influenced 44% of all the 93 leadership concepts within the three leadership calling, character, and competence categories (arrowed).
Table 14. Summary of crucible influence on leadership categories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Objectives:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>1,2,3</th>
<th>1:2</th>
<th>1:3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>2:3</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leadership Concepts:</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concept Ratios:</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
Research Objective 1: Leadership calling category
Research Objective 2: Leadership character category
Research Objective 3: Leadership competence category

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

The complexity of crucibles’ influence on respondents’ leadership calling, character, and competence categories is illustrated in Figure 13 (p. 143). This also shows that by ratio, 44% of the total 93 coded leadership concepts (see Appendix 2) influenced by crucibles which is shown as the nexus of the three leadership categories. This creates the overall strength of leadership capability.

This suggests that the magnitude of crucible influence is dispersed as a ripple effect across all three leadership categories because these are closely linked with each other by the 44% of leadership concepts they all share. This is shown in the middle overlapped zone shared by the three leadership categories in Figure 13 (p. 143). In other words, the sum of the parts (i.e. leadership concepts) collectively becomes greater than the whole (i.e. the three leadership categories of calling, character, and competence) to collectively influence the development of leadership capability.

Overall, these results and the writer’s interpretation of what they mean, underpins this thesis’ assertion that crucibles heavily influence the leadership calling, character and competence categories in a dynamic web of stimulus and response relationships in an outside-in manner. Furthermore, the nexus of this interplay triggers a reflective thinking process that develops stronger leadership capability through experiential learning over a leader’s lifetime. Consequently, this writer believes these research results support the research argument (p. 3) that “Crucibles trigger the experiential learning process of reflective thinking through Emotional Transitions which develop leadership capability.”
Figure 13. Crucible influence on leadership categories and coded leadership concepts

Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
The next section will discuss the ‘Surthrive’ concept that emerged from analysis and interpretation of the research themes. This is important because it forms the major research contribution of this thesis.

**Surthrive Concept**

The research themes described in the previous section show respondents’ tenacious will to survive and/or thrive the influence of their crucibles. This phenomenon led the writer to develop the Surthrive\textsuperscript{63} process, which is the major research contribution made by this thesis. In essence, the Surthrive process is comprised of four interdependent processes as shown in Figure 14. Each process will be incrementally described next and will draw on key research results to contextualise their existence.

![Figure 14. Surthrive Process](image)

**Source:** Developed by this writer from primary research data

---

\textsuperscript{63} The Surthrive concept has been created by this writer to represent the development of leadership calling, character and competence through reflective thinking about crucibles to survive and thrive adversity. The term 'Surthrive' is a neologism that is drawn from the Oxford Concise Dictionary (1999) definitions for 'Survive' which means to persist, endure and 'Thrive;' which means to develop rigorously and flourish.

**Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”**
Chapter Six: Conclusion

**Crucibles Process**

The Surthrive process is activated by crucibles that people are most likely to encounter in their lifetime. For instance, the interview data showed 61% of crucibles most commonly experienced by respondents involved family relationships, job, or death crucibles that were unpredictably forced upon them. All respondents mentioned they had absolutely no choice but to deal with their crucibles to survive the significant impact they imposed on their lives. The impact of this triggered the Experiential Learning Process.

**Experiential Learning Process**

The Experiential Learning Process is driven by Reflective Processes that influence how respondents analysed and interpreted what their crucible meant to them. For instance, the research data showed that crucibles influenced 52% of respondents to orient themselves to understanding the essence of their crucible, benevolently accept it as a significant event in their life, build sufficient resilience to survive it, tenaciously control its influence, or competently deal with the consequences of its influence.

This is shown in Figure 14 (p. 144) as an iterative process involving reflective thinking which is the conceptual core of the Surthrive model. In support of this statement, most respondents mentioned that crucibles influenced them to iteratively reflect on their life situation. This compelled them to consciously deal with their crucible until they survived its influence. When the Experiential Learning Process runs its full course, it tends to trigger the Leadership Capability Development process.

**Leadership Capability Development Process**

Analysis of the interview data indicated the experiential learning process triggered stimulus and response relationships at the nexus of the leadership calling, character, and competence categories. Figures 13 and 14 both show the nexus of these categories all

64 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 63 ‘Orientation’ (Appendix 2)
65 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 11 ‘Benevolence’ (Appendix 2)
66 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 74 ‘Resilience’ (Appendix 2)
67 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 87 ‘Tenacity’ (Appendix 2)
68 coded from primary research data as Leadership concept 17 ‘Competence’ (Appendix 2)

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
share the leadership concepts of stewardship, self-awareness, tenacity, benevolence, independence, and communicating.

All interview respondents mentioned the leadership concepts influenced them to perceive the Surthrive process as a positive force for learning and intellectual growth that offered them a choice to flow with, rather than insurmountable problems to fight with, or flee from. Although most interview respondents frequently mentioned this process was “work in progress”, they also expressed cautious optimism they would eventually achieve a positive outcome and survive their crucible (see Appendix 4, ‘Crucible Response’ column). When they felt they had achieved this they moved into the Surthrival Process.

**Surthrival Process**

All interview respondents said they experienced a strong sense of emotional closure when they realised they had survived or thrived in the hardships forced upon them by their crucible. Ironically, all respondents expressed gratitude for the hardships imposed upon them by their crucibles, because they felt these helped them to experientially learn and accomplish things they would not normally have considered worth attempting. In other words, their struggle with crucibles developed their psychological strength.

A significant phenomenon reoccurring throughout the Surthrive process is emotional transitions (ET) that link each process in the Surthrive model. This stems from all respondents vividly recalling their experience of emotional transitions linking the Crucible, Experiential Learning, Leadership Capability and Surthrival processes. Furthermore, they mentioned the emotional transitions were a profoundly moving experience as they progressed through the Surthrive process.

Another noteworthy feature of the Surthrival process is the respondents were highly conscious of their ongoing iterative reflective thinking about what their crucible experience meant to them and what they were learnt from them. This is shown in Figure 14 (p. 144) as arrowed lines heading down from each process and reconnecting with the Reflective Processes stage.

Finally, all respondents felt their experiential learning journey through the Surthrive process generally strengthened their leadership capability to survive future crucibles and resulted in them achieving positive outcomes for themselves. Analysis of the positive
outcomes in Figure 15 indicates crucible response outcomes most influenced respondents’ leadership character (47%). In comparison, leadership calling (27%) and leadership competence (26%) were influenced to a much lesser extent. The writer believes these results are mainly due to iterative reflective thinking about crucibles and experientially learning from them. The reason for this could be examined by future research.

**Figure 15. Crucible influence on leadership categories and coded leadership concepts**

![Pie chart showing the influence of leadership character, calling, and competence]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calling</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals:</strong></td>
<td><strong>125</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Developed by this writer from primary research data in Appendix 4**

The next section will discuss the implications of the research results of this thesis on the literature and Northland community leadership.
Research Implications

This writer actively searched for, but could not discern any reference to, nor locate any knowledge in the literature resembling the Surthrive process shown in Figure 14 (p. 144). This leads him to believe this contributes new knowledge. The essence of this new knowledge is underpinned by the premise that crucibles trigger a reflective thinking process that develops a leader’s sense of leadership calling, character, and competence through experiential learning. Furthermore, this process optimises one’s leadership capability to survive and/or thrive future crucibles.

The writer believes the research findings gained by this thesis may have potential implications on Northland community leadership. For instance, if the Surthrive process were to be developed into a leadership capability development programme, the investment in developing and facilitating it would provide a positive step towards improving Northland community leadership performance over the medium to long term.

A potential downside of the leadership capability development programme is the benefits would be difficult to quantify, meaning it would probably be difficult attracting funding for this initiative. Therefore this writer believes the Surthrive process should perhaps be perceived more an investment in Northland society than as a cost to it, due to the intangible nature of value returned to Northland society over a period of time.

Moreover, this writer believes the Surthrive process could potentially provide personal development benefits for current and future Northland community leadership praxis. Although this would be at the mercy of Northland community leaders’ will or capacity to learn new skills, the Surthrive process has the potential to motivate community leaders to experientially learn how to learn and engage in reflective thinking, which in some cases might even enhance their employment prospects.

Furthermore, some leaders might learn how to experientially learn from their crucibles, which would develop more self-awareness about their capabilities, help them to communicate better with people, or improve their leadership calling, character, and competence. This writer therefore believes the Surthrive process has the potential to positively influence the development of Northland community leadership over the short to medium term. The next section will suggest further research that could be undertaken to extend the Surthrive process developed by this thesis.
Further Research

It emerged in Chapter Five that each of the research results gained by the three research objectives produced two main themes. To recap, in the area of leadership calling, Research Objective One indicated 70% of respondents indicated crucibles influenced their leadership calling to serve others. The remaining 30% of respondents stated crucibles influenced their leadership calling to become more self-aware about their identity, character, feelings, motives, and desires.

On the matter of leadership character, Research Objective Two revealed 50% of respondents believed crucibles influenced their leadership character to be the best at whatever they do. Another 50% of respondents stated crucibles influenced their behaviour in relationships with people. Relating to leadership competence, Research Objective Three indicated 68% of respondents preferred to pull knowledge from their own experience, whilst 32% preferred to push on external knowledge sources to improve their leadership competence.

Analysis and interpretation of these themes did not reveal reasons why crucibles influenced respondents to respond in one way or another. Therefore, further research could perhaps examine what factors influenced respondent’s decision to respond to the influence of their crucible in the particular way they did and why. For instance, the primary research purpose could examine if their decision is led by the infamous academic argument of nature (genetically influenced) or nurture (experientially learnt), or perhaps a combination of both.

Further research could be facilitated in other regions within New Zealand or overseas about learning how crucibles’ influence in developing leadership capability. The research results should perhaps be reconciled with the research results gained by this thesis. This could perhaps verify if the Surthrive process is underpinned by universal principles that reliably and/or predictably stimulate and/or develop leadership capability irrespective of the environmental context.

Finally, it is the writer’s belief that if further research verifies the Surthrive process is based on universal principles, these could be transformed into a Surthrive leadership development programme. This programme could be developed to positively influence the
development of extant pedagogical and andragogical learning praxis to improve the effective leadership of society throughout the 21st century and beyond.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, this thesis was not designed to challenge or prove extant leadership or experiential learning theories or praxis. It aimed to examine with a phenomenological approach how crucibles influenced 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence by asking them “How do crucibles influence your leadership calling, character, and competence?” It also aimed to identify opportunities for future research to extend the new knowledge developed by this thesis.

Overall, this writer believes the significance of the research results produced by this thesis about how crucibles influence Northland community leaders’ capability is best epitomised in a statement by Bennis and Thomas (2002, p. 1):

> The ability to learn is a defining characteristic of being human; the ability to continue learning is an essential skill of leadership. When leaders lose that ability, they inevitably falter. When any one of us loses that ability, we no longer grow.

This quote leads the writer to believe it means effective leaders continually seek opportunities to learn new knowledge from their experiences. For this writer, the quote epitomises new knowledge contributed by this thesis that ongoing learning through reflectively thinking about what crucibles mean, provides an effective way to develop leadership capability (i.e. leadership calling, character, and competence).

Further, the writer believes this statement is also supported by Warren Bennis in his 2008 Harvard Centre for Public Learning interview, who said “Leadership is something that is caught, not taught”. Moreover, Bennis’ statement prompts the writer to ponder “Overall, what was gained from the research undertaken by this thesis into how crucibles influenced the 20 sampled Northland community leaders from a leadership capability perspective?”

In riposte, this writer’s analysis of their interview transcripts formed the Surthrive process which conceptually shows how crucibles influenced their leadership capability and led to outcomes that had a profoundly positive effect on their life. Moreover, this was achieved by reflectively thinking about what their crucibles meant and interpreting them as...
important lessons they were being taught by life. This writer interprets this to mean their leadership capability was primarily developed through learning from their crucibles rather than being taught in orthodox classroom lessons, as inferred by Bennis (2008). Furthermore, the writer believes this learning approach is an effective test of a person’s leadership calling, character, and competence, because as stated by Vernon Sanders Law: “Experience is a hard teacher because she gives the test first, the lesson afterwards” (Nathan, 2000).

Finally, in the writer’s opinion, the essence of the Surthrive concept developed by this thesis is epitomised by a remark made by Naisbitt and Naisbitt (2010, p. 66) about a traditional aspect of Chinese thinking, that “all insight arises from practical experience”
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Survthival” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


Cortez, p.76.


Harvard Centre for Public Learning, March 31, 2008. Warren Bennis on leadership Development, YouTube. Available from: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NFHaHquIW0g](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NFHaHquIW0g) [Accessed 4 April, 2011].


Ivan, S. (2006). *When I grow up I want to be a registrar*, paper presented at the ARUCC, Montreal, Canada.


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrive” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


---

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrive” Experiences”


Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”


APPENDIX 1: SUMMARY OF RESEARCH SOFTWARE USED

A summary of the software applications used to create this thesis is shown in Table 15 as recommended by Yin’s (1994, p. 37) Reliability Test and discussed in Chapter Four. This table was developed by the writer for this thesis.

Table 15. Summary of research software used by this writer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Software Title</th>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Manufacturer</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bcisive</td>
<td>2.0.4</td>
<td>Austhink Software</td>
<td>Outline Chapter structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Microsoft Office Excel</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Process transcript data, calculate statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Microsoft Office PowerPoint</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Develop diagrams and presentations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Microsoft Office Visio</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Outline research processes and diagrams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Microsoft Office Word</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Develop and revise thesis Chapters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Microsoft Project</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Plan all work to complete thesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Microsoft Windows Mail</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Electronic communication with supervisor and Narrators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Microsoft Windows Paint</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>Edit diagrams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>MindManager PRO7</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>Mindjet LLC</td>
<td>Develop ideas and concepts in mind maps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Rationale</td>
<td>2.0.7</td>
<td>Austhink Software</td>
<td>Outline paragraph argument structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>SPSS Inc</td>
<td>Develop Histograms from statistical data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>StyleWriter</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>Editor Software (UK)</td>
<td>Improve Chapter readability and flow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 2: SUMMARY OF LEADERSHIP CONCEPT CODES

The Leadership Concept Codes shown in Table 16 were derived from the analysis and interpretation of primary research data in the respondents’ interview transcripts. Each concept code represents the influence of a crucible on 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, or competence as described in Chapter Five. This was developed by the writer from interview data.

Table 16. Summary of coded leadership concepts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Accountability Required or expected to justify actions or decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Accumulation Gathering and storing resources to achieve one’s ‘calling’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Adaptability Make suitable for a new use or purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Adventurous Open to or involving new or daring methods or experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Alignment Place or arrange into correct relative positions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Aloof Emotionally cool and distant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Ambassador Representational or promoter of a specified activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Analytical Using analysis or logical reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Apollob Self confidence or assurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Awareness Having knowledge or perception of a situation or fact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Benevolence Well meaning and kindly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Bonding A force or feeling that unites people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Charisma Compelling attractiveness or charm that can inspire devotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Cognition Mental process of acquiring knowledge through thought, experience, and the human senses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Communicating Share or exchange of information or ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Compassionate Sympathetic pity and concern for the sufferings of others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Competence Quality or extent of being technically competent in doing something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Consensus General agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Courageous Having courage, brave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Credibility The quality of being credible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Critical Thinking Explore ideas and questions for issues that don’t have straight forward answers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Dedicated Devoted to a task or purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Delegation Entrust a task or responsibility to another person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Egotism The quality of being excessively conceited or absorbed in oneself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Empathy To understand and share the feelings of another person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Empowerment Give authority or power to, give strength and confidence to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Engaging Charming and attractive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Enquiry Asking for information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Entrust Assign a responsibility, to put something into someone’s care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Equipping Supply with the items needed for a particular purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>EthicalMorally correct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Excellence The quality of being excellent, an outstanding feature or quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Extra Mile To make an extra effort; to do a particularly good job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Feed forward Modification or control of a process using its anticipated results or effects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Feedback Information given to a person about their performance of a task, used as a basis for improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Foresight Ability to predict, or action of predicting the future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Heads up Advance warning of something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Honesty The quality of being honest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Humility A humble view of one’s own importance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Inclusion The action or state of including or of being included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Independence Not subject to another’s authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Influential Having great influence without direct or overt effort or pressure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Inquisitive Curious or enquiring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Insight Capacity to gain an accurate and deep intuitive understanding of something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Inspiration The process or quality of being inspired, a sudden brilliant or timely idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Intervention Prompted by instinct; Apparently natural or automatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Integrity The quality of having strong moral principles, keep promises &amp; confidences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Interdependence Dependent on each other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Intuition Understand something immediately, without the need for conscious reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Judgement Ability to make considered decisions or form sensible opinions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Leadership ‘voice’ A leader’s method, style, or manner of doing something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Legitimacy Able to be defended with logic or justification, conforming to the law or to rules</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Manipulative Tending to manipulate others cleverly or unscrupulously</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Mentoring An experienced and trusted adviser passing their knowledge and skills onto a person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Mistrust Have no trust in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Networking A group or system of interconnected people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Nurture Rear and encourage the development of a person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Objectivity Not influenced by personal feelings or opinions in considering and representing the facts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Observance Occupies continually or to a troubling extent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Opportunist Takes advantage of opportunities as and when they arise, regardless of planning or principle</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences”
61 Optimism  
Hopefulness and confidence about the future or the success of something

62 Organiser  
Arrange systematically, make arrangements or preparations

63 Orientation  
The direction of someone's interest or attitude

64 Paradigm  
A world view or model of something

65 Passion  
An intense enthusiasm for something

66 Persuasiveness  
Good at persuading someone to do or believe something

67 Power  
A right or authority given or delegated to a person or body

68 Prayer  
A solemn request for help or expression of thanks addressed to God

69 Prioritising  
Designate or treat as most important, determine the relative importance of something

70 Rapport  
Close and harmonious relationship in which there is common understanding

71 Reflection  
Serious thought or consideration, a considered idea

72 Religious affinity  
Religious beliefs

73 Researching  
Systematic investigation into and study of materials and sources to establish facts

74 Resilience  
Able to withstand or recover quickly from difficult conditions

75 Resourceful  
Having the ability to find quick and clever ways to overcome difficulties

76 Respect  
A feeling of deep admiration for someone

77 Rock Bottom  
At the lowest possible level

78 Self awareness  
Conscious knowledge of one's own character, feelings, motives, and desires

79 Self Discipline  
The ability to control one's feelings and overcome one's weaknesses

80 Sense of humour  
The quality of being amusing or comical

81 Sensitivity  
The quality or condition of being sensitive

82 Stewardship  
The careful and responsible management of something entrusted to one's care

83 Successful  
Accomplishing an aim or purpose

84 Synthesiser  
Make by synthesis, combine into a coherent whole

85 Tact  
Adroitness and sensitivity in dealing with others or with difficult issues

86 Teaching  
Impart knowledge to instruct (someone) in how to do something

87 Tenacity  
Not readily relinquishing something, keeping a firm hold

88 Trust  
Firm belief in someone or something, acceptance of the truth of a statement without investigation

89 Trustworthy  
Able to be relied on as honest, truthful, or reliable

90 Verify  
Ensure or demonstrate that something is true, accurate, or justified

91 Visibility  
The state of being able to be seen

92 Vision  
The ability to think about or plan the future with imagination or wisdom

93 Vulnerability  
Exposure to being attached or harmed, either physically or emotionally

---

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences

177
This bar graph in Figure 16 shows which Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) were the most influenced by crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ calling. This data is analysed and interpreted in Chapter Five. This graph was developed by the writer from interview data.

Figure 16. Summary of concepts coded for leadership calling

APPENDIX 3: RESEARCH OBJECTIVE ONE SUMMARY OF CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON LEADERSHIP CALLING
APPENDIX 4: SUMMARY OF MAJOR CRUCIBLE OUTCOMES

Table 17 summarises the major crucibles that were explained in interviews, and how 20 Northland community leaders overcame them. Outcomes are shown in the ‘Crucible (Response)’ column. These results are analysed and interpreted in Chapter Six and were developed by the writer from interview data.

Table 17. Summary of coded crucible categories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Leader</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
<th>Crucible (Stimulus)</th>
<th>Crucible Source Category</th>
<th>Crucible (Response)</th>
<th>Crucible Response Category Codes</th>
<th>Influence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>14AS</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>She learnt to fly and got her Private Pilot</td>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>This helped her to develop self discipline in whatever she attempts.</td>
<td>Self Discipline</td>
<td>0 1 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2CN</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>Belonged to the Air Training Corps for five years, and really enjoyed feeling part of a team.</td>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>Learnt how to organise events, be the lead in activities. This gave self confidence, and a desire for sense of purpose and direction in life, lots of leadership training.</td>
<td>Aplomb</td>
<td>1 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>11TM</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Her association with the Sea Cadets.</td>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>She learnt to organise, be self confident, and communicate well with people.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>0 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>13JT</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>She won the NZ National Windsurfing title in 1993</td>
<td>Competition</td>
<td>Taught her to focus intensely on taking to achieve her objective.</td>
<td>Tenacity</td>
<td>1 1 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1PB</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>Won a competition at the Easter Show.</td>
<td>Competition</td>
<td>Believes his leadership character creates lucky breaks, being in a certain place at a certain time and in a certain group of people doing his leadership calling, whatever that might be, that that attracts energy from other people.</td>
<td>Optimism</td>
<td>0 1 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>11PR</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>She won a trip to New York, sponsored by her employing organisation to attend an international marketing conference.</td>
<td>Competition</td>
<td>Her attendance of the conference generated instant celebrity status within her industry when she returned to NZ, and she was made job offers by prestigious organisations. One of which she accepted, and eventually created opportunities to other highly paid jobs without trying.</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1PB</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>His father died when he was 15.</td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>Went into &quot;denial&quot; for two years, indulged in drugs and alcohol trying to process the meaning of his father’s passing and develop a sense of loss. His initial response to this was to look after his mother by building her a wood shed.</td>
<td>Compassionate</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2CN</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Her Grandfather died when she was studying her Master’s degree and felt she lost the person who was the proudest of her as a person.</td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>Felt a deep sense of loss after her Grandfather’s passing, which made it difficult for her to pass her Master’s degree. However she persevered this to pass her degree and did a course in Hydrology.</td>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>4VC</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>His father died when he was 9.</td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>Sought male company to relate to, and work through his grief, and developed a desire to not be dependent on anyone, and to help people in need.</td>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>5TV</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>The death of a colleague that he was close to.</td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>Made him reflect deeply on the value of his life, and appreciate the people in his life. This affected his leadership in his organisation and required significant leadership effort from him to boost morale and encourage continuing work effectively.</td>
<td>Adaptability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>6TA</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>His younger brother was killed on the farm when a bank gave way underneath the Bulldozer he was driving, and killed him.</td>
<td>Death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>10AM</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>Her father’s death.</td>
<td>Death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>17AK</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>The death of her Mother at age 17 and then leaving home.</td>
<td>Death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>8RM</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>The death of her Mother, Father in Law, and Husband within a close proximity of each other after 5 years of illness.</td>
<td>Death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>2CN</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Suffered really bad depression. So that would definitely be one of the low times. And I think also, not working, so not having that people contact, being stuck at home 7 days a week 24 hours a day was really not me.</td>
<td>Depression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>8RM</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Trained at a Teaching College to establish a career in teaching people.</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>10AM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>She gained higher academic qualifications to progress her career and improve her professional credibility.</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Page No.</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>8RM</td>
<td>225</td>
<td></td>
<td>Was facilitating a workshop with staff and encountered an argumentative person who constantly disagreed with everything she said and was very disruptive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Her colleague tactfully suggested to the difficult person that his needs did not seem to be met and asked how they could help him. His approach diffused the situation sufficient for the person to realise he was being negative, and totally changed his attitude to being positive for the rest of the workshop. This experience showed her the value of exercising tact in difficult situations with people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>10AM</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td>The Ministry of Education requested she fill out a questionnaire about a sex education class she was asked to teach. It was not asking the right questions, and her feedback about was really happening in her classes was ignored. She felt strongly this process was not democratic, wouldn't improve anything, and defeated the purpose of being asked for feedback in the first place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>She reported this situation to the local newspaper, which eventually became front page news in national media. This caused a major witch hunt around the schools that were participating in the sex education classes and led to genuine improvements in the delivery of future courses throughout New Zealand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>18AJ</td>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dissolution of the business partnership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Taught him the value of appreciating people’s differences for what they are, and getting out of his own way. (i.e. being less egotistic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>17AK</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>Her talents were noticed by an HR Manager and she was diverted into working within a HR Team. In sum, she was noticed by the right people, in the right place, at the right time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This led to consolidate her awareness of her calling to help people develop to their full potential. This underpinned her establishing a successful HR Consultancy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>6TA</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>His experience of steering ships whilst serving in the Merchant Navy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Developed a strong desire for taking on responsibility and tackling difficult problems in his later career roles.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>5TV</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Attending to major incidents involving fatalities generated a lot of stress, fatigue and degraded performance at work amongst those who attended the incidents, and couldn't stop psychologically reliving the incident.</td>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Facilitates a system for the team to openly discuss their feelings about their experiences and what they have seen with other team members. This has proven to significantly reduce stress, and help the Firemen to rationalise their experience and get on with their lives in a positive way.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>8RM</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>She experienced significant employment problems.</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Learnt to be sensitive about what is happening in people's environment before asking them to do something that may cause them stress.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>10AM</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>She had a major personal meltdown and hit 'rock bottom' emotionally when she discovered she was managing her interpersonal relationships badly in a workplace that was dysfunctional, and that she disliked intensely.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This motivated her to realise that she had to change her life, her calling, her employer. Five years later, she has totally rebuilt her life and is not only very happy with her personal life and professional role, but optimistic about her future.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>11PR</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>She was made redundant from her job.</td>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Forced her to be resilient and find alternative employment, due to her large mortgage and sending her daughter to a private school.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>5TV</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Fired an employee who was not performing well on the job due to their personal problems interfering with their ability to perform their work responsibilities satisfactorily.</td>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Analysed the situation carefully to determine how he was going to resolve it. Eventually interviewed the person with considerable empathy and found them another job within the same organisation. This resulted in the person resolving his personal problems and performing well in his new job.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>3CT</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Made redundant from his job of 30 years.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Redundancy made him reflect on his calling and go on to understand himself better and realise his calling.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>11PR</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Her husband's adultery ended their marriage.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Made her realise she had to take responsibility for herself and do what it takes to improve her life situation and not give up.</td>
<td>Tenacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>1PB</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>Divorced from his wife.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>His divorce forced upon him the requirement to turn the situation around quickly and become resilient to go on and achieve what one desires.</td>
<td>Adaptability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>14AS</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Her husband divorced her to have a relationship with a younger woman.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Forced her to be more self assured and make judgements quicker. It also triggered a series of positive crucibles.</td>
<td>Resourceful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>17AK</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>She went through marriage difficulties which had a huge impact on her life.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Her marriage difficulties forced her to reflect on personal values and calling. This led to a better marriage and a more fulfilling life.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>7LQ</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>Her custody battle for the legal right to look after her children.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Despite encountering a lot of pressure in court to give up, she persisted and eventually won legal custody of her children.</td>
<td>Tenacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>2CN</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Birth of her son was a major problem, as his health was marginal from day one and took a lot of hard work to make him better.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Staying at home with her child showed her that she needed the company of people around her constantly.</td>
<td>Inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>13JT</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>Going into labour during a conference and giving birth to her son after being rushed to Hospital.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Giving birth to her son whilst attending a conference away from home helped to develop her resilience to adversity.</td>
<td>Resilience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>13JT</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Her adoption at a young age.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Her adoption at a young age developed a yearning for a sense of belonging to someone. Her way of dealing with this was to pass her knowledge and capabilities to other people.</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>18AJ</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>Marriage and the birth of his children.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Taught him the importance of taking responsibility for things that are his responsibility.</td>
<td>Stewardship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>11TM</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>She had a fight with her sister and ran away from home.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>She learnt that her actions will have an impact on the people who are in her life, therefore compelled the lesson to be sensitive about how they will feel about her actions, and be considerate towards them.</td>
<td>Respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>13JT</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Her Grandmother's influence on her early development.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Her Grandmother’s mentoring influenced her tremendously with her outlook on life, independent nature, which made an enormous impression on her and helped to shape her leadership calling.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>14AS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The crucible of her father’s expectations of her being the best she could be.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Empowered her to strive for achieving excellence at whatever she chose to do, from a very young age. This experience triggered the start of a chain of positive crucibles that have presented her with a lot of opportunities in her life.</td>
<td>Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>15SM</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>She had a loving, nurtured, and exciting childhood.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Motivated her to give herself to helping people in her community and making it a better place to live in.</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>16RT</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>His Mother was a very good person and thought good of just about everyone.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>His Mother’s influence has given him a desire to see the goodness in people and help them do better.</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>17AK</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>She was bought up in a loving, supportive family as a child, with a wonderful lifestyle. Her parent's total support and affection helped to develop her Ice Skating competence to a very high level.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>This triggered her calling to help people achieve successfully achieve their goals too.</td>
<td>Benevolence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>3CT</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>His parents encouraged him to play the drums at the age of seven and supported him thereafter.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>Made the most of every opportunity to play the drums, which realised his leadership calling.</td>
<td>Competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>11TM</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>Her wedding.</td>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>This experience helped to exercise her competency in organising activities and people, and help her to realise that her 'calling' is to organise events.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>3CT</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>Having two heart operations when he was seven and fourteen and being hospitalised for a very long time.</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Made him reflect deeply on pursuing his calling, which he went on to achieve successfully.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>4VC</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Nearly died from Mercury poisoning.</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Tenaciously obtained many medical opinions, one of which identified the mercury fillings in his teeth were leaking Mercury into his system. Replaced his fillings with Composite material, which probably saved his life.</td>
<td>Resilience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>19KB</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>Read a book called 'Wearing the colour Purple' about an old lady diagnosed with Cancer who decided not to have treatment.</td>
<td>Inspiration</td>
<td>Inspired here to have a more optimistic outlook on living and strongly influenced her to be more adventurous.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>9HW</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>She was deeply moved by reading a book about an Irish woman, Christine Noble; who set up a foundation to run an orphanage in Vietnam, Ho Chi Minh city. This book connected her with her life's calling and inspired her to apply for the NZ$5,000 Kauri Award Scholarship, which she put all of her effort into.</td>
<td>Inspiration</td>
<td>She won the scholarship to go to Vietnam and work with disadvantaged children there for 3 months, which was her dream and calling realised.</td>
<td>Courageous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>9HW</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>A trusted family friend abused her trust.</td>
<td>Mistrust</td>
<td>Generated an initial feeling of mistrust; however this was eventually transformed into motivation to improve herself and achieve her goals. She also learnt from this crucible that she has to believe in herself, to strive hard for things that are important to her.</td>
<td>Optimism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td><strong>8RM</strong></td>
<td>217</td>
<td>When she visited a small rural school in Fiji, she saw the local people attempting to develop a strategic plan when they didn't know what one was.</td>
<td>Overseas Experience</td>
<td>This showed her how people in countries with meagre resources and education can achieve satisfactory results. This made her realise how well off people are in New Zealand, and it upset her to reflect how people in New Zealand seem to take a lot for granted with all their resources and education.</td>
<td><strong>Humility</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td><strong>9HW</strong></td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Experienced a Rotary Exchange visit to Australia and lived with a family there for 3 months.</td>
<td>Overseas Experience</td>
<td>Developed her awareness about how to relate to different people and this knowledge has helped her to empathise with the parents of children she looks after in the Kindergarten. This has also helped develop her tact in dealing with people.</td>
<td><strong>Tact</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td><strong>20MB</strong></td>
<td>98</td>
<td>When he was a child, he travelled on a cruise ship from New Zealand to Britain and back.</td>
<td>Overseas Experience</td>
<td>Introduced him to a wide variety of experiences, and from this he developed a sense of independence that influenced his adult life.</td>
<td><strong>Independence</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td><strong>11PR</strong></td>
<td>79</td>
<td>She stood for the Mayoralty of Kaipara District.</td>
<td>Politics</td>
<td>Triggered her realisation that she was not suited to political work, and would be better off doing work that was more in line with her values and skills. She went on to find work like this.</td>
<td><strong>Orientation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td><strong>1PB</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Discovered his affinity with the Bahai faith when his Manager read a Bahai prayer to him.</td>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>An epiphany that showed him the ‘big picture’ of life. From this crucible he has subsequently learnt the importance of trusting his instincts.</td>
<td><strong>Instinctive</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td><strong>8RM</strong></td>
<td>98</td>
<td>Religion strongly influenced her development during her childhood.</td>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>Her religious beliefs gave her the strength to emotionally cope with the difficult crucibles in her life.</td>
<td><strong>Tenacity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>6TA</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>His ability to command Fire Service resources during the Northland floods.</td>
<td>Storm Damage</td>
<td>Showed him the importance of visibility in controlling an incident, not only to his staff, but external organisations, as the senior representative of the Fire Service.</td>
<td>Organiser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>8RM</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>Extensive storm damage done to the family Bach.</td>
<td>Storm Damage</td>
<td>Felt helpless about how to resolve this huge problem, which was a very humbling experience for her and taught her humility.</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>16RT</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>He was overworked in his job and burning out without realising it, going through a marriage breakup, going blind in his left eye, and his mother was dying of cancer. All happening concurrently.</td>
<td>Stress</td>
<td>He has learnt that he should have communicated his problems to someone, for advice about how to handle the stress of all these crucibles happening at once.</td>
<td>Communicating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>5TV</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Having been brought up in the country, he found living in a large city to be an unacceptable environment to bring his children up in.</td>
<td>Urban Living</td>
<td>Made him and his wife realise while they were living in an urban environment, they would prefer to raise their children in a rural environment. Consequently they relocated from the city to a rural environment to raise children.</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals /125: 34 59 32
% 27 47 26
Figure 17. Summary of crucible incidents

Figure 17 shows 20 Northland community leaders mostly experienced crucible issues relating to Family Relationships, Job, Death, and 13 Other minor categories. This information was developed by the writer from interview data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Crucible Source Summary</th>
<th>Incidents</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overseas experience</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspiration</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storm damage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mistrust</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Politics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stress</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban living</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td><strong>61</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 18. Summary of crucible responses

Figure 18 shows crucibles mostly influenced 20 Northland Community leaders with the coded leadership concepts of orientation, benevolence, tenacity, competence, and resilience. This information was developed by the writer from interview data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Incidents</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenacity</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organiser</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tact</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimism</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapatability</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courageous</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aplomb</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instinctive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenacity</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-discipline</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compassionate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resourceful</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stewardship</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humility</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 125 100%

Crucible influences on leadership: Reflections on Northland community Leaders’ “Surthrival” Experiences"
APPENDIX 5: RESEARCH OBJECTIVE TWO SUMMARY OF CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON LEADERSHIP CHARACTER

Figure 19 shows the array of which Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) were the most influenced by crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ character. This data is interpreted and summarised in Chapter Five. This graph was developed by the writer from interview data.

Figure 19. Summary of concepts coded for leadership character
Figure 20 shows the array of which Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) were the most influenced by crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ competence. This data is interpreted and summarised in Chapter Five. This graph was developed by the writer from interview data.

Figure 20. Summary of concepts coded for leadership competence
APPENDIX 7: SUMMARY OF ALL CRUCIBLE INFLUENCES ON LEADERSHIP CAPABILITY FROM ALL RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

Figure 21 shows the array of which Leadership Concept Codes (Appendix 2) were the most influenced the most overall by crucibles on 20 Northland community leaders’ calling, character, and competence. This data is analysed and interpreted in Chapter Five. This graph was developed by the writer from interview data.

Figure 21. Summary of concepts coded for leadership capability